

THE HYMN SOCIETY

OF GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND

BULLETIN

119

VOLUME SEVEN

NUMBER FIVE

SUMMER, 1970

Editor: THE REVD ERIK R. ROUTLEY, B.D., M.A., D.Phil.,
13A Linden Road, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE3 4EY

Hon. Secretary: THE REVD WILFRID J. LITTLE,
5 Leyton Villas, Bristol BS6 6JF

Hon. Treasurer: JOHN WILSON, M.A., MUS.B.,
30 East Meads, Guildford, Surrey.

CONTENTS

Conference Report, 1970, from the Secretary	89
Reviews: Three American Hymn Books of 1969, by the Editor	93
Donald Hughes, Headmaster, by the Editor ...	101
Correspondence—'Veni Immanuel'	102
List of New Members	104

CONFERENCE REPORT, 1970

Another memorable Conference at Charterhouse—that was the general opinion expressed at the close. The weather was perfect again and the last week of May is the gayest in the course of the seasons. The wide campus of the school was freely open for our use and beautiful surroundings will be associated in memory with this Conference.

It was a delight to be under the direction of William Llewellyn, in whom charm and control are combined in a rare degree. Excellent preparations had been made and in this he had been fully supported by John Wilson, that veteran of arrangements, and Mrs Llewellyn. With a small band of helpers she coped marvellously with our teas on Monday and Tuesday and our Tuesday coffee

break. Our sincerest thanks are due to them all. The spacious Music Room was placed at our disposal for lectures and the beautiful College for the Act of Praise.

We were welcomed after tea on Monday, in a delightfully witty speech, by the Headmaster, Mr Oliver van Oss. In a serious vein he recalled our previous Conference at Charterhouse, 1965, as marked by a brilliant lecture on 'Hymns in School Worship' by the late and still greatly lamented Donald Hughes.

Evensong was not sung at Guildford Cathedral on May 25th, as had been understood, and the coach took us to Aldro School instead. There we saw and heard two 19th-century barrel-organs which had been restored to use. Our host, the deputy-head and music master at the school, explained their character and construction. The pipes and barrels were in perfect condition. We sang hymns to the accompaniment of the one in the School Chapel and enjoyed light entertainment from the one in the Hall. It was a fascinating hour.

A discussion upon the 'Use of Hymns' followed dinner on Monday, introduced by the Chaplain of the School, Revd Leonard Morrison and William Llewellyn. Several senior boys attended and made valuable contributions as the session proceeded. Mr Morrison said he planned school worship a quarter ahead, choosing first the themes and then, secondly, the hymns to be sung with them. The tunes were decided by the Director of Music. When Mr Llewellyn thought the tune set was not quite suitable he looked for an alternative or wrote a new one. Why the concern about themes? It was unthinkable to be haphazard in arranging worship on any occasion. Here, as in every great school, another factor was present. Among the boys would be Mohammedans, Buddhists, Muslims, Jews and all Christian denominations. Attendance at Assembly Worship was not voluntary and under those circumstances only the great themes were good enough. He (the Director) spent many, many hours with Mr Llewellyn every quarter preparing school worship.

Taking up this point, Mr Llewellyn said they experimented in worship forms in order that their worship should be active. It was easy to fall to the temptation to amuse the boys, or titillate, but when this had seemed to have happened the danger that had appeared was tremendous—the danger of the whole idea of school worship falling apart. He mentioned that the next morning they were trying an experiment on a version of Dives and Lazarus, words by Geoffrey Ainger, but to a tune of folk style and something added they had never tried before. Some of the boys would be talking on the top of the music. He thought that new things often tended to embarrass, but that might not be a bad thing if it gave occasion to think again, as, for example, about the kind of man Dives was.

Numerous problems arose in connection with experimental worship. One was how to use the organ. When using it in other than traditional styles it was easy to make the organ sound cheap or vulgar. He had heard this sort of thing, 'If we could only get rid of that fuddy-duddy organ things could improve', but he remembered an occasion when they sang 'Turn back, O man' to a tune with a very carefully thought out guitar accompaniment composed by the boys. After two verses the congregation lapsed into the usual semi-comatose state. When singing folk tunes it was a help not to stop the organ between the verses. 'Compose an organ part', he said, 'which flows on continuously throughout and, somehow, it sounds more ecclesiastical.'

