THE HYMN SOCIETY
OF GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND
BULLETIN
VOLUME FIVE

Number Twelve. Spring, 1964.

Editor: Rev. Erik R. Routley, B.D., M.A., D.Phil.,
29 Mayfield Terrace, Edinburgh 9.

Hon. Secretary: The Rev. A. S. Holbrook,
85 Lord Haddon Road, Ilkeston, Derbyshire.

Hon. Treasurer: The Rev. D. S. Goodall, M.A.,
Mansfield College, Oxford.

CONTENTS

Editorial: The First Hundred ... ... ... ... 193
The Impact of Hymns Ancient and Modern upon English Hymnody, by L. H. Bunn ... ... ... ... 198
What Shall they Sing? by J. T. Slater ... ... ... 205
Canon Noel Boston’s Collection ... ... ... ... 210
Reviews ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ... 215

THE FIRST HUNDRED

Since the foundation of our Society in 1936 we have managed to struggle through the publication of a hundred editions of the Bulletin. Ours has always been a modest and retiring sort of journal: neither large in size nor particularly popular in content. Being dependent on the subscriptions of those who continue to support it, it has managed to continue in being for a quarter of a century, and to live a life sheltered from the storms of commercial journalism. We have in a hundred issues carried only one advertisement. We have increased our subscription rate by a staggering percentage—the first issues of the Bulletin cost 2s.6d. a year—but our readers have been faithful and patient, and where in the natural order our members have been taken from us, others have taken
their places. An insect is less troubled by the east wind, I suppose, than a large bird, and we are in the insect class. We have not even altered our size of page or our format—apart from following the lead of the more exalted newspapers in getting rid of gothic type in our title heading.

On October 6th, 1936, the official list of Vice-Presidents contained the names of Canon V. F. Storr, the Archdeacon of Northumberland, the Master of the Temple (Canon Harold Anson), the Dean of St. Patrick's, Dublin (the Very Reverend D. F. R. Wilson), Sir Walford Davies, the Reverend A. S. Gregory, the Reverend Dr. H. Elvet Lewis, the Reverend Alexander Macmillan, and the Reverend Dr Albert Peel. The Secretaries were the Reverend C. Currie Martin and the Reverend F. Sanderson. The Chairmen were Canon Briggs and the Reverend J. R. Fleming. The President was the Archbishop of York (then Dr. Temple).

By the end of May, 1937, the subscription list contained 124 names. Of those still eminent in the Society Mr. Bunn and Mr. Tulpady are in that first list: and among those whose work is now done are Carey Bonner, Maurice Frost, F. J. Gillman, Nichol Grieve, and Sir Richard Terry. By November, 1937, it was possible to publish a supplementary list of 25 new members who included Sydney Nicholson, C. S. Phillips, W. J. Little and John Wilson.

The Society has now grown to a size of 250 members, as can be seen by the composition of the present Executive: our present membership of something like 250 stands at a figure which has remained unchanged for a number of years, but constantly new members have joined to replace those who have gone. It is probably fair to say that no important hymn book has been published since 1936 in England which had no connection with the Society through some member or associate of its editorial board.

And now as we enter our second century of Bulletins we enter also what may be a period of profound revolution in hymnody. The preparation for this revolution has been going on for some years. I was reminded the other day by a correspondent that in Bulletin 79 I made some mention of Geoffrey Beaumont (as he then was: he is now Father Gerard of the Community of the Resurrection, Mirfield). That illustrious name is now associated with the opening of a new radical controversy about hymnody, and a fashion of ‘popular’ tune-writing set by Father Gerard has established itself and gained wide publicity. The most interesting development in this has been the incursion into this field of amateur evangelistic ‘pop’ hymn-writing of a professional musician of high standing, Malcolm Williamson; and those who would educate themselves in what has gone on can quite easily take the course by getting hold of the successive publications of the Twentieth Century Church Light Music Group, together with the publications of Williamson, most of which are quasi-pop, but some of which are experimental in an entirely different way. All this can be got from Josef Weinberger, and for the convenience of readers a bibliography is appended to this article. I do not want here to attempt a criticism of this movement: I have done so in Twentieth Century Church Music which I understand that Herbert Jenkins is about to publish (I write in February, 1964). The Society at its Malvern Conference last year had a session on church poetry which proved to be a scene of much friendly controversy. We may note, however, that now and again these tunes of the Light Music Group find their way into broadcasts and into church services. I have been told that now and again they are given an airing at Great St. Mary’s, Cambridge (the University Church); and a chance indisposition which kept me at home during service time in mid-December enabled me to hear a congregation of laymen in retreat in Surrey broadcasting, in morning service, all seven verses of ‘At the name of Jesus’ to Michael Brierley’s tune: which I was not disposed to regard as anything but a penitential discipline. Malcolm Williamson is a special case, but in respect of all the rest of this music it seems quite fair to judge that it attempts, not a new idiom, but the revival of an idiom well-tried in entertainment in the days when people now wearing fifty were boys.

More recently the explosion created by the Bishop of Woolwich in March, 1963, with his book, Honest to God, has not left hymnologists comfortable in their consciences. Since hymns deal so largely in poetry and images, it is natural that those who found the Bishop’s book worth serious notice have had to take thought concerning the teaching of some of our familiar hymns. Some of us have been wondering whether a new kind of hymnody might not be born out of this controversy; and others of us have been led to doubt the completeness of the Bishop’s theological analysis by a conviction that although his book showed passion and conviction, the one thing it was undoubtedly short of was poetry. Since this controversy is now in a condition almost comparable to being sub judice, and a direct challenge from the Bishop has been accepted by the standing editorial committee of one of our most famous hymn books, we must leave the reader here with no more than a tantalizing intimation. We shall probably be hearing more of this quite soon. But if a reconstruction of theological statement is really proved to be necessary, it cannot be half so painful as a corresponding reconstruction of our attitude to hymns would be.

