

# THE HYMN SOCIETY

## OF GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND

### BULLETIN

### 93

### VOLUME FIVE

NUMBER FIVE.

AUTUMN, 1961.

*Editor* : REV. ERIK R. ROUTLEY, B.D., M.A., D.Phil.,  
29 Mayfield Terrace, Edinburgh 9.

*Hon. Secretary* : THE REV. A. S. HOLBROOK,  
12 St. John's Road, Knutsford, Cheshire.

*Hon. Treasurer* : THE REV. D. S. GOODALL, M.A.,  
Mansfield College, Oxford.

#### CONTENTS

Editorial	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	65
Musicians of the Temple Church	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	67
'To the Chief Musician, upon——?'	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	71
Dohnavur	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	75
'The Rich Man in his Castle', by Maurice Frost	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	76

#### EDITORIAL.

The Editor apologises to his readers for a Bulletin so large a proportion of which comes from the editorial pen, and so much of which is devoted to the music rather than to the words of hymns. This is how things have turned out this quarter: and those who are most vexed by these things will no doubt be the first to contribute material to the next issue!

We would draw our readers' attention here to a book and some records which we would especially commend. We have been much moved—and indeed moved to penitence for hasty judgments—by Charles Cleall's *Sixty Songs from Sankey* (Marshall, Morgan and Scott, 10s.6d.), in which hymn tunes from Sankey's hymn book (only a few of which are actually by Sankey) have been reharmonized for choral singing. The book is important not only for the remarkable musical *tour-de-force* which it represents, but for a preface which talks theology as well as music, and is a minor classic

of spiritual letters. Our members must not on any account regard this as a companion to the *Billy Graham Song Book*; rather, they must judge whether it is not worth comparison with what Geoffrey Beaumont has attempted in his *Folk Mass*, and what has also been attempted in that very remarkable television Passion Play, *A Man Died*.

Associated with this collection is a LP record entitled *Songs from Sankey*, made by Mr. Cleall and his choir, and published as ILP 500 at 34s.6d. by Marshall, Morgan and Scott.

A series of records of hymn-singing from Germany is being issued on the *Cantate* label (*Cantate* is the church music section of Telefunken, and *Cantate* records are distributed in England by Novello and Co.). Some of these are of great interest in showing how varied treatment of the verses, or accompaniment by wind instruments, can illuminate well-known chorales. We would especially mention the following:

TN 72013. 'Nun bitten wir' and 'Heil'ger Geist'. (The second is the tune at EH 76, original version, set to the German translation of *Veni sancte Spiritus*.)

TF 72074. Hymns sung at Vespers in Bethel: 'Vom Himmel hoch' (EH 56) and 'Fröhlich soll mein Herze springen' (CP 81 = SP 89).

TF 71885. 'In dulci jubilo' and 'Josef lieber' (EH 612).

TF 72067. A series of carols from Hungary, Poland, Britain ('O little town' sung in German to FOREST GREEN), Italy, Russia and France.

TN 71658. 'Gott des Himmels' (SP 32 = CP 589), 'All morgen ist ganz frisch und neu' and 'Die helle Sonn leucht jetzt herfür'.

TF 72090. 'Gelobt sei Gott' (CP 149), 'Zu dieser osterlichen Zeit', 'Wir wollen alle frohlich sein' and 'Auf, auf, mein Herz'.

TN 72012. 'Lobe den Herren' (EH 536) and 'Sei Lob und Ehr'.

TF 72062. 'Du meine Seele singe' and 'Lobe den Herren' (EH 536), both set for male voices.

TF 72077. 'Herr Christ, der einig Gotts Sohn', 'Ach bleib bei uns' (SP 42) and 'Such wer da will'.

TF 72011. 'Nun lasst uns Gott dem Herren' (EH 126), and 'Herr Jesu Christ' (EH 173).

TN 72068. 'Ein feste Burg' (EH 362) and 'Lobt Got getrost mit Singen' set for brass instruments in varying arrangements, without voices.

TF 71688. 'Jesu meine Freude', similarly set for brass instruments.

In almost all cases the different verses of the hymns are set to different harmonizations in 3, 4 or 5 parts, by composers of the 17th and 20th centuries.

Records indexed TF cost 15s.11d., those indexed TN, 11s.3d.; all are 45 rpm 7-inch discs.