At Charterhouse they used tunes which could be arranged under several headings:—

1. Those which belong to the main stream of hymnody.
2. Those which had their origins in Public Schools and similar places of learning.
3. Those outside these two, for example, Howells, and he mentioned the tune MICHAEL.
4. Some not the sort of thing which a few years ago would have been heard in worship.

He felt that the Negro Spiritual could be useful. It was simple. He felt there was a great trend to simplicity today, except where the *avant-garde* were concerned. They were writing music of such complexity that they were cutting themselves right off from the public.

Another problem was the dearth of trebles and this meant that the usual descants no longer work. They have to be re-carved so that while they give a rhythmical pulse against the tune they do not rise much above the melody. This problem shows itself also in the singing of Canticles because, with them, there are always places where the lack of trebles will show through.

The accent in school music had changed. Until a few years ago chapel music had been the core of school music. It was still important but the growth of orchestral music had changed the emphasis. Efforts were made at Charterhouse to use instrumentalists in worship. The guitar could be useful on some occasions; the piano did not fill the requirements very well but there might be uses for the harpsichord.

He concluded, 'Boys are often very traditional and it is important to retain the best of the traditional. It is easy to sell out the past. Young people need living music. Composers could be more incisive, pungent and rhythmically more challenging than they are. The situation in school chapels is not discouraging because so many are concerned about it and prepared to argue about it.'

A very interesting point made by one of the boys was that a fresh tune provoked fresh attention to the words being sung.

The Tuesday morning lecture was given by the eminent hymn-tune composer, John Gardner. He spoke under the title, 'My favourite hymns'. Most of his 'favourites' belonged to the period of the 16th to 19th centuries which he ranged with ease and mastery. Of the 20th century he said, 'The 20th century has produced nothing to my liking.' This lecture will be made available to our readers through the *Bulletin* in due course. The chairman for the lecture was Dr A. R. Winnett.

A humorous, stimulating and informative address was given on Tuesday at 5 o'clock on 'Hymn-singing in England and U.S.A.' by Dr Erik Routley. Revd Ambrose Watson presided. Dr Routley declared, 'In writers like Albert Bayly, Fred Pratt Green, Timothy Rees, Fred Kaan, and some others, this century has produced hymns, which when you hear them, you hear a tune in them. Different composers will hear different tunes but a tune will be there. This is, to me, what hymn-writing is about and shows that things can start happening all over again.'

He then proceeded to deal with the three hymn books published in U.S.A. during 1969, which are reviewed by him in this present *Bulletin*.

The Act of Praise was another glorious offering of worship—reminiscent of five years ago—and which will urge us to maintain the standards we have achieved of recent years. The choir was drawn from the school and from the church choirs of all denominations in the area. For the second year in succession (last year at Liverpool) William Llewellyn gave a combined choir the benefit of his rich musical understanding. Dr Routley introduced the hymns with the acumen we expect from him and, as in 1965, Leonard Halcrow played the organ. The hymn booklet was beautifully produced and the contents the joint selection of John Wilson and William Llewellyn. The selections were:—

'The Church's one foundation', by S. J. Stone; tune, KING'S LYNN, arr. R. Vaughan Williams.

'The first day of the week' (a hymn for The Lord's Day), by F. Pratt Green; tune, GARELOCHSIDE, by Kenneth Finlay.

'God of love and truth and beauty', by Timothy Rees; tune, CAROLYN, by Herbert Murrill.

'Let us break bread together', the Negro Spiritual, arr. Charles Cleall.

'What does the Lord require?' (based on Micah, ch 6, vv 6-8), by Albert Bayly; tune, SHARP THORNE, by Erik Routley.

The Beatitudes. An antiphonal setting by William Llewellyn.

'Holy Spirit, ever dwelling', by Timothy Rees; tune, SALISBURY, by Howells.

'Simple Gifts'—a Song of the Shaker Sect as arr. by William Llewellyn.

'Rejoice with us in God the Trinity', by F. Pratt Green, to an Antiphonal setting by John Wilson.

'Come my Way, my Truth, my Life', by George Herbert; tune, COME MY WAY, by Alexander Brent Smith.

The business of the Conference was conducted between the times of the stirring events reported above. On December 31st, 1970, membership stood at 327, an increase of three on the year and subscribing libraries 43, an increase of two.

The following deaths were reported: Lionel Cummings, Geoffrey Winney, P. O. Byard and J. S. King.

