

THE HYMN SOCIETY

OF GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND

BULLETIN

VOLUME THREE

NUMBER ONE

DECEMBER, 1951

Editor: REV. ERIK R. ROUTLEY, M.A., B.D.,
17 Norham Road, Oxford.

Hon. Secretary: REV. F. B. MERRYWEATHER,
Temporary Address: 30 Grove Road, Stratford-on-Avon, Warwickshire.

CONTENTS

Editorial	- - - - -	1
Reviews:		
<i>The B.B.C. Hymn Book</i> , by Leonard Blake	- - -	2
Ecumenical Hymnody, by K. L. Parry, <i>Cantate Domino</i>		12
<i>Music in Church</i>	- - -	14
<i>Negro Spirituals</i>	- - -	16
<i>Sing Praises</i>	- - -	17
A Prayer Manuel, <i>The Spiritual Friend</i> , by L. H. Bunn	-	17
Three Occasional Articles	- - -	18
Subscriptions	- - -	19
Advance Notices	- - -	19

EDITORIAL

With this issue we enter on our third volume. The years covered by our second volume (1948-51) have been sufficiently eventful. They have been years of great loss for us. Gillman, Christie, and Millar Patrick have gone. May their devoted work live after them in a faithful and energetic Society. Gone too are several distinguished figures in hymnody — David Evans and W. H. Ferguson especially. But during this same period our field has been enriched by the accession of two hymn books of major importance, *Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised* and the *B.B.C. Hymn Book*, and two others of hardly less significance in their own fields, the *Methodist School Hymn Book* and the new *Public School Hymn Book*.

Relations with our American friends have grown closer. Dr. McAll's visit in 1951 put new heart into some of us, and the regular appearance of *The Hymn*, founded two years ago, has kept us in closer touch with American work in this field. Please turn to our back page to learn of, and then to act upon, the latest development in these relations.

Julian makes steady progress under the masterly guidance of L. H. Bunn. His appointment is our most notable achievement of the period.

We have welcomed a number of new members and lost some old friends. Our Conferences have achieved less than we had hoped and given us cause to examine new possibilities.

So we emerge into another imponderable year, and we had better not enter upon it in the spirit of editorial platitude. We are a small company and our contemporaries do not yet know as much about us as they should. We must avoid a complacent and apathetic acquiescence in this. We must decide what we have to say, and say it wherever we can. It is not for the Editor to make such a decision in the Society's name; but the decision must be made, and made constantly. This Society stands for the responsible assessment of hymns and hymn books, the pursuit of diligent and single-minded research, and for co-operation with other bodies in the war against sentimentality and unreality in public praise; we exist for the encouragement of the best and the discerning censure of the second-rate. We exist not for the discussion, still less for the propagation, of our private hunches and hobbies. We are part of the Church of Christ, drawn towards each other, but never away from our Christian neighbours, by our common interest and conviction. May it be given to us, especially, perhaps, at our coming Cambridge Conference, to make some solid contribution of this kind to the equipment and life of our churches.

THE B.B.C. HYMN BOOK¹

by LEONARD BLAKE.

Sooner or later it was to be expected that the B.B.C. would feel the need for a hymn book of its own, either for the convenience of those taking part in studio services, thus saving constant recourse to a variety of hymnals, or to meet the requests of listeners to these services. The book would have appeared several years ago but for the War, and curiosity as to its contents had run high by the time that publication was announced at the beginning of last October.

Introducing the book to listeners in a broadcast on October 7th, its Editor-in-chief, Dr. W. K. Stanton, observed that the task of the Compilers, when they started on it in 1937, was a novel one.

¹ O.U.P. Full music edition, 12/6, words only, 6/-.

He might have added that this novelty was also a measure of the Compilers' opportunity and responsibility. Almost every hymnal is addressed to a particular denomination, or a closed society like a school, but the *B.B.C. Hymn Book* is to serve the widest possible field. Its contents will be heard day after day by people who attend places of worship of every kind, and by countless others who seldom go inside a church or chapel. The B.B.C.'s choice of words and tunes will imperceptibly but inevitably create standards for many of these people. What is new in the book will have far more chance of being sung and heard and of impressing itself upon public consciousness than the new material in any denominational book. The B.B.C.'s power to "plug" or withhold any given hymn or type of hymn, should it so choose, is terrifying.

The contents of the new book should reassure anyone who fears abuse of this power. It is not free from idiosyncrasies: one questions its inclusion of some things and its omission of others. This review will not spare it from detailed criticism: but at the outset let us acknowledge in general the breadth of vision, sanity and sense of responsibility which the Compilers have shown.

The numbering of the contents runs to 542, comprising 449 hymns so designated, 49 metrical psalms and Bible paraphrases, many of which are familiar as hymns in most other books, and 44 "Choir Settings". About 20 sets of words are duplicated under different numbers for one reason or another. The *Veni Creator*, for example, appears among the hymns with its plainsong melody (in two forms), and among the Choir Settings with Attwood's tune. "Love divine", in 8-line stanzas to HYFRYDOL, is 328, and in 4-line stanzas to Stainer's tune is 329. "Now the day is over" is printed in full, and recommended for young children, as 419: over the page, as 420, it is shorn of three stanzas — while still set to EUDOXIA — presumably being considered more suitable for adults in this truncated form. (Would it not have been sufficient to "star" the three stanzas which are considered juvenile?)