We are certainly looking (and here one doubts whether the Bishop of Woolwich can help us much) for a change in the writing of tunes: those of us who are dissatisfied with the Twentieth Century Light Music Group’s work are wondering just what the present age is going to be moved by. The lead is being given by...
Continental churches, by German students and French congregations, perhaps by composers like Heinz Werner Zimmermann. An increasing doubt whether the organ is the only, or always the best, instrument for accompanying congregational singing is making itself articulate. A parallel doubt whether four-part harmony is the only or the best texture for a hymn tune ought also to be heard. Of course, we are in for any amount of speculation, experiment, and debate. So we should be. There will be a great deal of ersatz music composed by the experimenters.

But what it really comes to, in my own view, is this: that whereas since the appearance of Songs of Praise (1926, 1931) we have to a large extent lived on the new capital put into the business by those much-abused experimenters, Dearmer, Shaw and Vaughan Williams, we may now be witnessing, as it were, a total reconstruction of the whole economic system of hymnody. I think we are passing out of the era in which it was fashionable and suitable to point out the defects of the Songs of Praise school. The forthcoming Cambridge Hymn Book will certainly startle us much more, but in the same directions as Songs of Praise startled its generation. We are looking now for people who will remodel the business and make it adequate to serve the present generation: and a good deal of the old machinery anyhow will probably have to be written off as life-expired. Possibly the organ will go; possibly four-part harmony; possibly the hallowed phrases of the Authorized Version, which so many of us have been illuminated and adorned by their incorporation into the text of so many great classic hymns, will turn out to be far less moving to a generation which increasingly hears other versions of Scripture. Possibly, the farther consequences of the Vatican Council will make us, in an ecumenical setting, re-think our settled convictions about the place of hymns in the church’s worship. If, as seems probable, the Roman Catholics, along with the acceptance of vernacular worship and especially the vernacular Scriptures, show a large increase in their already very fresh and vigorous new approach to hymns, will the Protestants, from whom all that we call the greatest hymnody has so far come, be willing much longer to insist that they alone know what hymns should be used for?

Thoughts such as these give ground for the conclusion that in the years ahead the Hymn Society will have a great deal to do. In particular the fact that we stand in the presence of a complete revolution in what we have accepted as the Roman Catholic approach to other communions provides occasion for saying here how very greatly we welcome an approach made to us by the Church Music Association through its Secretary, Mr. Patrick Morison. This Association, for the promotion of Catholic Church Music, has for some time been active in this country, with admirable results at parish level, and its magazine, Church Music, makes quite excellent reading. Our members are encouraged to make contact with this Association, and they can do so by writing to Mr. J. P. Morison, 5/6 Staple Inn, London, W.C.1. The subscription to the Association is 30s. a year.

That is just one example which has come our way of the many indications that there are new directions in which we must seek to move. We shall, of course, have another spate of new hymnals fairly soon. The Cambridge Hymn Book is on the way. The Headmasters’ Conference has authorized a quite new book for schools and churches which in due course we hope to have the privilege of reviewing. The Anglican Hymn Book appears to be in active preparation. And it is now officially known that the Church of Scotland’s Church Hymnary is due to be revised by order of the General Assembly.

So we go on into our second ‘century’. We take the opportunity of recalling with affection the distinguished name of Millar Patrick, who edited the first 41 issues of this Bulletin. By a strange coincidence your present editor lives in the next parish now to that which for some years he served in Edinburgh. The present editor himself has nothing but penitence for the extent to which he has fallen short of the eminent standard set by Dr. Patrick; but the society’s support over the sixteen years since Dr. Patrick demitted office has been much comfort to him.

Church Music in Popular Style (Josef Weinberger Ltd., 33 Crawford Street, London, W.1.)

Thirty 20th-Century Hymn Tunes (1960), 6s.
More 20th-Century Hymn Tunes (1962), 6s.
Three Hymn Tunes, by Geoffrey Beaumont (1957), 186d.
Second Set of Three Hymn Tunes, by Reginald Simpson (1962), 186d.
Four Modern Psalm Tunes (1961), 286d.
Rhythm in Religion (1960), 6s.6.
Eleven Hymn Tunes, by Geoffrey Beaumont (1957), 3s.
Easter Carol (EH 122), by Malcolm Williamson (1962), 8d.
Twelve New Hymn Tunes, by Malcolm Williamson (1962), 4s.
Six Christmas Songs for the Young, by Malcolm Williamson (1963), 256d.
Procession of Palm, by Malcolm Williamson (1962), 5s.

The above are (or contain) hymn tunes published by Weinberger. Apply to the address above for a full list of services, cantatas, and other material. Recordings of many of these works are on the Tower label (45 r.p.m.), published at the same address.
THE IMPACT OF HYMNS ANCIENT AND MODERN
UPON ENGLISH HYMNODY

By L. H. Bunn

In order to estimate the contribution of _Hymns A & M_ in its various editions to English hymnody we should compare the contents of other hymn books before its publication in 1861 and afterwards. The foundations of British hymn-writing were already securely laid, and a host of books existed within the Establishment and without. Hymns, as distinct from the approved metrical psalters, were available in the parishes in such widely-used compilations as Mercer, 1854, Cooke & Denton, 1853, Kemble, 1853, and the SPCK _Psalms & Hymns_, 1852–59, as well as an increasing number of private local collections. But from the outset _A & M_ was extensively supported, its popularity growing as that of its rivals declined. (Canon Lowther Clarke states that in the years 1861–68 its sales totalled 41 millions of copies.) Indeed, before 1900 this book had become recognized as a characteristic hymnal of the Anglican Church, and among its competitors of that time only Bishop Bickersteth’s _Hymnal Companion_ has persisted in active demand from 1870 to the present day (3rd ed. reprinted 1936, and by Wm Clowes & Sons, printers of _A & M_). In no sense could _A & M_ be called a ‘novel’ book when it first appeared in 1861, and therein lies a main reason for its immediate acceptance. It was of small compass but excellently balanced. If Latin hymns lay nearest to the hearts of Sir Henry Baker and his Committee, and they laboured assiduously to procure, or themselves compose, translations, they did not fill their pages with them, as did Neale in his _Hymnal Noted_. Wisely conservative, they placed as No. 1 Bishop Ken’s familiar Morning Hymn, already inevitable at Matins in Sir Roger de Coverley’s parish church in the _Spectator_. The second hymn was ‘New every morning’, which Tractarians had received from Keble in their early dawn of thirty years past. After translations of two Latin Office Hymns came two hymns by C. Wesley; then three more Latins, and so back to Ken for his Evening Hymn. In these ten opening hymns, therefore, the book commended itself at once to three sections of the Church, to the old steady English High Church, the eager new ritualists, and those who sang the Gospel according to Wesley. Despite its High Church _provenance_ the collection was evidently no party book; it could rally and consolidate the greater part of the Church of England.