The liveliness of the choral singing and the vitality of the arrangements may well prove suggestive to those who wish to interest their choirs in the possibility of hymn-singing.

## MUSICIANS OF THE TEMPLE CHURCH

Members of the Society will be especially interested in a sumptuous book recently published by the Templars' Union, London, and entitled *A Spiritual Song*, by David Lewer (504 pp., 42s.). It is a very full account of the music of the Temple Church during the three 'reigns' of E. J. Hopkins, Walford Davies and George Thalben-Ball, preceded by an historical account of the Templars from their medieval foundation. The book is beautifully produced, and has several illustrations and music examples. The character-sketches of the leading musicians, and also of the Masters of the Temple during the period it is chiefly concerned with, add to the pleasures of reading it, and it is full of out-of-the-way information. It would make a magnificent present for any well-informed organist or parson.

The appearance of the book gives us an opportunity of making some observations about the close connection between the Temple Church and the development of English hymnody. It was, of course, the celebrated recordings of the Temple Choir, including the historic 'Hear my Prayer,' made in 1928, that made Englishmen realise for the first time what a force the Temple was in maintaining the tradition of English church music. But behind the scenes the work had been going on for a long time by then, and perhaps nowhere more fruitfully than in the field of hymnody.

E. J. Hopkins (1818-1901) reigned at the Temple from 1843 to 1898, and became one of the foremost of 19th-century English hymn tune composers, and one of the most sought-after of editors. He is, like Dykes on a smaller scale, a composer who is still almost indispensable to modern books, despite the anti-Victorian reaction. It is only *Songs of Praise* that excludes his name entirely from its index. EH has two of his tunes, ST. RAPHAEL (75), and ELLERS in the Appendix. BBC has ST. HUGH (344) and a tune of his which appears in no other contemporary book, WRAYSBURY (354). AMR has four—EPIPHANY HYMN (75), ST. RAPHAEL (321), ST. HUGH (317) and ELLERS (31). Its standard edition was more generous, giving eight tunes, adding to those just mentioned SHROPSHIRE (141), CHILDREN'S VOICES (336), NUKAPU (426), CULFORD (454) and SACRAMENT (714), and omitting (very properly) EPIPHANY HYMN. CP reduces him to five tunes, but includes ST. BRANNOCK (37), SUNNYSIDE (275) and ARTAVIA (109) in its selection. Among the *Church Hymnary's* eight are CHRISTMAS MORN (363), TEMPLE (293) and WILDERSMOUTH (573); and the selection of six in *MHB* includes nothing that has not been noted already.

Hopkins comes out of this as a composer of mediocre gifts. He falls short of Dykes's faculty for writing what some may criticize but what none dare ignore. He never quite achieves the vulgar friendliness of Stainer's LOVE DIVINE, and he certainly never approaches the true Victorian greatness of Steggall's CHRISTCHURCH or Smart's REGENT SQUARE. His most sung tunes are, we may suppose, ST. HUGH and ELLERS, and of these ST. HUGH is certainly the better; it has a pleasing melodic shape, and probably its detractors chiefly would execrate it for the harmony at the join of lines 3 and 4; it is certainly a pity that he wrote his bass in similar instead of contrary motion. ELLERS is one of those tunes which inevitably make what Michael Flanders adequately calls a 'jolly pleasing noise', but which in performance sound unconvincing: its long second line rising to the high note produces terrible flatness and shortness of breath. If, as some commentators say, Hopkins thought this tune was in the mixo-lydian mode, he has doubtless learnt better now among the communion of musical saints.

Hopkins never, we can say, wrote a great tune. He did not even write a great anglican chant. But he was an indefatigable editor. He was responsible for two editions of the *Temple Hymn Book* (2nd, 1880); but outside his immediate field he seems to have been much in demand. He is mentioned as having advised Chope in the 2nd (1863) edition of his *Congregational Hymn and Tune Book*. He advised the compilers of the 1877 edition of *Wesley's Hymns*. Presbyterian editors called him in for the music of the *Scottish Free Church Hymn Book with Tunes* (1882), of *Church Praise* (1885) for the Presbyterian Church of England, and of the first edition of the *Hymnal* of the Presbyterian Church in Canada. He was also music editor of the *Congregational Church Hymnal* (1887), which was the first official hymn book of that denomination (as was the 1877 *Wesleyan*) to allocate proper tunes to hymns. He has, in addition, the doubtful distinction of having edited the first edition of the *Cathedral Psalter*.