The choice of hymns shows a balanced regard for all the main traditions, and the Compilers have been healthily conscious of what a hymn is *not*, as well as cautious in admitting new material. While many of the distinctive elements of *E.H.* and *S.P.* are here, including certain hymns and tunes which *A.M.R.* had perforce to omit, there is a conspicuous and welcome freedom from the more questionable characteristics of *S.P.*, such as its watering-down of theology and the preciousness of some of its specially-written contributions. Of the modern writers who loomed large in *S.P.*, Percy Dearmer is represented only by two original hymns and three translations, Jan Struther by one hymn, and G. W. Briggs by nothing at all.

The generally conservative character of the collection, as far as words go, may be judged from the following table, showing how it

compares with *A.M.R.* in its representation of standard authors and translators :—

	<i>B.B.C.</i>	<i>A.M.R.</i>
C. Wesley	26	30
Watts	21	17
Montgomery	11	11
H. W. Baker	7	11
Ellerton	7	11
Heber	7	11
Doddridge	6	5
Walsham How	6	8
Newton	5	7
Neale (translations)	32	46
C. Winkworth (trans.)	14	6
Caswall (translations)	12	15
Chandler (translations)	8	10

Allowing for a total content of 100 less in the *B.B.C. Hymn Book* than in *A.M.R.*, the numbers are strikingly similar, the most notable difference being in the *B.B.C.*'s greater use of Catherine Winkworth's translations from the German (mostly to chorale settings by Bach).

Properly enough, in view of the book's immediate purpose, there is a bias towards objective sentiment. Hymns like "Abide with me", "Rock of ages", "Nearer my God, to thee" and "Lead, kindly light" are likely to be as indispensable as "Jerusalem" for some time to come: but it is not surprising to find here only five out of the twenty-three Hymns of Personal Devotion which are in *A.M.R.*

The number of verses in many hymns is reduced. At first one wondered whether studio requirements could have dictated this, but as plenty of long hymns are given in full, some having verses marked with an asterisk for optional omission, that could not be the reason. The principle of the *cento* is long-established and honourable: but why, for example, omit the 4th verse of "Dear Shepherd of thy people, hear"? (and, incidentally, why change "unbosom" in verse 3 to "unburden"?). "Jerusalem the golden" loses its 4th verse, "Angel-voices, ever singing" its 2nd, and so on, in one well-known hymn after another. Of course, "When I survey" is printed without its finest verse, beginning "His dying crimson, like a robe". The squeamishness which objects to that has puzzled me ever since boyhood, for that simile has always conveyed to me in a unique way the glory of the Cross, transfiguring the ghastly physical reality into a vision of Christ triumphant.

The hymns are arranged under subject-headings, as in *R.C.H.* and other nonconformist books, and there is no section called "General Hymns". In effect all hymns thus become "general", which may be a good thing if it leads to an imaginative use of

certain hymns which are apt to be treated in a narrowly seasonal way. The arrangement should not seriously inconvenience anyone wishing to find hymns for the various seasons of the Church's year, most of which are fully provided for in their accustomed order between Nos. 29 and 170. Lenten hymns, however, are mainly to be found in the later sections entitled "Repentance and forgiveness" and "Prayer and self-discipline". There are copious cross-references at the end of every section.

In their Preface the Compilers mention almost casually that they have tried to make the book complete for use in churches by including a number of hymns, mainly for the sacraments, which could hardly be needed in studio services. Presumably they also had church requirements in mind when indicating hymns suitable for processions and hymns for young children, though the latter are so few as to make them seem out of place: one of them (353) could well have been omitted, with its nursery jingle about the saints who can be met

"in school, or in lanes, or at sea,

In church, or in trains, or in shops, or at tea".

It will be interesting to see how many Anglican churches adopt a book which is not arranged on the pattern of the leading Anglican hymnals, which in its provision for saints' days is by no means a full "companion to the Book of Common Prayer", and which gives special prominence to Scottish psalmody. Equally it will be interesting to see how the Free Churches react to so generous a provision of medieval Office hymns and their plainsong melodies.

On the purely mundane level, the excellent set-up and compactness of the book, which make it so attractive to handle and read from, will be offset for many churches by its price.

A survey of the new and unfamiliar material which the Compilers have introduced shows Dr. C. A. Alington as the highest scorer among living writers, with five hymns, three of which are in *A.M.R.* Father Timothy Rees contributes four, of which "O crucified Redeemer" (85) is an outstanding addition to the hymns of Passiontide. Other notable hymns for this season are the two versions of Abélard's *Solus ad victimam procedis, Domine* — No. 79, by F. B. Tucker, and No. 502, by Helen Waddell. While many of the new hymns are relevant to contemporary thought and needs the Compilers have avoided outlandishness: e.g. H. H. Tweedy's "Eternal God, whose power upholds Both flower and flaming star" (23), a dignified missionary prayer; R. B. Y. Scott's "O day of God, draw nigh" (24), simple and cogent; H. E. Fosdick's "God of grace and God of glory" (391), one of several borrowings from the new Hymnal of the American Episcopal Church. Three hymns of John Arlott (431, 435, 440), forming a sequence for Plough Sunday, Rogationtide and Harvest, have a terse and picturesque sincerity. Less convincing is Andrew Young's hymn for Lammas-tide (437). "Rejoice, O people, in the mounting years" (181), by

A. F. Bayly, is an impressive hymn on the theme of the Church Universal, in a first-rate section of the book entitled "The Church of God: its commission and work". The 25 hymns for Holy Communion include little that is unfamiliar, but a translation from the Didache by F. B. Tucker (201) and two stanzas of invocation to the Holy Spirit, by A. J. Mason (205) should be mentioned, together with a hymn by R. G. Parsons (218) which is in *A.M.R.* Dr. Alington's marriage hymn from the same book is included (222), with an even better one by E. A. Welch (223). Greville Cooke's hymn for a country church (261), with its tune, seems a trifle precious; more a Choir Setting than a hymn, perhaps. Often one finds an interesting juxtaposition of the familiar with the unfamiliar, as when a simple personal prayer by the late Father Andrew (358) is followed by "O God of truth", and when Lilian Stevenson's delightful translation of *Schönster Herr Jesu* (138, 139) is discovered between "Christ, whose glory fills the skies" and "Guide me, O thou great Redeemer" (the former *not* being grouped, for once, among morning hymns).