The officers were re-elected with special thanks to John Wilson, the Treasurer, for another strenuous year's work.

The Secretary mentioned the proposed transfer of the Montgomery Monument and remains from the Old City Cemetery, Sheffield, to Sheffield Cathedral Yard and the expectation that the work would be completed in time for an unveiling ceremony during the Montgomery bi-centenary celebration being planned in Sheffield during 1971. The Society resolved to make a contribution towards the cost of the transfer.

The 1968 report, in German, of the International Fellowship for Research in Hymnody was upon the table. It was resolved to seek arrangements whereby extracts from this and past and future reports of the Fellowship could be made available in English.

Deep regret was expressed at the absence through home accident and illness of the Revd Leslie H. Bunn and a suitable message was sent to him. We missed our joint Chairman, Revd Dr Cyril Pocknee, and our past Secretary, Revd Arthur S. Holbrook, both prevented from attending. Greetings from Kenneth Finlay were reciprocated.

The Conference next year will be held at Keswick Hall, Norwich, July 19th to 21st.

WILFRID J. LITTLE

REVIEWS

Some reflections on three recent American hymnals: by the Editor. *The Mennonite Hymnal* (Faith and Life Press, Newton, Kansas, and Herald Press, Scottsdale, Pennsylvania), 1969.

The Hymnal and Liturgies of the Moravian Church, published by Authority of the Provincial Synods of the Moravian Church in America, 1969. (No publisher's name or address given.)

Worship Supplement (Concordia Publishing House, St Louis and London), 1969.

These three books, all published in 1969, make a fascinating trio, to which I would draw the attention of all those who are interested in the development of hymnody, not only in the United States, but generally. Each of these books has a very clear character; in many ways each is pursuing the same end—that of assimilating the people's praise to the standards which cultural developments have urged them to aspire: but each has its own way of setting about that task.

We will begin with *The Mennonite Hymnal*. The Mennonites are one of those religious communities which, after preserving for a very long time a culture almost totally invulnerable to the influence of secular change, have begun to ask questions about their isolation. Their origins are in the religious ferment in Europe of which the Reformation (by which we usually mean the Lutheran and Calvinist traditions) is only one manifestation. There was always a strong anabaptist flavour about their customs and attitudes, and in some parts of the northern States there are still communities (distinguished by the name of 'Amesh') where at least the seniors still entirely reject mechanical transport and wear nothing but black. On the other hand there are areas of the Mennonite community where progress has set in. In 1968 an organ was installed in the chapel of the new seminary at Elkhart, Indiana, and this in itself was a major defiance of tradition, for until that moment the rule against organs in churches had been as strictly observed among the Mennonites as it still is in the Free Church of Scotland.

But, as that analogy might suggest, the hymn-singing tradition among the Mennonites was never laggard in energy, however conservative it remained in manner. It always owed much to the German traditions, but from the beginning it was bound to admit that bias which unaccompanied singing necessarily implies, and the most successful tunes in their congregations were tunes that would go most naturally in four-part harmony. Consequently the Mennonite congregations were wide open to the assaults of romantic hymnody, and of this there was still a great deal in the 1940 *Mennonite Hymnal*, which the present book replaces. Indeed, there was nothing in that book that in any sense suggested the character of Mennonite life; it was the very opposite of the metrical psalter which the uninstrumented Free Kirkers rejoice in.

And that is where the new book provides its chief interest. I should not say that from the point of view of texts it is interesting at all; that is to say, it might be more or less anybody's hymnal within a generally evangelical tradition. But the musicians will find much here to give them pause, and in particular they will find their attention caught by the large number of American 'folk hymn' tunes which are here added to the repertory.

The American folk hymn is a form which has only recently

attracted the interest of hymnologists, although one or two examples of this form have appeared in some hymn books familiar to Englishmen. There is no direct, still less any exclusive, connection between the folk hymn and the Mennonite culture, but the folk hymn comes from another religious tradition which, just like the Mennonite, has been for a long time cut off from communication with the mainstream American religious groups. No—that is not quite the way to put it. Put it rather that what now seems to be the mainstream has flowed past the folk-hymn country, leaving it, until recently, in something of a backwater. Its natural home seems to be the valleys of the southern states—and that means the communities geographically isolated by the conformation of the Appalachians, Tennessee and Kentucky on one side, Georgia and the Carolinas on the other. The alternative name for these tunes is 'white spirituals', and they seem to have belonged to the white settlers whose culture and economic status was normally so depressed as to get them the name of 'poor whites'. In the great controversy with the negroes the part played by members of this sob-group was, we are bound to say, discreditable.