It was inevitable that these books, and the anthem books which he also edited, should contain a good deal of his own work. But clearly the verdict must be that, great teacher though he was, the values expressed in his compositions, and in his implied judgments on the work of others, have proved transitory.

When we come to Walford Davies (1869-1941) we are on much more debatable ground. Where Hopkins built up his reputation purely as an organist, choirmaster and editor, Walford Davies is now remembered chiefly for the astonishing way in which he met the new opportunities presented by broadcasting. His tenure of office at the Temple lasted from 1898 to 1921, but it was during his last twenty years, while he was successively Professor of Music at the University of Wales, organist at St. George's, Windsor, and Master of the King's Musick, that he rose to nation-wide fame.

Walford Davies's highest service to hymnody was in the promotion of hymn-singing, the extending of the repertory, and the arousing of interest in the music of hymns. Many will still recall a long series of broadcast talks entitled 'Melodies of Christendom' which he devised, and in which, although all kinds of church music were sung, hymns were the chief feature. His own work in hymn writing began with a few tunes printed in Garrett Horder's *Worship Song* (1905). Of these only CHRISTMAS CAROL lived long, but that is now part of the national heritage.

(We may here interpolate the information that *Worship Song*, which has now passed out of common use, was a collection whose music marked a new low record in general taste, even for its age, but which none the less contains two otherwise unknown tunes of Walford Davies, one by Sir Donald Tovey, and one by Harold Darke, who cannot have been more than 17 at the time of the book's publication.)

During the first World War Walford Davies produced a small collection called *In Hoc Signo*, in which several tunes appeared that found wider currency: the most famous is VISION, to 'Mine eyes have seen the glory'. But by that time (1915) his work had found a place in *EH*, which contains TEMPLE for 'O King enthroned on high' at No. 454. Of later books which showed him special respect the 1916 Second Supplement of *A & M* and the *Church Hymnary* may especially be mentioned. *SP* did not care for him: Martin Shaw was a somewhat sour critic of the music at the Temple, and *SP* contains only CHRISTMAS CAROL.

Walford Davies's music is (as I have elsewhere ventured to say) greatly concerned—it is hardly too much to say that it is obsessed—with the beauty of sound, at the expense of the integrity of reason. Frequently he divides his four parts into six or even more. He loved to find a tiny suggestive phrase, and write a tune that would embody it, whether or not the rest of the tune had any interest at all. He loved above all things the rising sixth in a melody. He loved intricate and unexpected harmony. The best epitome of his work in hymnody is *A Students' Hymnal* (1923), a book of Welsh and English hymns, whose English section was separately published as *Hymns of the Kingdom*. It was characteristic of him that his special teaching gifts should involve him in several 'collaborated' tunes, which in that book were superscribed 'University of Wales', and in which several students worked with him. But every one of them is clearly inspired by Walford Davies's special genius for finding beautiful phrases and sounds, and very few of them can be said to be of lasting value.

Where Hopkins had been a tolerable journeyman composer, Walford Davies was, as a composer, an undisciplined genius; where Hopkins was always cautious, Walford Davies tended always to exaggeration and over-writing. Hopkins could be trivial, but

Walford Davies at his weakest leant rather to pretentiousness. There can be little doubt that Walford Davies saw ten times as far in music as Hopkins did, even if Hopkins remains usually more singable and approachable.

In 1921 the succession was handed on to G. T. Thalben-Ball, who has held the office of organist to the Temple now for forty years. To this he has added the appointment of organist to the BBC, and he has achieved international distinction as an organist. His own contribution to hymnody is chiefly to be seen, of course, in the *BBC Hymn Book* (1951); but it was 25 years earlier that he edited the music of an experimental and very interesting hymn book published for young people by the Congregational Union and called *School Worship* (1926). Like every other book of its time, *School Worship* was unable to ignore the effect of *EH*, but it undoubtedly took a line of its own both in words and in music, and Thalben-Ball rose to the occasion with zest. He was, at the time, not so very much older than the eldest of those for whom the book was being compiled.