Omissions to be noted, though not necessarily regretted, include "Hark, a thrilling voice is sounding", "When God of old came down from heaven", "The Lord is risen indeed", "O strength and stay" and "The radiant morn". Among the many hymns of Watts it is surprising not to find "God of the morning". One notable omission from what might be called the *E. H.* stock of hymns is George Herbert's "Teach me, my God and King". Perhaps its 4th verse is considered undemocratic, like the "rich man, poor man" verse of "All things bright and beautiful" (3).

I find myself more perturbed by the deletion of verses from many hymns, and by what often seem unnecessary changes of wording, than by any wholesale omissions. A few hymns appear superfluous, e.g. "All glory to God in the sky" (29), which has an irritating dactylic rhythm and, to my mind, an unfortunate first line; "Look, ye saints, and see how glorious" (127) — especially its last verse; "Behold, the temple of the Lord" (171), with a second line that is liable to misapprehension. I have to admit that my taste for Scottish paraphrases is not yet fully formed.

THE MUSIC

The name of the Editor-in-chief was a guarantee that the selection of tunes would range wide, that a high standard of taste would operate, and that weakly sentiment would be avoided. There is a feast of good things, from the many plainsong melodies (harmonised by Dr. E. T. Cook) to the modern newcomers. The influence of books like the *Yattendon Hymnal* and *Songs of Syon* is reflected in the number of tunes ascribed to Bach, Bourgeois and Gibbons, many of the more elaborate of these falling into the category of Choir Settings. There are plenty of the English traditional melodies, Rouen church melodies and Welsh tunes which have

come into general currency through *E.H.* and *S.P.*; and tunes drawn from *R.C.H.* are a natural complement to the large number of Scottish paraphrases in the book. One sees, e.g. by the inclusion of *ST. PETERSBURG* (300) and *FRESHWATER* (537), that the Compilers have not been oblivious of *A. & M.*, but the signs of its influence might have been greater had the Revised Edition appeared earlier than 1950. Oddly enough, the two tunes quoted are among those which were dropped by *A.M.R.*, another being Sir Hugh Allen's *MIDIAN* (339). From the *P.S.H.B.* (original edition) there are several characteristic tunes by W. H. Ferguson, of which *ST. VALENTINE* (448) is the most distinguished, and *CUDDESDON* (65, 120) the least inspired. Other public school tunes are *WOODLANDS* (326), by W. H. Greatorex; R. S. Thatcher's *LESSINGTON* (416) for "Hail, gladdening light", which is also provided with Stainer's *SEBASTE* among the Choir Settings (514); and H. A. Dyer's *BROMSGROVE* (235) and *HERBERT* (275), the latter securing admission at the expense of Harwood's *LUCKINGTON*.

Of the Victorians, Barnby does not appear; there are two tunes each by Stainer and Elvey, five by Dykes, six by Smart and eight each by Gauntlett and W. H. Monk. Of modern composers specially identified with *S.P.*, Martin Shaw is represented solely by *MARCHING* (186), Geoffrey Shaw not at all, and Vaughan Williams only by *DOWN AMPNEY* (149) and *SINE NOMINE* (227). K. G. Finlay is unfortunately absent, and it is hard to understand the complete neglect of Sydney Nicholson, who, whatever his other limitations as a musician, had an undeniable gift for writing hymn-tunes. It is true that the *B.B.C.* book contains few of the hymns to which his tunes are set in *A. & M.*; but *BOW BRICKHILL* (*A.M.R.* 215) was surely worth a place, *CHISLEHURST* (*A.M.R.* 610) could have been an alternative to the rather monotonous *LLANFAIR* (125), and *FENITON* (*A.M.R.* 392) would make an admirable Choir Setting.

The absence of excellent tunes by Finlay, Nicholson and other modern writers throws into sharp relief the profusion of new tunes by three of the Compilers. Between them Dr. Stanton, the Rev. C. V. Taylor and Dr. Thalben-Ball have supplied music for no less than 59 hymns. Their contributions and some of the other new tunes shall be discussed later: meanwhile a few general features of the book, and some criticisms, may be tabulated:—

(1) The very first tune, *STRACATHRO*, set in D flat, illustrates a policy of transposing downwards for congregational singing — a clear sign that the Compilers have all along had one eye upon church use, for the skilled *B.B.C.* Singers and their accompanists cannot need such transposition. There is some inconsistency, however, in the matter of pitch. If it is desirable to put *ANGELS' SONG* (224, 245, 406) into E major, can the retention of G major for *MENDELSSOHN* (50) be defended? or the third line of *ZENNOR* (295)? or the start, on top E flat, of an extraordinary tune called *SALONICA* (388)?