But their hymnody turns out, now that scholars have been unearthing it, to be quite remarkably colourful, and a notable contrast to the commonplace and inhibited idiom of the Lowell Mason school. The best introduction to it for Englishmen is the tune PLEADING SAVIOUR, which R.V.W. set to a children's hymn in *EH* [No. 593]; but *EH* has another from the same cellar—ADVENT [342] which looks very much like a minor-mode form of the tune very well known to Dissenters as HULL [*M* 531: *CP* 607]. These are, one must say at once, about as good examples of the style as AURELIA is of S. S. Wesley's, although even here, in PLEADING SAVIOUR, one can note a pentatonic vocabulary which suggests a remote Scottish origin. But looking through the folk melodies in *The Mennonite Hymnal* I can hear other echoes of Scotland (in RESTORATION, 243, and NEW CONCORD, 272), of Wales quite certainly (in ZION'S PILGRIM, 273, which with a sharpened leading note could have come direct from any Bethesda), and of Ireland (in SOCIAL BAND, 147, which is a first cousin of KINGSFOLD, and, I think, in VERNON, 322). This wouldn't be at all historically improbable; for are not all the Fergusons and McKays and Sandersons to be found in North Carolina, and almost as many Joneses in Georgia and Virginia? This is the stock from which these communities came, and so, obviously, did their hymnody. A look through the *Original Sacred Harp* and Wueh's *Repository* shows how much this folk hymnody owes to the Celtic traditions. Its considerable debt to the Methodist English tradition is much less celebrated in *The Mennonite Hymnal*: that is culturally understandable enough.

It is interesting also to find some plainsong in this new book,

and a sprinkling of new tunes, including one (would that there were more) by Daniel Moe [616]. There is plenty of the 19th century evangelical stuff too—but that is taken over from the 1940 book mostly, together with a certain amount of regular hymnody from the rather bleak period of American conventionality. But there is a good deal of Genevan song, and there are many well-edited Lutheran tunes.

In fact, the book shows a far more sophisticated approach to hymnody, and a much greater readiness to share with the praises of neighbouring traditions, than the Mennonites have shown before: and this is in large measure due to the remarkable work done by the committee's Executive Secretary, Dr Mary Oyer of Goshen College, Indiana. The Committee was fortunate in getting the services of a first-class secular musician who is also a devout member of the Mennonite Church. The really significant thing is that this is probably the first generation in which anybody could be both those things at once. How wise, as well as fortunate, they were in using this quite remarkable talent! It is to Dr Oyer that we owe most of the discoveries and arrangements from that folk tradition which gives the book its chief interest and character.

Moving on now to the Moravian book, we come into a quite different climate. Although the Moravian tradition is as old as the Mennonite, and comes also from central Europe, and has remained something of a minority tradition in the U.S.A., it has never been associated with the pugnacious philistinism that characterized the older Mennonites. It was, as it were, Wesleyan where the Mennonites were fervently puritan. The hymnic tradition here is, as might be expected, more evidently Lutheran; but the Lutheran tunes which appear in this book in great numbers would cause raised eyebrows in any contemporary Lutheran community, anyhow in the U.S.A., because the musical tradition which the Moravians particularly favour is that associated with Christian Grigor.

What warms the heart in the Mennonite book is its respect for sources and originals; at first sight the versions in which familiar Lutheran tunes appear in the Moravian book are by that standard chilling indeed. But the point is that for the Moravian congregations Grigor is original. We note 35 ascriptions to Grigor in the composers' index, but many more tunes are taken from his *Choralbuch der Evangelischen Brudergemeine* (1784), and what happens to them is, to my own eye, a sociological *locus classicus*. You think that *Hymns A & M* was unkind to EISENACH (well, I do), and that Mendelssohn ruined NUN DANKET (well, I most certainly do): have a look at the PASSION CHORALE in this book [123]. Without a number of music examples I can't do much to communicate the shocks you would get, but try over the first two lines of the PASSION

CHORALE, but for the second phrase play:—

B/ - C - B - A - Gs/ - A

and for the fifth phrase:—

B/ C - G - A - B/ - C

For WACHET AUF (in C major) try it like this at the opening:—

C - e-fs - G - G / A - C - B - A / G

and for the cadence line (3, 6, 11):—

G/ C - G - A - g-f/ E - D - C

(small notes mean quavers: underlines mean slurs).