His own tunes in this book number (I suppose) eighteen. Five of them are marked 'Anonymous', but the style of them all is unmistakable—Walford Davies with a touch of youthful austerity. From Walford Davies they derive a rhythmical flexibility which proves very useful in two or three cases for odd metres. That at No. 130, reproduced at *CP* 591, and set to 'Come, my soul, thou must be waking', is particularly charming. Various accidents conspired to keep this book more obscure than it ought to have been. It came from a denomination which nine years before had produced the most malignantly undistinguished denominational hymn book then in print. Its musical editor had not yet come to that fame which the Temple choir's records gave him only a year or two later. And it was overshadowed by the first edition of *SP*. But even now it is a book which editors ought never to overlook, and it owes its distinction largely to the remarkable work of Thalben-Ball, who in his own compositions and in the collocations of hymn and tune which he tried out in it (to say nothing of his Walford-like harmonies to some well-known tunes) did very well what few of his time were doing better.

His tunes in *BBC* are too readily accessible to need much comment here. Of that remarkable triumvirate upon whom the musical editing of that book chiefly fell—a trio strangely diverse and complementary in gifts—Thalben-Ball stood for the Temple choir tradition (while in the others we had the school and the parish). Dr. Stanton will always live in hymnody as the arch-exponent of the truculent and uncompromising idiom, and Cyril Taylor no less surely as the purveyor of good honest tunes of which Parry would not have been ashamed. Thalben-Ball remained to continue the work of Walford Davies; and to say this is not to say that Thalben-

Ball had nothing to add to Walford. It is surely not too much to say that in Walford Davies even at his best there is a touch of effeminacy; and that he could never have produced so strictly virile and closely-reasoned a piece of music as Thalben-Ball's *ARTHOG* ('Angel voices'). In earlier days—yes, Dr. Thalben-Ball's tunes could sound at times like an echo, or even a caricature, of Walford Davies. But the evidence of *BBC* would refute that description of his music as a whole.

Now this succession of musicians—Hopkins, Walford Davies, Thalben-Ball—can be shown to have influenced hymnody quite decisively, but in ways which are somewhat off what the Martin Shaw and Vaughan Williams school has made the beaten track. Hopkins's work is now over. Walford Davies's best work was in making people sing, in cajoling them and tempting them and almost seducing them by sheer beauty of voice and melody away from their inborn conviction that they had no music in them. Dr. Thalben-Ball's influence has been chiefly perhaps in interpretation. His tunes are likely to be winnowed fairly quickly to a few popular ones, the rest going the way of Walford's: this not necessarily through posterity's good judgment, but rather through its rude and inarticulate judgment of what it can sing. But after—what?—more than thirty years of the BBC singers, who can be excused for thinking that hymns mean nothing, and that one is much the same as another? Of the millions who have been able to hear, through broadcasting, Dr. Thalben-Ball's accompaniments to hymns (and one remembers especially the days of the Second World War, when so many studio-services had to be improvised in odd places), too few will have noticed what artistry in accompaniment was being offered to them, and what dramatic joy there is in the words of hymns interpreted by music. But surely many must have seen this, and therefore, if hymn singing is to-day a much less uncomely thing than it was at the beginning of the century (and surely we can without complacency claim that), the debt we owe to the musicians of the Temple is immense. The Hymn Society ought to be aware of it and admit it; and a very good way of admitting it would be buying the book called *A Spiritual Song*.

#### 'TO THE CHIEF MUSICIAN, UPON—?'

So run those cryptic directions which scholars assert (with due caution) are musical directions for the Psalms. The Psalmists had their editors, and these editors seem to have now and again given guidance of this sort; but one wonders whether the synagogue experienced such a strange uncertainty as we ourselves know when it comes to the tune to a well-known hymn. Did they have half a dozen different tunes to Psalm 23?

Probably not. But for the edification of readers we here supply evidence of the difficulties editors have found in setting three well-

known English hymns. It is not always so, although a century and a half ago it was probably anybody's guess what tune would be sung where to what words. Since the advent of the 'proper-tune' hymn book, of which (as we have often said) *A & M* itself is the most eminent historic example, many hymns have received their 'proper tune', and the marriages have prospered. There may be divergencies; there are often bigamies or trigamies (will that word do?); but on the whole we know where we are with 'Lead us, heavenly Father', and 'Our God, our help in ages past' and 'The head that once was crowned with thorns'. Perhaps 'Jesu, lover of my soul' is the best example of a bigamy nowadays, and 'Praise to the Holiest' of a—well, of a three-way accommodation.