Almost exactly one-half of the hymns [Nos. 1–135] provided for the observance of the Church Year. (This had been done, less conspicuously, by Mercer, and even by Currerell.) The next 67 hymns, headed ‘General’, were followed by a further 71 for the Sacraments and various occasions of the Church.

Now it is to be noticed that in that earlier half of the book only seven original hymns and 45 translations seem to be making a first public appearance, including Faber’s ‘Sweet Saviour, bless us’, ‘As with gladness’ by Dix, and such translations as Caswall’s ‘My God, I love Thee’ and F. Pott’s ‘Alleluia! The strife is o’er’. When we meet these in other collections we may welcome them as first-fruits of _A & M_ industry in the broad field of hymn-writing, for before 1861 they were unknown. The remaining 390 or so in this portion (half being translations) had already been introduced elsewhere in some book of slight or wider appeal. Thus there were hymns being sung by limited circles before 1861, but their further diffusion must have been greatly assisted when they were taken into _A & M_ with its expanding range and prestige.

Such, in brief, was the state of Anglican hymnody. Concurrently we find in use the _Baptist Psalms & Hymns_, 1858, and the _New Congregational Hymn-book_, 1859, a small first collection of English Presbyterians _Paraphrases & Hymns_, 1857, a Moravian edition by Montgomery in 1849 and Martineau’s Unitarian _Hymns_, 1849; Methodists were still singing their Wesley hymns [1780] together with the _Supplement_ of 1831. Thus the principal branches of _conformity_ throughout the land were provided for until about 1874, when new supplements and editions were to give occasion to assess the Anglican achievement, and to appropriate gracefully some of its treasures.

The Wesleyan _Supplement_ of 1831 contained, among its 209 hymns, only eleven from Anglican sources (apart, that is, from the predominant Wesley family). Far more variety appears, nearly thirty years later, in the _New Congregational Hymn-book_, 1859, where, it is true, no less than 530 pieces come from Watts, Doddridge and the Wesleys [not 700 as said by the present writer in the American _Hymns_, XII, p. 7, counting Watts’ psalms twice!]. But there are, besides, Anglican authors from Sandys to Mant and Lyte, with a strong tincture of Olney. Effective use is made of the Heber collection, with e.g. the Bishop’s famous ‘Trinity’ and ‘Missionary’ hymns and Dean Milman’s ‘O help us, Lord’. More significant is the inclusion of poems from Keble’s Tractarian _Christian Year_, of which his lines at morning (‘O timely happy’ or ‘New every morning’) and evening (‘Sun of my soul’) have long been the common possession of the Church. Nor were the Roman converts rejected, for ‘My God, how wonderful’ and ‘Dear Angel, ever at my side’ were both published by Faber in 1840 after his secession (though naturally the latter hymn was modified for Congregationalists as ‘Dear Jesus’). The extract from M. Bridges’ ‘Crown Him’ is part of his Roman Catholic _Ceremonies_ before the hymn was edited for Anglican worship. We note, too, a few translations from Latin, by Caswall ( _Jesu_ , the very thought of
Again it would seem that Faber's hymns gained their popularity through A & M. 'Hark, hark, my soul' occurs, indeed, in the *People's Hymnal*, 1867, before it is found in *A & M*, but 'Sweet Saviour, bless us' probably first became widely known in *A & M*; the same applies to its 'O come and mourn with me awhile', but the Anglican and Congregationalist editors made their several variants of Faber's text. Newman's 'Lead, kindly Light' [1853] was included in B. H. Kennedy's *Hymnologia Christiana*, 1863, but its fame was undoubtedly spread by Dykes' tune *LUX BENIGNA* in *A & M*.

Turning to translations in this *Supplement*, 1874, we find Neale's English for *Veni, veni, Emmanuel* and portions of his *Hora novissima* (pp. Nos. 171, 744), together with 'The strain upraise'—all of which were in *A & M*; from the *Appendix* in 1868 came several of his pieces with Greek connexions, such as 'The day is past and over', 'Art thou weary', 'The day of Resurrection'. The *Dies irae* was in *A & M* and is here altered from the version of W. J. Irons, while Caswall yields 'My God, I love Thee'. German texts in English include Caswall's 'When morning gilds' and Philip Pusey's 'Lord of our life', both from *A & M*, though Catherine Winkworth's 'Nun danket' and F. E. Cox's 'O let him whose sorrow' both appeared in 1861. (One recalls the apocryphal dean who, at the funeral of a notoriously improvident canon, approved the choice of *Wen in Leidenaugen* because 'that is exactly what poor old X always did—"trust in God, and borrow").

Leaving the Congregationalists, we find that the Weslayan *New Supplement*, issued in 1876, added a few more *A & M* hymns, among them Baker's 'Praise, O praise our God and King' [ed. 1861] and Bishop Wordsworth's 'See the Conqueror mounts' [ed. 1868]. It was at this time that John Cousin's Ordination hymn 'Christ is my hidden *Ghost* [Veni Creator]' passed into Methodist use (although Dryden's version had been sung since 1831, and even printed by Wesley in 1741). Part of Markant's 'O Lord, turn not' appears in *A & M*, as altered by the Compilers (adding their inevitable doxology) from the 'Tate & Brady' text; but the Weslayan *Supplement* favours Heber's revision. Now, too, Methodists became acquainted with Isaac Williams' 'Disposer Supreme' [*Supreme quales Arbiter*, by J-B. de Santeuil], and 'The Voice that breathed' by Baker.

We observe also some hymns that seem to have passed straight from *A & M* into the *Baptist Hymnal*, 1879. Such are Baker's 'The King of love', Baring-Gould's 'Now the day is over' and 'Onward, Christian soldiers', and Potter and How's 'Brightly gleams our banner'.