(2) Hymn 5 is the first of a great many which have alternative tunes (incidentally TUGWOOD, the alternative here, is one of the few tunes which may be said to be overworked in this book, for three appearances are certainly more than its melodic interest deserves). Every plainsong melody has a "modern" alternative, and where a unison tune is not also given in a four-part version an alternative tune in harmony is generally provided; but there are no cross-references to alternative tunes. It would be useful, for example, to have a reference to DIX at 272 ("For the beauty of the earth"), or to WAREHAM or WARRINGTON at 263 ("Jesus, where'er thy people meet"), which is dully served by SIMEON.

(3) Gathering notes are preserved in some of the Psalter tunes, but omitted from others, e.g. ST. FLAVIAN (210) and WINCHESTER OLD (61). In this connection I regret the disappearance of the semibreve at the beginning of the seventh line of FOREST GREEN (56) — admittedly a point which congregations have been known to stumble over; but the forward urge which the semibreve gives here is to my mind a vital feature, not unlike Beethoven's famous rhythmic point in the great theme of the Finale to the Ninth Symphony.

The treatment of gathering notes is not the only instance of arbitrariness which the Compilers have shown towards established tunes. The lovely opening rhythm of LES COMMANDEMENS DE DIEU (201, 447) has been ironed out, and O TRAUIGKEIT (96) has been "minimised". HAREWOOD (258) has been "adapted", as the ascription puts it, in a way that splits its first eight bars into four little phrases, whereas Wesley's original spans four bars (i.e. two lines of words) at a time. Sometimes adaptation is not acknowledged, as in Irons's ST. COLUMBA (428), where both rhythm and harmony have been noticeably and unnecessarily changed. Stanford's ENGELBERG (118) presents an even more flagrant instance of changes made without acknowledgment. Transposition from G to F does no great harm; but enough is done — including the provision of a "harmony" version that Stanford would have snorted at — to call for strong protest.

It is questionable whether this tune ought to have been used to any other words than "For all the saints". The B.B.C. would have done well to include it, in its full form, as an alternative to SINE NOMINE (227). Perhaps in 1952, the centenary of Stanford's birth, ENGELBERG may come into its own and prove that SINE NOMINE has at least an equal, if not a superior.

(4) Amen is only printed after Doxologies, but ENGELBERG is a case of a tune which is not complete without the Amen which its composer wrote. Percy Buck's GONFALON ROYAL (91²) fortunately gets its Amen, which some books have omitted.

(5) A slur is used where adjacent vowel sounds between two words have to be sung to the same note, e.g. "The-unwearied sun"; "many-a generation".

(6) I first heard ANIMAE HOMINUM (20) in choirboy days, but have never seen it in print or known the name of its composer until now. It is one of the last tunes I should have expected to find in this book, and seems to me one of the Compilers' few lapses into mawkishness. Their arrangement of it for unison singing raises the question as to how far the unison versions throughout the book are intended for amateur performance, especially on the piano. Not even a skilled pianist could play this particular one without "breaking" or faking a good many of the chords. The harmony version here supplies a way out; but what of Hymn 21, which has no simple alternative? It looks as though our Compilers, excellent performers themselves, with large hands, had in this respect forgotten those humbler executants for whom their transcriptions were presumably made.

(7) The fitting of the words to Holst's CRANHAM (51) is shown more fully than in some other books; but here and in other irregular hymns it would have been better still to print the words between the staves. The allocation of syllables to the last phrase of the tune is questionable. The omission of Christina Rossetti's third stanza is unpardonable.

(8) There are no expression marks save in a few special cases, chiefly among the Choir Settings; and no descants, though the OLD 100TH (450, 452) is given with Dowland's fauxbourdon version, as in *E.H.* One wonders why this should be the only tune so favoured.

(9) It is obviously impossible to draw a hard and fast line between Hymns and Choir Settings, but "This joyful Eastertide" should surely have gone into the second category. On the other hand, it is not easy to see the point of differentiation between Norman Cocker's RYBURN (211) and G. H. Heath-Gracie's DESMOND (531) — both set to "O lead my blindness by the hand", and both equally expressive.

Other interesting tunes, unfamiliar to me if not now published for the first time, include Guy Warrack's WELLINGTON SQUARE (23), sturdy and diatonic; two by Eric Thiman, of which MILTON ABBAS (172) is a first-rate match for the missionary hymn "Christ for the world, we sing"; R. R. Terry's HIGHWOOD (32) which, however, involves unfortunate misaccentuation in verse 4, line 3, of "Hark, what a sound"; a unison tune by Graham George to "Ride on, ride on in majesty" (89¹); the Finnish melody NYLAND (191), easy and singable on a familiar Welsh pattern; H. P. Allen's KINGLEY VALE (206), well suited to "Lord, enthroned in heavenly splendour", though a cross-reference to BRYN CALFARIA, for harmony singing, would be useful; the 18th-century WATCHMAN (268), a good substitute here for CARLISLE; a lovely Chinese melody, ALL RED THE RIVER (303), not unlike SLANE (316) in its warm enfolding contours; EDM (350), of which the origin is not stated, but the arrangement

is by Edgar Pettman, whose own little tune LOVE INCARNATE (53) is a welcome addition to the Christmas section.