But consider the three following, which beat anything Hollywood can offer.

These lists claim no exhaustiveness, and of course a collocation in one book is often repeated in several others. This simply shows what can happen to hymns of special lyric quality.

*Brightest and best of the sons of the morning* (Heber, 1827).

In the leading hymn books in English use, the situation is as follows:

*EH* (1906, 1933) has (1) LIEBSTER IMMANUEL and in the Appendix (2) EPIPHANY HYMN, by G. Thrupp (41). The same two are in *CP* (1951) (94).

*A & M* (Standard, with second Supplement, 1916) has (3) EPIPHANY (eight lines) by S. S. Wesley (643).

*A & M* (Revised, 1950) has (4) BEDE, arranged by Goss from a secular source, and (5) EPIPHANY, by E. J. Hopkins (75).

*SP* (1925, 1931) has (6) LIME STREET, by Geoffrey Shaw (85).

*BBC* (1951) has (7) JESMIAN, by G. Thalben-Ball, and (8) READY TOKEN, by W. K. Stanton (63).

*MHB* (1933) has (9) SPEAN, by F. Bridge (122).

The *Church Hymnary* (1927) has (10) SPRINGFIELD, by Gauntlett, as well as (1) and (2) above (64).

The *Irish Church Hymnal* (1960) follows its predecessors in giving (11) Dykes's ST. NINIAN (79).

American books contribute the following:

The *Hymnal* (1940) of the Episcopal Church: (12) STEWART, by A. J. Strohm (46).

The *Hymnbook* of the Presbyterian and associated churches (1955): (13) MORNING STAR, by J. P. Harding (175); this is in several other American books.

The *Oxford American Hymn Book* (1930), among its eight different tunes, has (14) PRAISE, JERUSALEM, from a Muhlhausen ms. dated 1733 (338).

The *Hymnary* of the United Church of Canada, and the *Hymnal* of the Episcopal Church of Canada (1930, 1938), both contain (15) STELLA ORIENTIS, by Healey Willan (49, 356).

Other books provide these:

*Christian Praise* (1957): (16) FORT WILLIAM, by Kenneth Finlay (43).

The *Church Hymnal for the Christian Year* (1917): (17) BRADFIELD, by C. E. Miller, and (18) SUTTON VALENCE, by L. R. Pearce (141).

*A Students' Hymnal* (1923): (19) WALLOG, no doubt by Walford Davies (23).

The *New Office Hymn Book* (1908): (20) BRIGHTEST AND BEST, ascribed to 'Mehul', and stated to be from the Children's Service Book, 1864 (378).

The *Public School Hymn Book* (1903): (21) MILDENHALL, by W. S. Bambridge (53).

The *Hymnal Companion* (1903): (22) EPIPHANY, by Mendelssohn (an arrangement of the E major Song without Words) and (23) ST. ETHELDREDA, by H. E. Millar.

The *Irish Church Hymnal* (1897 edition): (24) EASTWELL, by H. S. Oakeley (101).

The *Psalmist* (1881): (25) EPIPHANY, by Gauntlett (not the same as (10) above (543)).

The *Church Psalter and Hymn Book* (Mercer, 1858): (26) HOLSTEIN, ascribed to 'Romberg' (45).

Second, let us consider

'Lead, kindly Light' (Newman, 1836). This is a hymn which did not at first commend itself so universally as did Heber's. But we can without difficulty muster the following:

(1) LUX BENIGNA, by J. B. Dykes (*EH* 425, and elsewhere).

(2) SANDON, by C. H. Purday (*AMS* 266, and elsewhere).

(3) PATMOS, by S. S. Wesley (*Church Hymnary* 568).

(4) BONIFACIO, by David Evans (*ib*).

(5) ALBERTA, by W. H. Harris (*SP* 554, and elsewhere).

(6) GORRAN, by R. Dussek (*SP Appendix ii*).

(7) LUX IN TENEBRIS, by Dom Gregory Murray (*Westminster Hymnal*, 1914, 191).