Shortly before his death Baker brought out a revised edition of *A & M* [A & M 1875] which soon began to make itself felt beyond Anglican borders. Thus C. M. Noel's 'At [In] the Name of Jesus'
[1870] stands also in the Baptist book [B/1879], but not e.g. in the
Hymnal Companion to the Book of Common Prayer before its
3rd ed. 1890. On the other hand, Dean Alford's 'Forward! be our
watchword,' and 'Our day of praise is done' and 'Now the labourer's
tale' (Ellerton) all occur in the and ed. and in the
Hymnal Companion before being used in B/1879. Further, all
of these were soon taken into the Congregational Church Hymnal
[C/1887], where, however, G. S. Barrett, the editor, occasionally
borrowed directly from A/1875, as with Bright's 'At Thy feet, O
Christ' and S. J. Stone's 'God the Father's only Son.' Stone's more
famous lines, 'The Church's one foundation' (1886), were revised
for A/1888, but their first Nonconformist use seems to be in
C/1887 (and Allen's book of 1886).

In other respects, too, A/1875 proved fruitful. A. W.
Chatfield's paraphrase 'Lord Jesu, think on me' represents the 5th-
century Greek of Syenum; though published in his own volume in
1876 it found place in this ed. of A & M, and is now widely
accepted. Bishop Wordsworth of Lincoln, who contributed to
A & M from 1868 onwards several hymns which sustain their
popularity, gave to this edition 'Father of all ... May we be one;' but
thoug serviceably abridged in the Church Hymnary, 1898, 1927
and the new Irish Church Hymnal of 1906 the hymn is in declining
use, and seems not quite to meet the eumetrical needs of our
time. Much the same can be said of the diminished appeal of
Sir Henry's Communion hymn 'I am not worthy,' but his other
hymn in this revision, 'O praise ye the Lord ... in the height,' is
still justifying its inclusion in Songs of Praise, 1931. Canon Bright's
lines, 'And now, O Father, mindful' [1873], gratefully used by
Methodists and Presbyterians (though not in Congregational Praise,
1951), are to be found in the Baptist Hymn Book, 1962. Baker
deserves our especial gratitude for one of his last gifts to the
undivided Church, for his Committee discovered 'Author of life
divine,' a Wesley hymn at Sacrament overlooked by the Methodists
in 16 stanzas. It had previously appeared rather obscurely in
Littledale's People's Hymnal, 1867, but the present beautiful extract
in the Church Hymnary, 1927 ('Jesus, Saviour ever mild,' No. 468)
deserves wider recognition.

When the first Supplement to the edition of 1875 came out in
1889, it contained three children's hymns by Mrs C. F. Alexander
not previously in general use, though they had all been sung in
Mrs Carey Brock's Children's Hymn-book, SPCK 1881. One of
them, 'All things bright and beautiful,' remains high in favour,
but the decline of 'Do no sinful action' and 'Every morning the red
sun' will bear reflection. Mrs Gurney's Marriage hymn 'O perfect
love ... transcending' [1883] was accepted almost simultaneously
by A/1889 and the Hymnal Companion, 1890, but to A & M is
surely due its present strong position. The story of Isabel
Stevenson's hymn for the absent, 'Holy Father, in Thy mercy,' with
its naval and royal connexions, is told in the Handbooks to the
Church Hymnary, 1927; its vogue extends from A/1889 to the
Baptist Hymn Book (1962). It was also this First Supplement which
introduced Dean Plumtree's 'Thy hand, O God, has guided,' now
one of the indispensable hymns of the Church; while included in
the Church Hymnary, 1927, it is notably missing from Songs of
Praise and the Methodist Hymn-book, 1933, but it finds place in the
recent book of the King's School, Canterbury [1960] and in the
Baptist Hymn Book.

It is convenient to consider together the new edition of 1904,
and the Second Supplement (to the 1875 edition) of 1916 which
was meant in some measure to retrieve the disappointment of
the former book. A striking feature of A/1904 was the series of trans-
lations by Dr. A. J. Mason of the various Salve festa dies for Easter,
Ascension, Whitsuntide and the Dedication of a church, all begin-
ning 'Hail, festal day.' Although excellent renderings they
were in the wrong metre, and after A/1916 were replaced by a
set of elegies by Dr C. S. Phillips. Other translations also appeared
elsewhere. Thus Mason's pioneering work had the effect of draw-
ing away Anglican usage from Ellerton's fine paraphrase 'Welcome,
happy morning,' which came into A/1889 from Church Hymns,
1871, and is still found in the latest Free Church books. Dr
Bramley's Lobe den Herren (Praise to the Lord the Almighty)
came into English use in 1904, with Miss Winkworth's familiar
rendering in A & M, and also a new version by G. R. Woodward in
his Songs of Syon. 'Trumpet of God' came in as a Missionary
hymn, and has passed from A/1904 and 1916 into other collect-
s; so, too, with Ainger's 'God is working His purpose out,' and
S. C. Lowry's 'Son of God, eternal Saviour' [1863]. An almost
unknown Passion (or Mission) hymn by Walsham How, 'O my
Saviour, lifted/ From the earth for me,' was rescued for A/1904
and 1916, and is coming into considerable use [e.g. B/1962]. These
editions of A & M confirmed a change in the text of Wesley's 'A
charge to keep I have' which apparently originated in the first
Public School Hymn-book, 1903. Hence many modern books read,
instead of 'for ever die,'

And let me ne'er my trust betray
But press to realms on high.

In a similar way it was A/1868 which altered 'Guide me, O Thou
great Jehovah' to 'Redeemer.'

Another Wesley Communion hymn introduced by A/1916
is 'How glorious is the life above,' which, if not yet widely used,
comes into the new hymnal for the King's School, Canterbury, 1960.
The Second Supplement also brings in 'God be in my head' from
the select pages of the *Oxford Hymn Book*, 1908. The even more exclusive *Yattendon Hymnal*, 1899, of Robert Bridges kept his fine composition 'All praise be to God/Whom all things obey', until *A/1916* made it more generally known (e.g. to the King's School).