So one could go on. And before you slam the book shut in wrath (the sort of wrath we encountered in the matter of Dearmer's recension of Neale), just remember that the gorgeous tune we all sing to 'Of the Father's love begotten' appears in an older and entirely respectable version in equal notes before ever *Piae Cantiones* made it into the heavenly dance we are used to—and the Americans commonly sing it so. The Moravians do—there it is at 221!

We all know how useless it is to be 'fundamentalist' in these matters—a customary alteration occasionally gains favour while we still hold to the principle that 'the old is better'. (In connection with which, and very much at a tangent, some of us were vastly amused when recently a very eminent evangelical divine in a fervent book attributed that expression to our Lord. Oh no: 'the old is better' is not a dominical principle, however well approved it may be in association with wine and hymns.) It's still arguable that J.S.B. was a better musician than Grigor, and that what he did with WACHET AUF is less vandalistic than what Grigor did: and then back we go to the rest of the controversy, whether Bach's rich harmony or Nicolai's syncopated rhythm matches better the need and mood of a congregation at worship.

So it won't do to moralize about this Grigor cult of the Moravians. All one can do is to record the opinion that when Grigor has ironed out all the old chorales to his shape, and taught them 18th-century etiquette, the chorales look like so many grey-top-hatted gentlemen at a garden party. Elegant—but a shade inhibited?

The Moravians are a highly sacramental community, and the earlier part of this book consists of 200 pages of liturgical material, including the texts of a large number of eucharistic hymns (transcribed from the body of the book) appointed to be sung at the Communion on various specified occasions. The tunes for these hymns are in the body of the book, but they are not invariably set

to these texts. The indexes are comprehensive and easy to use, and there are even tables for the finding of Easter Day up to the year 2100, and short notes appended to the names in the authors' and composers' indexes. There is very little contemporary material, as might be expected in a book serving a community with so weighty an 18th-century singing tradition—but that apart, the selection of hymns is wide and rational. This book, anyhow, is as good a source for Grigor as its 1914 English counterpart was for Samuel Sebastian Wesley!

The *Luther Worship Supplement*, available in a melody edition for the congregation and a harmony edition for the organist, is, in the language of the country, something else again. This is a book of 93 hymns designed equally to supplement the contents of the *Lutheran Hymnal* (1941), associated with the Missouri Synod Lutheran connexion, and the *Service Book and Hymnal* (1958), prepared for the then newly united American Lutheran Church. This is the first enterprise of the kind in which the Missouri Synod has collaborated with the others. The 1941 book was full of splendid chorales and of somewhat oppressive English translations of pietistic hymns, and was the ground for the Missouri Synod's habitually superior manner when speaking of the customs of other Lutherans in music; the 1958 book had a much wider range of texts, but had drunk deep of every known European musical corruption, and showed many signs of editorial panic in its anxiety to give ground whenever possible to those who enjoyed tunes like ST LEONARD and KIRBY BEDON. Both books showed clear signs of being out of date, and the chance to produce something which would give a forward thrust, instead of a backward nudge, to Lutheran hymnody was a good one.

These editors took it. I have rarely seen a book of this length that, as it were, got so much said that was worth saying. *Hymns and Songs* is the obvious competitor. *Worship Supplement* is really on that level. There was no room, and no need, for junk; but one might have feared for missed chances.

In the first place there is the occasional scholarly gesture, in which connexion I would especially invite our readers to notice how this book prints the tune DAS NEUGEBOERNE KINDELEIN [717], and others of the same style and period. Anglicizing editors have always made waltzes of this kind of tune—see for example SP 80 and EH 69 ii:—

This little Babe so few days old

1 1 1 2 1 2 1 2

where the much more characteristic rhythm originally was:—

This little Babe so few days old

1 1 1 3 1 1 1 2

Sing it so, and at once the cross-rhythm of 6/4 and 3/2 comes through—without the least distortion of verbal emphasis. Try this with IN DIR IST FREUDE [768]—not In thee is glad-ness, A-mid all sad-ness, but 'In thee is gladness, Amid all sadness'. The first two lines in each group are 3/2, the third line 6/4: what you miss when your editor doesn't bring that out!