(8) LUX BEATA, by A. L. Peace (*Church Hymnal for the Christian Year*, 509).

(9) YATTENDON NO. 11, by H. E. Wooldridge (*OH* 236).

(10) LEAD, KINDLY LIGHT, anonymous (F minor) (*New Office Hymn Book*, 754).

(11) GUNDULF, by B. Luard Selby (*A & M*, 1904, 482).

(12) CHORALE, an arrangement, presumably by John Farmer, of a German tune (*Hymns and Chorales*, 1892, 105).

(13) LEAD, KINDLY LIGHT, by J. Barnby (*Collected Hymn Tunes*, 1901, 200).

(14) MORLEY, by H. L. Morley (*Bristol Tune Book*, 1886, 619).

(15) an unnamed and unascribed tune in F major in *Arundel Hymns* (1902), 296.

- (16) LUX IN TENEBRIS, by A. S. Sullivan (*Church Hymns*, 1874, 455).  
But we suggest that the most impressive list of all is that of tunes associated with one of the best-known of all hymns—

'Love divine, all loves excelling' (C. Wesley, 1741).

Here it is impossible to discover what was sung to it in the 18th century. But books published during the last 100 years or so give the following:

- (1) LOVE DIVINE, by J. Stainer (*AMR* 205, etc.).
- (2) AIREDALE, by C. V. Stanford (*ib*).
- (3) MORIAH, Welsh tune (*EH* 437, etc.).
- (4) HYFRYDOL, by R. H. Pritchard (*Church Hymnary* 479, etc.).
- (5) ABBOTS LEIGH, by C. V. Taylor (*Christian Praise*, 335).
- (6) ADORATION, by J. E. Hunt (*ib*).
- (7) BETHANY, by H. Smart (*CP* 179, etc.).
- (8) BITHYNIA, by S. Webbe (8-line version of TANTUM ERGO, *EH* 63) (*MHB* 431, etc.).
- (9) LOVE DIVINE (= BEECHER), by J. Zundel (*MHB* 431 and several American books).
- (10) FORMOSA (= FALFIELD), by A. S. Sullivan (*Church Hymnal for the Christian Year*, 508).
- (11) CROSS OF JESUS, by J. Stainer, from *The Crucifixion* (*ib*).
- (12) EBENEZER, by T. J. Williams (*Harrow School Hymn Book* 199).
- (13) HALTON HOLGATE, by W. Boyce (*OH* 148).
- (14) CHICHESTER, by S. S. Wesley (*ib*).
- (15) BLAENWERN, Welsh tune (*Irish Church Hymnal*, 1960, 590).
- (16) FREIBURG, of German origin, stated to be from the *Church Hymnal* of 1864 (Irish), in *Irish Church Hymnal*, 1917 ed., 555.
- (17) SHIPSTON, English Traditional tune (*Public School Hymn Book*, 1919, 347).
- (18) FABEN, by J. H. Willcox (*Primitive Methodist Hymn Book*, 1889, 385).
- (19) LOVE DIVINE, by J. F. LeJeune (many American books, including the *Lutheran Song and Service Book*, 1958, 397).
- (20) O DU LIEBER MEINE SEELE, German chorale (*Oxford American Hymn Book*, 166).
- (21) LIEBLICH, DUNKEL, SENFT UND STILLE, J. Walther †1820 (*ib*).
- (22) BATTY (as *EH* 105) (*New College Hymn Book*, 1900, 138).
- (23) LUX EOI, by A. S. Sullivan (*Congregational Psalmist*, 1886, 87).
- (24) CHARITAS, by H. J. Gauntlett (*Chants, Anthems and Hymns*, ed. Prout 1881, 493).
- (25) MANNHEIM (as *EH* 426 with 1st phrase repeated) (*Hymnal Companion*, 1877, 295).
- (26) ST. HILARY, from Kocher's *Zions Harfe* (*Psalms and Hymns*, Turle, 1867, 12).
- (27) ST. JOHN'S (= ST. THOMAS, *EH* 623, with 1st phrase repeated) (*Church Psalter and Hymn Book*, Mercer, 1858, 16).
- (28) ST. JOSEPH, by E. J. Hopkins (*Collected tunes*, 1901, 147).