It is interesting to find in *A/1916* a brief 'National' hymn beginning 'Thou Framer of the light and dark'. The opening lines of Keble's poem, 'Tis gone, that bright and orb'd blaze', from which these two stanzas are taken have scarcely ever been used in a hymn, except in Martineau's Unitarian book of 1840 or that of the Methodist Free Churches in 1860; most editors preferring to begin at 'Sun of my soul' [st. iii] as in *A/1861*; this was almost Mercer's selection, as well as that of Montgomery's Moravian book of 1819, and the *Scottish UP Hymnal*, 1852.

Of the influence of the latest *Hymns A & M Revised* ([*A/1950*]) it is too soon to speak, and we may sum up our findings. Perhaps among the older Anglican hymn-books the one with the most strikingly modern aspect is *Mercer*, 1854, with its wealth of Wesleyan and German hymns, of Montgomery and Watts. But no book could ultimately speak for the Church of England which failed to express the Tractarian emphasis. Thus in the end Mercer's book was eclipsed, and there rests with Methodism, Presbytery and Dissent the responsibility of sustaining their own true and distinctive witness within the Church which is re-discovering its unity of purpose and worship. If Christian hymnody in this land is now more bravely and humbly Catholic than it was a century ago, this change is largely due to *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, tempering the present with the past, reinforcing the believer's heart with the massive strength of the Church in every age.

---

**WHAT SHALL THEY SING?**

By J. T. Slater, of Slough Grammar School

[This article, which we reprint by kind permission of the Editor of the Bulletin of the University of Leeds Institute of Education, appeared in that journal in November, 1961. With so much new interest in hymns as a means of education, and expecting the appearance within a year or two of the new experimental Cambridge Hymn Book, we felt that the judgments and research in this article would be of special interest to our members.]

Many are the considerations to be faced when a school decides to review its present hymn-book—but do we ever pause to consider the primary purpose of our hymn-singing, to realise that we are seeking the best in Christian praise and worship? Surely our first thought should be upon the theological worthiness of the words in the hymn-book, rather than upon the musical excellence of the settings.

With this in mind, I recently conducted a survey to secure details about hymn-books used in schools to-day, my intention being to use the collated material as a basis on which to enlarge on the study of the use of hymns in schools for the teaching of Christian doctrine. It was felt necessary to limit the inquiry to secondary schools, since infant and junior hymn-singing presents problems peculiar to that age-range. Although the inquiry was limited in extent, the findings are of interest to teachers of all age-groups and the observations upon them are of universal application.

One hundred and fifty secondary schools were approached, and these included secondary grammar schools (boys, girls and mixed), direct grant schools, secondary technical, secondary modern (single-sex and co-educational), comprehensive schools, schools for educationally sub-normal and physically handicapped children, and voluntary schools of Church of England, Methodist, Congregational and Moravian foundation. These schools were selected from the widest possible area, care being taken to include all counties of England. No Roman Catholic school received a copy of the questionnaire and nowhere in the analysis is further mention made specifically relevant to Roman Catholic schools.

Replies were received from 110 schools, but not all the material given was suitable for inclusion in a statistical review of the information. Several schools use a hymn-book of their own compilation and were therefore unable to help by sending numbers of popular hymns. Schools for physically handicapped and for educationally subnormal children often used a wall-chart type of hymn-sheet, again with individual choice of hymns.

Outstanding in the analysis of hymn-books used in schools were two most noticeable factors; the wide range of books in use,
and the overwhelming majority preference. At least twenty different books are in common use, and it is apparent, and significant, that many schools are still searching with real intent for the 'ideal school hymn-book', as they make the best of a temporary expedient. On what criteria is their search for a new book made? Do they seek for a set of words with a sounder basis for doctrinal teaching? Do they seek tunes which have a greater appeal to the modern generation? Or are they swayed by the cheapness of pocket editions of the words?

One wonders which of the above considerations influenced the 62% of schools who chose to use Songs of Praise. Compared with Hymns Ancient and Modern used in 8% of schools, or The BBC Hymn-book in 2%, this staggering popularity of Songs of Praise seems to demand further investigation. This hymn-book is used in almost half the grammar schools considered, in a quarter of the public and direct grant schools, in over 80% of the secondary modern and schools for educationally subnormal children, and in almost 90% of the secondary technical and art schools.

We may appreciate the influence which Songs of Praise is today exerting on the pattern of worship in schools, not only by the high percentage of schools using it, but by the fact that of those schools which sing more than one hymn at each assembly, the great majority use this hymn-book, thus magnifying its influence, whether for good or ill. Most schools seem to follow a fairly rigid pattern each morning: the hymn, reading, prayers; 15% of schools sing two hymns at each assembly (three-quarters of these using Songs of Praise), while only two schools returned information that they sang three hymns every morning— from Songs of Praise.

From information collected it was possible to draw up a list of percentage popularity of hymns used in schools. The following may give some indication of the choice of schools today, apart from seasonal favourites (Christmas carols and hymns, etc.) which enjoyed 100% popularity—

100% All people that on earth do dwell
Let us with a gladsome mind
He who would valiant be
Praise, my soul, the King of Heaven
The King of love my Shepherd is
We plough the fields and scatter
92% Come, ye thankful people, come
There is a green hill
Dear Lord and Father of mankind
89% O worship the King
80% Ye holy angels bright
Lead us, heavenly Father, lead us
As with gladness

Bllest are the pure in heart
Jesus Christ is risen today
79— Forth in Thy name, O Lord, I go
70% Fight the good fight
All glory, laud and honour
When I survey the wondrous cross
Breathe on me, breath of God
Now thank we all our God
Praise to the Lord, the Almighty
All creatures of our God and King
Immortal, invisible, God only wise
Jesus shall reign

At the other end of the list we find hymns whose tune does not have an immediate appeal to children, or whose words are outside a child's experience and therefore more difficult to understand.

Come Holy Ghost (Veni Creator)
God moves in a mysterious way
Come, O come, Emmanuel
Praise to the Holiest in the height
The Church's one foundation
Thou whose almighty word

In addition to these more or less popular hymns, there are a few which demand special mention. Among those which have a very small poll are favourite Easter hymns—the problem being felt in most schools whether to remember the Resurrection by singing 'Jesus lives! Thy terrors now . . .' on the last day of term, even though it may be Maundy Thursday; or to respect the last days of Holy Week, and omit Easter hymns from the school list, presuming that this major Christian festival will be celebrated at home and on Sunday worship.