The second eye-opener is in the new material, which includes both texts and tunes. I liked this a good deal [758]:—

O God, O Lord of heaven and earth,
thy living finger never wrote
that life should be an aimless mote,
a deathward drift from futile birth.
Thy word meant life triumphant hurled
through every cranny of thy world.
Since light awoke and life began
thou hast desired thy life for man.

Our fatal will to equal thee,
our rebel will, wrought death and night.
We seized and used in thy despite
the wondrous gift of liberty.
We housed us in this house of doom,
where death had royal scope and room,
until thy Servant, Prince of peace,
breached all its walls for our release.

That is by Martin H. Franzmann (b. 1907) and goes to a good tune in the chorale style called WITTENBERG NEW, by Jan Bender (b. 1909). It has a calamitous final line which I hope will soon be rewritten:—

Each life a high doxology
to Father, Son and unto Thee.

I would also direct attention to 'O Kingly love' [757], 'In Adam we have all been one' [759] and to the tune MISSION [761]. Check by jowl with restored Lutheran treasures like TER SANCTUS [771] these and other new offerings impart a sense of spring and energy to the collection. A touch of curiosity is similarly generated by a 19-verse hymn for saints' days—one hymn for the lot, in which you sing verse 1 and verse 3 and in between whichever verse is relevant; this marathon was written, we gather, by Horatio, Lord Nelson. No—not George Target's 'one-armed adulterer' but a descendant (1823–1913). Somebody will write in and tell me which underworld English hymn book first included it.

The third thing about this remarkable book is the provision of a separate organ copy. I expect that Lutheran organists in the U.S.A. will feel encouraged to ignore the words by this provision. Mostly,

I rather think, they do already. But at least they should be interested in the arrangements here given. Every tune which wasn't positively composed by some reputable contemporary has been reharmonized, and always in two versions, a simple one for piano or manuals-only instrument and a slightly more sophisticated one for the organ. Where it's DOWN AMPNEY, R.V.W.'s own harmonies are at least admitted, but the 'simple' version, harmonized on quite different principles, is added (and all I can say is that these Lutherans must have a powerful personality to get permission out of the R.V.W. literary executors to do *that!*).

But these reharmonizations, always for unison singing and always contrapuntal in their musical ethos, are fascinating. Often they're really beautiful (I thought DOWN AMPNEY, for example, a complete success). And anybody who browses in this organ edition will receive some new and fertilizing ideas about the harmonization of tunes in the hymnals of the future. Don't do it as they've done LOVE UNKNOWN [725] but study long and hard what they did with Gobbons's SONG 20 [762].

This does raise the point about the tyranny of four-part writing, which is so largely responsible for the monotonous texture of hymn writers' thought in the recent past. Accompaniments of this kind presuppose rhythmic and alert singing—there's often no steadily moving pedal part to push the congregation along. And perhaps all these suspensions and tied notes and three-part open chords might produce a certain lassitude in their interminable *legato*. Still—they open a window that needed opening.

That reminds me that very recently, well after the publication of the book, the Mennonites produced a short book of *Hymn Tune Preludes for the Mennonite Hymnal*, 1969, consisting of 28 preludes designed to replace the 'playover' (as the 'chorale-prelude' was originally designed for) tunes in the new book. It is worth getting hold of (apply to Dr Mary Oyer, Goshen College, Goshen, Indiana, 46526, who will advise about the price). The need for proper introductions and interludes for well-known hymns is beginning to press, and the Americans are answering it energetically.

To conclude: although I can't tell you the price of any of these books, I would recommend any of them for English hymnologists to study. The Lutheran one is the most adventurous and thought-provoking: the Moravian one is historically fascinating and controversial as regards music: the Mennonite one is very exciting as a disseminator of the best traditional American hymnody. And with its 'Prelude' companion, you have a very good festal version of 'What Wondrous love'. Look at them for yourselves.

Donald Hughes, *Headmaster* (Ed. Percy Heywood, published at Rydal School, Colwyn Bay, 30s.).

Addicts of our conferences in recent years will remember Donald Hughes personally, and hymnologists will know of his small but distinguished contribution to hymn-writing (for which see principally *HCS* and *Hymns and Songs*). But this biographical and memorial volume deserves commendation to a wider audience. Less than half the book is biographical: the greater part consists of Hughes's own writings, and our own readers will recognize with delight both 'Neo Matins' and what is perhaps the best thing we ever published in these pages, 'Hymns in School Chapel', among the preserved papers.