- (29) FAIREST ISLE, by H. Purcell (*Methodist School Hymn Book*, 1950, 253: said to be the melody which originally inspired the words).

No doubt readers could add to these lists, but they are confined to published collocations. May we be delivered from standardization of any sort! It seems we stand in little danger so far as these three are concerned.

## DOHNAVUR

*Wings*. A Book of Dohnavur Songs, with Music. The Music edited by Peggy Spencer-Palmer, Mus.Bac. S.P.C.K., 1960, 128 pp., 10s.6d.

Dohnavur is a village in Madras State, only 32 miles from the southern tip of India. Here is the headquarters of a movement begun more than fifty years ago by Amy Carmichael (d. 1951) for the rescue of Indian children from the dangers and immoralities associated with certain kinds of heathen worship. At the time when the work began, Miss Carmichael (who began as an itinerant evangelist) saw the special need of children who were liable to be adopted at an early age by people who would later sell them for purposes which were then legal, though now they are outlawed.

From this grew up a fellowship of workers who care for children, nursing the sick, helping the retarded, and educating those who otherwise would have fallen into all manner of trouble. All the work is voluntary. No appeals are made. The London office of the Dohnavur Fellowship (which is interdenominational) are at 33 Church Road, S.W.19, and the Indian address is The Dohnavur Fellowship, Dohnavur, Tirunelveli District, S. India.

*Wings* is the title of the book of songs which this Fellowship has published. The words are all anonymous, but they may be supposed to be substantially the work of Miss Carmichael, who signed the author's note at the beginning. The words have therefore nothing in common with the 'standard' hymn books. They generally strike an evangelical note, taking their images from nature rather than from dogma, and the music is of the free-flowing kind primarily designed for light unison singing. Some tunes from standard sources appear, like Ouseley's CONTEMPLATION, STRACATHRO, and LASST UNS ERFREUEN; but most of the tunes are peculiar to the book, and the composers most represented are the Rev. K. S. Procter, E. H. Fewkes, and Miss Spencer-Palmer. Those who know Miss Spencer-Palmer's work in *CP* will not be surprised to find in her contribution to this book a rich and melodious idiom, supremely singable, and always informed by reason. The other composers write well, too; indeed, there are many tunes here which ought to come under the eye of future editors. The danger is of over-richness in both words and music, and the unvaried use of this

book might leave a singer pining for DUNFERMLINE or TALLIS'S ORDINAL; but the standard is kept remarkably high, and tune after tune arouses more than a passing interest. It is a book which, being undoubtedly 'out of the way', and yet not disdaining at any point high musical culture, we would warmly recommend to our readers; and with it, the work of the Dohnavur Fellowship.

### 'THE RICH MAN IN HIS CASTLE'

The rich man in his castle,  
The poor man at his gate,  
God made them, high or lowly,  
And ordered their estate.

So does the offending verse read in H. J. Gauntlett's musical edition of Mrs. Alexander's *Hymns for Little Children*. I have not a copy of the first edition of 1848, but I think we can assume that Mrs. Alexander approved the text of 1877. So please note the punctuation, and the wording: 'high or lowly', and 'ordered'.

The Church Catechism has suffered from a somewhat similar misrepresentation by having the words 'do my duty in that state of life, unto which it shall please God to call me' interpreted as if they were 'do my duty in that state of life unto which it *hath pleased* God to call me'. I have very little doubt that Mrs. Alexander was perfectly familiar with the parable of Dives and Lazarus, and if asked would have suggested that the parable of the talents had more bearing on this verse of her hymn. The hymn does not say that God made one high and the other lowly, but that both alike are his creation, whether rich or poor. Possibly 'And ordered their estate' suggests to modern ears predestination of the individual to poverty or wealth, but surely Mrs. Alexander was a better theologian than her critics, and had in mind the language of Catechism and Book of Common Prayer: that whether a man be rich or poor that, for the time being, was the estate to which God was calling him, and wherein he would find duties to God and his fellow men. The servants in the parable were given varying amounts, but the final reward was the same for all.

Anyhow, why should the great undifferentiated middle class be treated as if they alone are God's creation?

MAURICE FROST.

[*The Society expresses to Dr. Frost its joy at the news of his recovery from a serious operation. May he soon be fully restored to health!*—Editor.]