Another question which arouses much controversy is that of the suitability of certain hymns to the spiritual experience of the child. The BBC Hymn Book says in the preface that it provides no special section 'For the Young', since it advocates a full, though discriminating, use of the hymns sung by adults. This treats the older children as they would wish to be treated. And it makes them familiar with the hymns which they will find in use when they become regular members of the adult congregation. But the questionnaire evoked contrary comment from those who think that 'many hymns which are relevant for the Church congregation are alien to a modern pupil, since they contain too many allusions to scriptural images and religious experiences quite beyond his ken.'

Is it for this reason that so many hundreds of teen-age children
are asked to worship God through the words of the following song?

Glad that I live am I, that the sky is blue;
Glad for the country lanes, and the fall of dew;
After the sun the rain, after the rain the sun;
This is the way of life, till the work be done.
All that we need to do, be we low or high,
Is to see that we grow nearer the sky. (SP 499)

Why is such a religious song so popular? Surely not for any depth of meaning in the words, for one can scarcely recognise any Christian teaching in them. Perhaps in the lift of the tune lies the secret of the hymn’s popularity; and this I suspect is the case in many of the hymns in Songs of Praise.

Assuredly, this hymn-book especially rejoices in a wealth of musical jewels under the joint musical editorship of Dr R. Vaughan Williams and Dr Martin Shaw. Since it seems to be universally accepted that the chief criterion for judging a good hymn is the excellence of the tune, we can now see why over 60% of schools prefer Songs of Praise, with its treasure of melodic and harmonic gems including music by Arnold Bax, Armstrong Gibbs, Gustav Holst, Herbert Howells, John Ireland and Geoffrey Shaw, not to mention the two music editors. What a store-house we have in Songs of Praise from which to select hymns that will appeal to the children’s subconscious appreciation of harmonic adventure, chromatic colouring, irregular rhythms, and ‘long lines of melody’!

But as teachers we must resist the temptation to give our children only what they enjoy singing, without any regard to the suitability of the words. Many books are available today which suggest outlines for morning assembly, with selected readings, prayers and recommended hymns. So many of these, however, presuppose that in giving a hymn title together with its number in several of the more popular hymn-books, they are referring to the same work; for example, it may be suggested that one morning the children sing ‘At the name of Jesus’—EH 368, SP 392, A & M 225. On closer scrutiny, we find that in one school, children will be singing:

Brothers, this Lord Jesus
Shall return again,
With his Father’s glory
With his Angel train . . .

and the theme of the Second Coming may well be taken up in the reading e.g. Matthew 16, 27, or Luke 21, 27, or in the daily RI period. But in the school which uses Songs of Praise—and their number is legion—all such reference to this scriptural truth is bypassed, as they sing

Brothers, this Lord Jesus
Dwells with us again,
In his Father’s wisdom
O’er the earth to reign.

Or again we may compare the words as found in the majority of hymn-books (A & M 91)

Christian, up and smite them,
Counting gain but loss;
Smite them by the merit
Of the holy Cross . . .

where the power in Christ crucified is shown to the full, with the version in Songs of Praise (496):

Christian, up and follow;
His the perfect school,
Learn to make men happy
By the Golden Rule.

Why does this hymn-book, with such amazing popularity, attempt to take the Christian message out of Christianity? Why does a hymn-book with such a pantheistic and even humanist outlook have such a popularity in schools to-day? Is it not a mirror of the modern trend towards a non-committal, eviscerated religion under the guise of Christianity? Little wonder that Songs of Praise has been criticised as a ‘wayward successor’ to the English Hymnal, a book compiled by the same editor; or referred to as a ‘drastic bowdlerisation of Christian texts’; or characterised by Erik Routley as ‘that financially eccentric hymn book’. (1)

These examples are but few of countless subtle changes in the words of Songs of Praise. Study them, and you will find that Songs of Praise offers us an adulterated Christian doctrine.

(1) The Editor, observing that he is here quoted, would express his pleasure that the author of the article thought him worth quoting, but would also, to preserve honesty, remind readers that he has not infrequently said more lately that Songs of Praise shows an understanding far beyond that of other books of its time (or any other time) of what in the Christian language appears strange or unintelligible to the uncommitted; and that its respect for good literature is a quality which one can admire even when one dissents from its persistent suppression of certain kinds of Christian imagery. The very large question whether the uncommitted can sing hymns at all appears at its acutest in School Assembly.
CANON NOEL BOSTON'S COLLECTION

BOOKS PRIOR TO 1900

Those who have met Canon Boston at conferences of the Society will know of his profound interest and erudition in the matter of church barrel organs and their repertoire. Since a conference is planned for this summer at East Dereham, where Canon Boston lives, we are glad to publish here a list he has compiled of the hymn books in his collection. It will at once be seen that he has some very interesting rare items in his collection.

Canon Boston has an index, carefully compiled, of over 1,700 tunes in these books, together with references to the barrel-organists that play some of them. After the catalogue of his books he prints some notes which he has kindly supplied, on the rarest volumes, and some questions which he has about three unidentifiable books. His kind offer to place his knowledge at the disposal of members is one which, if we pay a visit to East Dereham, will surely be taken up by many interested visitors.