There are a few sermons also, and some other controversial pieces, and a handful of poems, and through them all you hear a voice which speaks of the Christian faith with the kind of gentle and humane firmness that a generation ago we associated with Bernard Manning. Hughes doesn't conceal his antipathy to *Honest to God* and all kindred literature, but he is quite incapable of being unjust or unkind. Neither does he conceal his belief that school chapel is a good thing—nor his more surprising belief that school assembly is a good thing which shouldn't be abolished. People who are discussing such matters shouldn't be without this book which contains the best statements of the case in those directions—a case rather often dismissed without hearing—that can be handily found.

Only two of his hymns are in the collection at the end—our readers will think that was a pity. The editor has put in his recension of 'God be with you' and his original text of 'Creator of the earth and sky' of which I should say that I agree with him in preferring it, despite the more modern sound of the new version, to the revision in *Hymns and Songs*. I wish he had found room for CREDO as well [*HS* 6]. The biographical chapters are soberly assembled but those who knew him will perhaps feel that their style is a shade externalized, despite the fact that he had no more devoted disciple than his biographer.

But this man, whom we were honoured to have as a member of the Society for a year or two at the end of his life, was a quite notable example of the Christian headmaster who still believed that Christianity had a cutting edge. Since that race is disappearing so fast it is a very good thing indeed that his friends have put together this book which will do something towards perpetuating what during his life he gave to his profession and his Master.

E.R.

VENI IMMANUEL

AN EDITORIAL APOLOGY

We are very sorry that in Dr Pocknee's article on VENI IMMANUEL, *Bulletin* 118, the second page of photostat was not what Dr Pocknee meant us to print. It was, as discerning readers have observed, part of something quite different. However, this has prompted two most interesting letters.

Dear Dr Routley,

I have been away for a few days, and have only just found my copy of the new *Bulletin*. It is grand to have the photograph of the original of the melody of 'O come Emmanuel'—or rather, of the first part of it, because the second page (67) is obviously not continuous with the first, either in words or in music; indeed, the catch-note at the bottom of p. 66 is sufficient to show this, apart from anything else. The second page is interesting, however, as the melody is the concluding portion of the melody of 'Victimae Paschali', the Easter sequence (end of v. 7, and vv. 8 and 9 in *EH* 130), and the words are an adaptation of those verses of 'Victimae Paschali', made for some feast or commemoration of Saint Francis (this is not surprising, since the manuscript apparently came from a convent of Franciscan nuns). Mr Pocknee's remarks about Helmore having altered the melody for the refrain of 'O come, etc.' seem to be based on the assumption that what is printed on p. 67 is a continuation of p. 66. Reference to the transcript (in modern notation) printed in *The Musical Times* for November 1966 (vol. 107, p. 968) shows that there has been no such alteration. It would, of course, be useful to have a photograph of the actual continuation of p. 66 as it appears in the manuscript.

I see that in *An Introduction to the Gregorian Melodies: A Handbook of Plainsong*, by P. Wagner, 2nd ed., Part 1 (published 1901), translated by Agnes Orme and E. G. P. Wyatt, London, Pl. & Med. Music Soc., p. 235, Wagner says that 'numerous imitations (sc. of the "Victimae Paschali") were composed in honour of the Blessed Virgin and other saints, with which the favourite and triumphant melody of Wipo could be used', and (footnote) 'I have printed two of them in the *Gregoriusblatt*, Aachen 1896, Nos. 11 foll.' It might be worth looking this up. The words of the original of which those printed on p. 67 are an adaptation, are:—

... in Galilaeam.

Credendum est magis soli
Mariae veraci
quam Judaeorum turbae fallaci.
Scimus Christum surrexisse
a mortuis vere;
tu nobis, victor Rex, miserere.

I notice that on p. 65 the number of the Paris manuscript is stated as 10851, but on p. 69 as 10581. Mother Thomas More, in *The Musical Times* for September 1966 (vol. 107, No. 1483, p. 772, fn. 4) gives its number as 10.581 (*sic*, with full point).