The B.B.C.'s Director of Music, Herbert Murrill, has two tunes in the book — ARNOLD (351²), a friendly four-part alternative to Parry's REPTON; and the rather sterner CAROLYN (273¹). Murrill's use of sequence in both tunes is curiously like Parry's. Two pleasant if not notable tunes from the 19th century are WRAYSBURY (354) and ST. KILDA (355). One of the most agreeable of the newer tunes is J. H. Creed's MORETON (462), set to Watts's version of Psalm 84. Among the Choir Settings, Eric Hunt's REQUIEM (539²) is a gem: it is beautifully simple and singable, in spite of its irregular barring, and might have gone among the hymns, where the same words ("Think, O Lord, in mercy") are not very aptly set to CASWALL (449). Two tunes to be specially welcomed are Henry Ley's RUSHFORD (302²) — as fine as any for "Fight the good fight", and E. W. Naylor's FROM STRENGTH TO STRENGTH (365).

It remains to discuss the many tunes by W. K. Stanton, G. Thalben-Ball and C. V. Taylor. One — Taylor's ABBOT'S LEIGH (7, 176) — I would class straight away as indispensable to any future hymn book. *A.M.R.* has already included it. Of the rest, it goes without saying that all display a very high level of musical competence; many are distinguished; some self-consciously exploit devices which will eventually "date" and perhaps damn them; some fill an obvious need, by fitting an unusual metre or replacing unsatisfactory tunes which have been associated with particular words; not a few, in spite of their qualities, seem unnecessary. Stanton's EXULTATE DEO (99), VERNUS (109), SILCHESTER (139) and CHASTLETON (523) are excellent settings of unusual metres; NORTHUMBRIA (181) is a good unison marcher, in the "public school" manner; HAMPTON LUCY (270) moves spaciouly, with a fine climax, to words by C. A. Alington. Thalben-Ball and Stanton have competed in setting two hymns (59 and 63), the former securing first place each time. His ORLANDO (9, 409²) is a simple essay (*L.M.*) in the psalm-tune manner; ARDEN (271) takes equally after RICHMOND; the first two lines of VIGIL (195) are frankly dull, and the last two of ZENNOR (295) are quite remarkable. Taylor, with PORTLAND (14) supplies a good plain substitute for Dykes's ALMSGIVING, and MEAD HOUSE (98) effectively replaces Sullivan's LUX EOI. His MARSTON STREET (154) goes well to a Whitsunday procession (should not this have an Amen, since it ends with a Doxology?); and his LIBERA NOS (291) and BUSHMEAD (386) are useful newcomers to familiar words.

The modulations in several of Stanton's tunes are of the kind which very soon pall, and will certainly date. The type was long ago established, e.g. by Charles Wood in RANGOON and Ferguson in WOLVERCOTE. Here we have it in EASTLEACH (253) — Dykes in 20th-century garb!; SHERSTON (287) — shades of HANOVER!; and MEGERRAN (443). A melodic feature which will "date" some of

the other new tunes is the flattened 7th, as seen in Taylor's BEWELEY (192) and SHELDONIAN (308), Thalben-Ball's WALFORD (292²) and Stanton's LIVINGSTONE (177).

Is this last tune really much preferable to BENSON for "God is working his purpose out"? Is SIRIUS (21) an improvement on good old ADDISON's for "The spacious firmament"? or ARTHOG (256) sufficiently noteworthy to displace E. G. Monk's ANGEL VOICES? It seems sheer perversity to have divorced "Come, O thou traveller unknown" from WRESTLING JACOB, but instead of Samuel Sebastian's great tune we have Taylor's conscientious JABBOK (4). The same composer pays tribute to Palgrave with GOLDEN TREASURY, for "O Thou not made with hands", to the unfortunate exclusion of the OLD 120TH, and he provides COOLINGE (423) for "Saviour, again", where one might have expected to find Vaughan Williams's MAGDA. Both Stanton and Taylor have written tunes for "Lord of all hopefulness" (309), SLANE being reserved for "Be thou my vision" (316). Of the two, Stanton's SNOWSHILL, which has its top note better placed than Taylor's MINIVER, should become widely popular.

If some hard things appear to have been said about the Compilers' own tunes, it is not through any doubt of their sincerity, or any desire to under-rate their musical achievement. It is simply that one feels in this respect a lack of that proportion which distinguishes the *B.B.C. Hymn Book* in other directions. For it is, taken as a whole, an eminently sane book, which is bound to rank high among recent hymnals and will probably exert a considerable influence on those to come. Many members of the Hymn Society are better equipped than I to discuss the accuracy of its scholarship, to question its attributions, to ask why Tans'ur is spelt Tanzer¹, and so on. But to a mere tyro in the subject it seems to represent a very high level of hymnological learning, which is only equalled by the care in proof-reading which has been applied to it. It seems almost flippant to suggest that there is a wrong note (D for E) in the alto of the 6th bar of MOWSLEY (106²), and that the crotchet in the penultimate bar of HEREFORD (323²) requires a dot.

¹ He sometimes signed himself thus — *Editor*.

POSTSCRIPT: The *B.B.C. Hymn Book* was published on October 4th, on which day publication was celebrated at a lunch at the Dorchester Hotel to which various interested guests were kindly invited by the B.B.C. Short speeches were made by Dr. Iremonger (Dean of Lichfield), Dr. Stanton (Editor), the Rev. Francis House (Director of Religious Broadcasting) and the Bishop of Gloucester, after which a recital of hymns from the book was given by the B.B.C. singers under the direction of Dr. Thalben-Ball.

ECUMENICAL HYMNODY

by K. L. PARRY.

Cantate Domino, World's Student Christian Federation Hymnal, (13 Rue Calvin, Geneva, Switzerland. Full music edition, 14/6.)