**TITLE** | **EDITOR** | **PUBLISHER** | **DATE**
--- | --- | --- | ---
1. 'Barton-under-Needwood' | J. G. Gregory | Catline | 1841
2. Bournemouth Hymn Book (words) | C. Pearce | | 1868
3. Bristol Psalter | A. Stone | | 1881
4. Bristol Tune Book | | | 1869-1900
6. 'Burghclere with Newton' | G. R. Portal | Oxford | 1876
7. Cantica Ecclesiastica | T. Irons | Novello | 1855
8. Canons for Use in Church | Irons & Chope | Metzler | 1883
9. Chichester's Psalmody | Poullmann | 1888
10. Children's Hymn Book | SPCK | | 1877
11. Chartisbach | F. H. Lubel | Speier | 1859
13. Church and Home Metrical Psalter & Hymnal | R. Windle | Routledge | 1865
14. Church Hymns with Tunes | SPCK | | 1875
15. Church Hymns with Tunes | SPCK | | 1875
16. Church Hymns with Tunes | SPCK | | 1875
17. Church Hymns with Tunes | SPCK | | 1875
18. Church Hymns with Tunes | APCK, Dublin | | 1897
19. Church Psalter & Hymn Book | Mercier | | 1854
20. Church Psalter & Hymn Book (rearranged) | Mercier | | 1864
21. Cocks's Church's Hymnary | | | 1853
22. 'Dereham' Selection of Psalms, and ed. | Hyde | Derham | 1813
23. 'Dereham' MS. selection | | | 1826
24. Devotional Melodies selected from the works of the best Composers | Playford & Pearson | | 1715
27. Gregorian Psalm Tunes | Hamilton & Glasgow | | 1875
28. 'Gresenhall Book' (title page missing) | | | 1875
29. Hamilton's Edition of Select Psalmody | | | 1875
30. Hart's Congregational Singing Book ed. | | | 1875
65. Round's Book (title page missing) 17-(?)

66. Royal Melody, The, Compl. or The New Harmony of Zion, in Three Books, 3rd ed. 1764

67. Sacred Harmony Sung in the Church of St. George, Edinburgh, 2nd ed. R. A. Smith 1825

68. St. Albans Hymn; Hymns Noted 1874

69. Sacred Songs and Solos Sankey Marshall, 1883

70. Scottish Hymnal Nelson 1890

71. Scottish Psalmody Nelson 1873

72. Selection of Psalms & Hymns (words) Partridge 1866

73. Standard Tune Book (3rd ed.) Shaw 1855

74. Stoke Holy Cross' MS. tune book Crossley 1861

75. Swaffham' Psalms and Hymns Philo 1812(?)

76. Temple Church Choral (1st ed.) Hopkins Service Book, 2nd ed. 1869

77. Tonic Koz. Breiz-Izel; Les Vieux Airs Bretons Paris 1889

78. Tune Book adapted to Psalms and Hymns SPCK

79. Turpin's Hymn Tunes E. W. Turpin Weekes 1872

80. Union Tune Book Clark S.S.C. 1843

81. Watts's Hymns and Spiritual Songs Watts Lockman 1785

82. Webbe's Psalm Tunes and Intonated with Airs Webbe Button 1808

83. Whitehouse's Twenty Original Psalm Tunes Novello 1899

84. Rayson Manuscript Collection Vol. 1, 134 tunes by various composers 1893

85. Vol. 2, 89 tunes by various composers Vol. 3, 256 tunes composed by George Rayson between 1833-1870 1893

86. *Bridgman's Manuscript Book 1893

* Books thus marked are commented on in the notes following this list.

NOTE ON THE LOCAL BOOKS IN THE COLLECTION


2. 'This is a selection of twenty-nine Metrical Psalms presumably translated by the compiler though the Hundredth Psalm is from the Old Version. There are a hundred and sixty-one hymns by Cowper, Watts, etc., and one or two locally, perhaps by the anonymous compiler.'
Finally I would like to ask help in identifying three splendid collections which, in my catalogue, I refer to by the names of 'The Gressenhall Book', 'The Horbling Book' and 'Red's Book' (53, 55, 68).

'The Gressenhall Book' (56) measures 94 ins. by 5 ins. and is 2 ins. thick. It is bound in brown leather with a little tooling on the edges. It was brought to me eleven years ago by an old clergyman whose son had heard a broadcast of mine on the subject of village bands. It had belonged to my friend's aunt, now Mrs Tyzack, whose father had been a 'cello player, or rather the 'cello player, in the Gressenhall Church Band. Gressenhall is a village near Dereham in Norfolk and this book represents the old man's music library. The first part of the book is made up of some two hundred and more country dances and music instructions as to steps. We dance these once a year in Dereham Assembly Room to the accompaniment of contemporary instruments. (A number of the Gressenhall band instruments, by the way, are preserved at St Peter Hungate Ecclesiastical Museum, Norwich.)

After a selection of secular dances we find ourselves on page 24 with the last half of a Psalm tune and with the tune numbered 24 and called CANNON STREET. The tune numbers then continue without a break to 282 which is S. Webb's ODE. The last leaf is torn across the middle but would seem to have been used for a pamphlet and a three-part tune 283 by Dr Harrington. Most of the tunes are in four lines, a treble and bass accompaniment together with two upper parts for harmony. So far identification and accurate dating has eluded me, and I should be extremely grateful for help in this matter. Meanwhile the texts are indexed under 'Gressenhall Book'.

The second important unidentified book I list as 'The Horbling Book' (54). It was given to me last year by my friend Canon Pimlott, now Sub-Dean of Lincoln. He had been given it by the late Captain F. P. A. Snell, who stated that it had been the property of a number of successive parish clerks of the village of Horbling, near Skidbrooke, Lincolnshire. It is a fascinating leather-bound volume 36 ins. by 7 ins. and 14 ins. thick. It is in a very dilapidated condition owing to extreme use. The book begins with a treatise on music, of course, and is missing an interesting feature is that all printing is on one side of the page only. The blank pages are all filled with MS. music. The first page, under 'Notes and Characters of Tune, Explained,' then follows a diagram and then a poem entitled 'On Beating Time':

'In beating Time, the Hand or Foot We Use,
And Sometimes Thought, instead of both we choose,
The Hand being moved down, and up, will Show
How you to measure time, may rightly know.'