In the *Westminster Hymnal*, new and revised edition, 1940, No. 232, a Latin version of the hymn is printed, consisting of seven verses, beginning with 'O Sapientia', and with the verses in the order of the Great O's as given at *EH* 734, omitting, of course, 'O virgo virginum', which does not occur in the Roman Use and in consequence in the Roman Use the Great Anthems begin on December 17th, and not as with us on December 16th. I assume that all seven of the *Westminster Hymnal*'s verses are genuine 1710 material, and that Ronnie Knox did not make up the other two for completeness.

With kind regards,

Yours sincerely,

A. L. PECK.

Christ's College,
Cambridge.

Dear Editor,

Page 67 of *Bulletin* 118 has nothing to do with page 66, but is the tail-end of the Easter Sequence (*EH* 130; *AMR* 138) with parodied words, apparently from a Franciscan source.

In referring to the complete words and two-part music of 'Bone Jesu' given in the *Musical Times* for November 1966, your own article in *Bulletin* 108 (to which Dr Pocknee refers) rightly pointed out how faithful Helmore had been to the original melody. Dr Pocknee's reference to a 'considerable adaptation' at 'Rejoice, rejoice' must be disregarded.

As to the words: the original antiphons are seven not eight in number, 'O Virgo Virginum' being a later addition, long since excised in continental use, where the series begins a day later than the entry in the *Book of Common Prayer*. The *Anglican Prayer Book of South Africa* gives the seven, and the *Supplement to the Indian Prayer Book* the eight. In last year's revision of the *Proper of the Roman Mass* the antiphons appear on their respective days as the Alleluya-verses before the Gospel.

As Dr Frost indicated under *HCAM* 49 (to which Dr Pocknee refers), if the titles of the antiphons are read in reverse order they form the words ERO CRAS. This can be easily seen from *EH* 734 or, in metre, from *Westminster Hymnal* 232. (The 'Tomorrow' theme characterises the antiphons for the morning of Christmas Eve, at the conclusion of the Great 'O' series). The familiar 'O come, O come, Emmanuel' version, therefore, simply puts the acrostic the right way round, only omitting 'O Rex Gentium' and 'O

Sapientia' before and after the present last verse—and allowing 'Virgula' to do duty for 'Radix' (i.e. swopping Isaiah xi 1 with xi 10). The two missing stanzas can be supplied from *Plainsong Hymnbook* 145.

Yours sincerely,

KENNETH D. SMITH.

College of St Matthias,
Fishponds, Bristol.

NEW MEMBERS—JUNE 1st, 1969—MAY 31st, 1970

W. R. Carter, Esq., 24 Strathfield Gardens, Barking, Essex.

Miss E. Chisholm, 3 Lower Park Road, Loughton, Essex.

D. I. Dowson, Esq., 43 Auckland Road, Doncaster, Yorkshire.

The Revd Canon H. C. A. Gaunt, 57 Canon Street, Winchester, Hants.

The Revd A. J. Liddon, 9 Gunton Cliff, Lowestoft, Suffolk.

The Revd A. H. F. Luff, The Vicarage, Penmaenmawr, Caernarvonshire.

Mr D. I. McMurtrie, 40 Nursery Street, Hornsby, Sydney, N.S.W., Australia 2077.

Mrs G. L. Oliver, 8 Onslow Gardens, London, E.18.

Miss I. Parry-Jones, 233 Elgin Avenue, London, W.9.

P. Perry, Esq., Grange Wood, Munstead, Godalming, Surrey.

The Revd J. N. Pickering, 23 Broomfield Lane, London, N.13.

The Revd Fr W. Purney, 970 Harrow Road, Sudbury, Wembley, Middlesex HA0 2QE.

The Revd G. H. Sansome, 36 Burns Avenue, Liscard, Wallasey, Cheshire L45 4RD.

E. J. E. Sloan, Esq., 12 Minterne Avenue, Sittingbourne, Kent.

The Revd M. L. Steer, 25 High Road, Rayleigh, Essex.

The Revd D. Streeter, 15 Highfields, Saffron Walden, Essex.

The Revd J. Ticehurst, 60 Hill Road, Weston-super-Mare, Somerset.

Miss M. N. Toller, 24 Frithwood Avenue, Northwood, Middlesex.

The Very Revd E. M. Webber, The Dean's Office, 125 Macquarie Street, Hobart, Tasmania 7000.

C. P. Woolley, Esq., 195 Conisborough Crescent, London, S.E.6.

Mrs V. N. K. Wren, 10 Poltimore Road, Guildford, Surrey.