Cantate Domino was first published in 1924 as a hymn book for the World Student Christian Federation. It contained 64 hymns which were selected as being the favourite hymns of the various national student Christian movements. It met a great need and has come to be widely used, not only by the Student Christian Movement but at ecumenical gatherings of all kinds. In the third edition, which bears no date, the number of hymns had been increased to 95. The latest edition (1951) has been prepared in view of this wider use and has been "revised so drastically as to become almost a new book". The Editor in chief was Miss Helen Morton of the U.S.A., a former Vice-Chairman of the Federation, with M. Frederic Mathel of Geneva as musical editor. The Preface is written by R. C. Mackie, who tells us that "it was decided not to invite the national movements to suggest hymns, as in the case of earlier editions, but to consult representative leaders in the Federation and in the other World Christian organisations". Hymns which it was found were not used have been omitted, and several new ones added, making 120 in all.

Here, then, we have a unique collection of great interest to hymnologists, for it represents the hymns which find most favour in the mid-twentieth century, especially among the youth of the Churches. Every hymn is given in English, French and German versions. There are 46 hymns, listed as English in the Index. But there is some inconsistency here. We are told that "hymns in italics are translations from other languages". But "Let us with a gladsome mind" and "All people that on earth do dwell" are in italics, while "The Lord will come and not be slow" is included among English hymns. A number of hymns which are translations, such as "Come down, O love divine", "Be Thou my vision", and "Let all mortal flesh keep silence" are treated as English. The same hymn is listed in the 3rd edition as a translation and in the new edition as English.

The most startling fact about the 46 hymns listed as English is that they contain only two hymns by Charles Wesley, "Love divine" and "Hark the herald angels": but the 3rd edition did not contain one of Wesley's! Isaac Watts is represented by four hymns, "Come, dearest Lord", "Jesus shall reign", "O God, our help", and "When I survey"; only the last two were in the 3rd edition. Philip Doddridge is represented by "Awake, my soul". One would have expected to find "Hark, the glad sound". Of Whittier's hymns only one has survived — "Dear Lord and Father" (set to LOBT GOTT). "Abide with me" and "O Love

that wilt not let me go" have vanished. Of the 46 English hymns no less than 22 belong to the 19th century or later. This is in striking contrast with the German hymns, of which only two come from the 19th century. One looks eagerly to see how many hymns the Editors have discovered of Asian origin. Our worship would be greatly enriched if we could sing indigenous hymns of the younger churches. The music is evidently a difficulty here. Mr. Mackie says in the Preface: "The musical idioms in which many otherwise suitable hymns have been written, are not widely familiar in either East or West This remains an unsolved problem of ecumenical hymnology." Most of the hymns that come to us from the East seem to be the old evangelical hymns of the West in another tongue. The hymns of Tilak seem to be the only exception. In him the Christianity of India has found a poet. China does not seem to have produced a Tilak yet.

Mr. Sydney Moore, ex-Head Master of Silcoates, sends some notes on the linguistic aspect of Cantate Domino which we here transcribe.

Translations. Those from English to German or German to English are always the best. Those from German or English to French are frequently very weak. Those from Latin to German, English or French are often very free.

Verses. These always tally in number, but verse 3 (for example) in the German is not always a translation of verse 3 in the English. Often a verse not given in the original is translated as (e.g.) verse 2, and verses 3 and 4 of the translated version may be translations of verses 2 and 3 in the original. Surely this must make a confusion of tongues! (Example, Hymn 5).

Translators. *Facile princeps* is Catherine Winkworth. The best translators into English after her are Margaret House and M. Barclay. The best translators into German are Hampe, Lilje, Lechler and Horkel. The best translators into French are Pauline Martin and Fernand Barth. The best translator from Latin remains J. M. Neale.

Of the two sisters de Pasquier (Violette and Flossette), Violette's five translations are careful, and sometimes very good, while of Flossette's 34 many are good, but some are weak, banal or unfaithful. Pauline Martin would have done some better and some much better.

Errors. These are singularly few. I can only recall *frohlokken* (Hymn 7).

Some translations marked "V.G." (very good) by Mr. Moore are — 5 v 1 (French), 2 (O worship the King) vv 2, 3, 4 (German), 20 (Hark the herald), the whole (German), 32 (Gelobt sei Gott) the whole (English), 37 (Jesu, meine Freude) vv 1 & 3 (English) and 53 (City of God) the whole (German).

MUSIC IN CHURCH

The Report of the Archbishop's Committee, 1951.

(Church Information Board, Dean's Yard, S.W.1. 5/-)

Few of our readers, we imagine, will find much to quarrel with here. The compilers of the Report seem to be mainly drawn from the staff or associates of the R.S.C.M., which is as it should be. They show in their findings a notable combination of impartiality in general matters and inflexibility in their own special sphere.

For example, in the vexatious controversy over the rival merits of Anglican chants and plainsong for the psalms (pp 32f) their conclusion is that both kinds of chanting can be painful if done badly and beautiful if done well; and in that other area of controversy, the matter of relation between the organist and his vicar, they neither hesitate to make clear the special difficulties which the organist has to face nor commit themselves to advising withdrawal of authority from the spiritual director of the parish. In matters still in dispute, in party-matters and those upon which no conclusion can yet be reached, they refuse to take sides, and in this they are to be commended.