There are eighteen lines of this and then, on the next printed page, a table entitled 'The Gamut display'd in Seven Parts.' The music proper begins with some fragments of an anthem, which I suspect has been saved in some form. The Psalms start with Ps. 1 to GODBEY TUNE, Ps. 11 to easton TUNE by William Knapp. A great many of the tunes are marked 'set by W.K.' which must surely be William Knapp. Now William Knapp (1668–1768) published two collections: A Set of New Psalms and Anthems in Four Parts in 1738 and New Church Melody being a Set of Anthems and Psalms and Hymns in four parts with an Impersonation written by Charles I during his captivity in Carisbrooke Castle. The 'Horbling Book' ends its tunes with 'SOUTHBURY TUNE Psalm CXLIX. New Version Set by W.K.' Then follow a fully set Magnificat and thirteen 'Psalms Anthems' by a variety of people including Church, Weldon, Wise, East and Gibbs. On the blank leaves, besides almost every fragment of an anthem, is a long list of dates. I think it would be a great help if these dates were transcribed and then converted into a table like the measurement of the pyramids, what I take to be the choir accounts and a number of names, presumably those of the various owners of the book. The earliest is Thomas Walker 1767, but the book is, I think, older than that. It has been not only rebound but resewn several times and contains some exquisite 'doodling.' I imagine it is either one of the two works edited by Knapp, and, as there is no 'impersonation,' either the first, or an imperfect copy of the second, or it is a book edited by him of which it is the only known copy. But I would greatly appreciate the opinion of members of the Society.

The last unidentified book is listed as 'Round's Book' (68). It is leather bound and measures 44 ins. by 7 ins. It was given to me by my mother as long ago as 1926 and had belonged to her father, Joseph Round, a Staffordshire Iron- Maker whose family house was 'Daisy Bank', Tivendale. The first page is page 3 of which only half a page exists and then page 5 contains the tune HAVANT. The last printed page is 136 with a portion of a long version of YARMOUTH which starts 'Death in Chaines. Say, Live for ever, wondrous King'. After this is bound in a number of MS. pages. Joseph Round was a descendant of the James Round whose MS. Book of 1796 is listed above. I need hardly say that any member of the Society will be most welcome to examine any of the books if he is in Norfolk.

TWO MANUSCRIPT COLLECTIONS

The Rayson Collection

In November, 1862, the Rev H. G. B. Folland gave me three large volumes, two of which measure 15 ins. by 9 ins. and one 15 ins. by 11 ins. They are Poor Law Admission Books for workhouses and have column headings such as 'Description of Disability', 'Names of Relatives', 'Observations', etc. These headings have been scratched out and bar lines ruled over the columns and the books adapted as MS. music books. The first two books represent a typical Parish Church repertoire of 1853 but the last volume is all George Rayson's own tunes, 350 of them. His work as a Registrar and Poor Law official seems to have taken him all over Norfolk and Suffolk and his tunes, which are first dated, bear the names of local villages together with such intriguing abrasives as 'Composed while passing through the village of Rackenath Norfolk at midnight', 'Composed while sitting in the porch of the late Captain F. P. A. Snell's Parish Church at St Mary', 'Composed at 30th April 1853', 'At Fornett Railway Station 2nd September', 'Composed at midnight at Long Stratton during a thunder storm July 6 1853.' The earliest is dated 1833, the latest 1857.

The Bridgman Collection

Bridgman, James, MS. Book. 105 tunes. Bridgman was Minister of the Countess of Huntington's Chapel, Norbury, from 1817 to 1857.

REVIEWS


This short and well-produced book is a concise history of hymns and their tunes, written by a member of the Christian Scientists chiefly for his fellow-members. It packs a surprising amount of information into its small compass, as is indicated by the fact that even so short an essay requires ten pages of indexes. The very fact that in many cases unusual hymns are cited as examples because they are better known within than outside the author's immediate circle gives the book an interest that is certainly not restricted to that circle. It is well worth adding to anybody's library of hymnology.

26 Communion Hymns for Use by Choirs, compiled by Austin Long, s.4 and music, Ahingdon Press, Nashville, USA, 75 cents or 6s. 3d.

Despite its somewhat forbidding price in English money, this
collection might well be of interest to some English choirmasters in that it brings together from a number of sources some very good communion hymns for choral use. They are:

'According to thy gracious word' (EH 300) to BANGOR.
'And now, O Father' (EH 302) to SONG 1.
'Author of Life divine' (EH 303) to LITTLE CORNARD, SP 64.
'Beneath the forms of outward rite', by J. A. Blaisdell, to AYRSHIRE, CP 388.
'Bread of heaven' (EH 304) to RATISBON, A & M 7.
'Bread of the world' (EH 305) to RENDEZ A DIEU.
'By Christ redeemed' (CP 305) to ALMSGIVING, CP 670.
'By Thy cup of Blessing' (2 verses of CP 310) to GLENFINLAS, SP 354.
'Come, Holy Ghost, thine influence shed' (M 767) to GRAFENBERG, EH 421.
'Deck thyself' (EH 306) to SCHMUCKE DICH.
'Draw nigh and take the body of the Lord' (EH 307) to SONG 46, EH 468.
'Draw us in the Spirit's Tether' (2 verses of EH 319) to PLEADING SAVIOUR, EH 573.
'Father, we thank Thee who hast planted' (BBC 201) to SCHÖNTEGER HERR JESU, EH 323.
'For the Bread which thou hast broken', by Louis Benson, to KINGDOM, by V. Earle Copes.
'Hail, sacred feast' (2 verses of EH 320), to EISENACH, EH 459.
'Here, O my Lord' (EH 312) to ADORO TE, EH 331.
'Jesus Christ, our Blessed Saviour', Martin Luther from John Hus: to JESU CHRISTUS UNSER HEILAND.
'Jesus, we thus obey' (CP 300) to ST BRIDE, CH 777.
'Let all mortal flesh keep silence', EH 318.
'O bread to pilgrims given', CP 292.
'O food of men wayfaring' (EH 321) to Genevan PSALM 6, CH 543.
'O let us keep the festival' (2 verses of CP 761).
'Strengthen for service' (EH 329) to ST COLUMBA, EH 490 (in duple time).
'O bread of Life' (BBC 538).
'Upon thy Table, Lord', by M. F. C. Willson, to WINDHAM, by Daniel Read.
'Victim Divine' (EH 333) to DAS NEUGEBORNE KINDELEIN (CH 304).

In most cases only two verses are given, the object of the collection being to provide choral pieces for use during the Communion of the people. All but 'The bread of life' (for which only the melody appears) and 'Let all mortal flesh' (tune as in EH) are provided in 4-part harmony and can be sung unaccompanied. It is a very judicious collection.