The shrewdness with which they make their positive points is, in view of this, the more impressive. Upon one point they give no ground at all; they are quite clear that any kind of slovenliness, unreality, sentimentality or self-indulgence in worship is an abomination. This conviction, which is the basic principle of the R.S.C.M., comes through again and again. For example, the report deplores the use of hymns to cover the entrance and recession of the choir at Matins and Evensong on the ground that this is a meaningless confusion of the true purpose of procession, and also because hymns should not be sung before the opening penitential acts of those services nor after the Blessing. Again, the arbitrary cutting off of a hymn before its last verse because the choir has beaten the organist in procession is condemned outright: the correct way is to time both hymn and procession and adjust them accordingly. The pretentious use of over-difficult music by choirs and organists of limited capacities is likewise a matter of censure, and at one point, for the sake of the reality of worship, the Compilers call for a revision of the Psalter.

The chapter which will most interest readers of this journal is, of course, Chapter VIII on "Hymns and their tunes". On fundamental principles the compilers are liberal. But — "The emphasis on sincerity and strength in religion is more than ever apparent in an age that is peculiarly critical of pretence and sentimentality" (p. 35). That is admirably put. The canons of criticism which the report offers are these:

- (a) A hymn tune must be worthy of being offered in worship to Almighty God;

- (b) "Am I choosing this tune because it is worthy of a place in divine worship, or because people like to sing it?"

- (c) Does this tune convey a sincere and noble impression?

These canons are not thus set out: they are extracted from the text of page 35, and we shall return to them later. The compilers, having made out a case on these very general grounds, continue—

"Even though the truth of this be admitted, there will always be a debatable land, containing tunes which it would be harsh to sweep away, but which an honest judgment on musical grounds alone would hardly feel justified in retaining" (p. 36).

Our readers will here recognise the principles of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* which, from its intimate connexion with the R.S.C.M., we may expect to be very much in line with this report. Conscience, however, is not entirely silenced by courtesy, and a few hymn tunes are publicly proscribed as examples of how the thing should not be done. These (pp 37f) are — MAIDSTONE (*A.M.R.* 240) "with its hurdy-gurdy rhythm", ST. BEES (344) "in its tawdriness", ST. PHILIP (527, for "For all the saints") for "wrong accent in nearly every line of every verse", ST. SYLVESTER (*A.M.S.* 289) for "want of movement", and ST. OSWALD (292), MAGDALENA (*A.M.S.* 186) and ST. CHRYSOSTOM (*A.M.R.* 202) for bad part-writing. (We pause here to record a faint and we hope not perverse note of surprise that the compilers are taken in by Harwood's THORNBURY).

About new tunes, pitch, speed and playing over, the compilers seem to say all the right things, although what they say at the end of the main paragraph on p. 42 reads obscurely and is slightly confused.

The report is full of penetrating asides, among which we think that, as a comment on history, the following is outstanding:

"When the first World War came to an end, an enthusiasm for reform 'without tarrying for any' took possession of men's minds. Everything, it was asserted, needed bringing up to date. Efficiency, democracy and modernity were the watchwords of progress in a world where, after the brief aberration of four years of slaughter, the nations would desire nothing but peace and plenty, comfort and security — boons which it was confidently believed could be had, if only people would employ a little sense, and put first things first. The demagogic zeal of persons at once practical and superior found its way into the church, and many a broom was violently whirled. Not least among the dangers that threatened were proposals to reduce to a minimum what was regarded as a wasteful expense and an esoteric luxury — the cathedral service". (p. 63).

We think that whoever wrote that paragraph may well and rightly be proud of it. It is a shrewd knock. This whole chapter on the Cathedral services (XIII) is, indeed, a model of good sense, facing difficulties bravely and proudly, and drawing a well thought out

distinction between the offices of the older cathedrals and the downtown parish-church-cathedrals.

We could find other examples to support the judgment that this report of 85 pages represents deep and devout thought. All we have to say now is that it leaves a great gap to be filled which perhaps one day an Archbishop's Committee, or somebody else's committee, will be appointed to attend to. The report is practical, and perhaps wisely refrains from going very far below the practical level. But it cannot avoid brief excursions into morality and aesthetics — we have seen this in the quotations we made earlier from passages concerned with canons of judgment. This is what must now be taken much further. We must not remain satisfied any longer with woolly judgments about music being "worthy" and "noble" and "sincere". We may not even be satisfied by being categorically told that the rhythm of MAIDSTONE and the part-writing of ST. OSWALD are not thus to be characterised. You could answer — "But, gentlemen, MAIDSTONE has a splendid manly rhythm — listen to it — *TUM tum tum Tum tum tum Tum tum tum TUM*. Doesn't it excite you?" Or again — "ST. SYLVESTER has a wonderful peace and serenity. Come along singers! just stay on that lovely chord of F major and enjoy it." And so on. The whole business of the judgment of music remains a point of ding-dong controversy until it is taken right down below the levels of taste and even of morals. We do not claim that this has been satisfactorily done by anybody so far, but it must be done. In a word, it is time that that excellent, hospitable, friendly, skilful and thoroughly Christian institution, the R.S.C.M., made time to go right into the problem of the Christian criticism of church music.

But that, the Compilers of this report may well say, is another story. The story they have told us they have told extremely well, and in conclusion we express the hope that notwithstanding its inevitably anglican context it will be widely read in all places where music is offered to the service of God.

Negro Spirituals, 120 Songs with tonic sol-fa music, edited by Alexander Sandilands, Morija Sesuto Book Depot, Morija, Basutoland, S. Africa (no price).

Even for those to whom sol-fa notation is a stumbling block, this book is to be entirely recommended for its judicious selection of Spirituals, for the discreet arrangements which Mr. Sandilands has provided, and for the fascinating and authoritative introduction; this introduction in 14 pages provides much valuable information on the history and the music of the Spirituals. The book is designed for Africans, but it is to be greatly hoped that a wide circulation in this country and in America will achieve for it one of its subsidiary ideals — the reclamation of the Spiritual from concert-hall sentimentality and its restoration to an honoured place in

Christian devotion. The book is obtainable through the London Missionary Society.

Sing Praises. 100 Services for the Infants Assembly, by Miss J. M. Macdougall Ferguson, Religious Education Press, 7/6.

The purpose of this book is to provide forms of worship for small children making use not only of prayers and hymns but also of instrumental and recorded music. The hymns are chiefly in the "Child Songs" tradition with heavy emphasis on created nature. At the end of the book a small selection of additional hymns is provided, many of which are original. We entirely deplore the antiquated musical style of the new tunes and are surprised to see a very well known tune of Monk (p. 116) marked "Source unknown". The intention is obviously good, but the original material is below the standard which we ought to require for young children.

EDITOR.

A PRAYER MANUAL

Ours is not a theological magazine, but we make space to notice a tiny handbook sent for review by the Epworth Press (28 pages, One shilling). The author, Mr. A. J. Chatterton, entitles it *The Supreme Friend*. It would be impertinent to criticize this little book, for it is written by one who has learned at the feet of Christ how to offer wise and humble direction to others.

The theme is the cultivation of the Friendship of Jesus, along such lines as we follow with our human friends, and the daily scheme of prayer for a week is built upon a useful nemonic, A.C.T., A.C.T., viz: Adoration, Confession, Thanksgiving; Asking, Consecration, Things-to-be-done.

Another notable feature of this scheme (which brings it within our scope) is the extensive use made of the Hymn-book, which the author regards as a "text-book" only second to the Bible for this purpose. He urges that verses of hymns be committed to memory from time to time, and dwelt upon devotionally at waking and at night. Accordingly this little manual includes numerous examples. All are to be found in the *Methodist Hymn Book*, but they are thoughtfully chosen from among Quakers, Continental evangelists and others, as well as Anglicans and, inevitably, Charles Wesley.

Altogether it is a little guide of sterling sincerity and experience, likely to be of challenge and service both to young people and to those who are no longer "beginners" in the Christian Way, but who feel the broadening implications of "newness of life".

L. H. BUNN.

THREE OCCASIONAL ARTICLES

I

Our Hymnological Debt to the Eighteenth Century, by the Rev. Maurice Frost. *Laudate* (Nashdom Abbey), No. 90, July, 1951, pp. 16-27.

This is the second of three fascinating articles that make up the body of this issue of *Laudate*. Our own members, knowing their joint-Chairman's erudition and his capacity for making the subject interesting, will know what to expect. He deals with the chief hymn and tune books of the first half of the eighteenth century, finding his way with characteristic grace through the mass of material, and presenting the reader with a clear and agreeable account of the development of hymns and their tunes during this crucial period. We warmly recommend this article to our readers. The subscription to *Laudate* is 4/6 per annum; there is no indication of the price of a back-number.

II

An Eighteenth Century Version of the Psalms, by R.C.W., S.S.M. *Quarterly* No. 179, June 1951, pp. 38-42.

This short but admirable article deals with Isaac Watts's *The Psalms of David Imitated*, etc., in such a way as to bring into prominence Watts's technique of interpreting the Old Testament Scriptures through those of the New Testament. It thus provides illumination not only on the subject of hymnology but also upon that of Biblical exegesis. It is excellently done, and this again we recommend without reserve. The *S.S.M. Quarterly* is published by the Society of the Sacred Mission, Kelham, Newark, Notts. No price is mentioned.

English Hymnody, anonymously contributed as Fellowship Paper No. 155 of the Church Pastoral Aid Society, November 1951.

We are informed that the author of this shrewd and balanced survey of the history of hymnody is the Rev. E. Hirst, Vicar of Taunton. It runs to six closely printed pages (about 4,000 words), and does credit to its author and to the Society which elected to devote a Fellowship Paper to it. It will not provide much information that is new to our readers, but it is a capital example of how to tell the great story in a limited space. We are not sure that Goudimel (p. 4) *composed* any psalm tunes and we think that "Dodderidge" cannot be right. The author carries the story right down to our own day and we are glad he is able to mention E. H. Blakeney as a leading modern hymn writer. This is as good a short history of hymnody as we have seen.

ADVANCE NOTICES

After we went to Press it was announced that *Congregational Praise*, the new hymn book of the Congregational Union of England and Wales, was to be published on December 13th, 1951. This book is therefore now available, from the Independent Press, Memorial Hall, Farringdon Street, London, E.C.4, full music edition, price 18/6d. The words-only edition is expected to be available in early February. The book contains 778 hymns, including carols, congregational anthems and metrical psalms, and 106 psalms and passages of Scripture pointed for chanting. A review of this book by L. H. Bunn will appear in our next issue.

We hope also to include a review of *I'll Praise my Maker*, by the Editor of the *Bulletin*, published at 15/- by the Independent Press on 10th December last. This book contains historical and devotional comments on the hymns of the English Calvinist tradition of the eighteenth century outside the works of Isaac Watts.

IMPORTANT NOTICES

CONFERENCE — 1952

A Conference of the Society will be held at Wesley House, Cambridge, from July 1st to 4th (Tuesday to Friday), 1952. It is sincerely hoped that many of our members will wish to be with us at this Conference, which is an open meeting for all members. A full programme will be published in April if possible. The cost will be three guineas inclusive for the three days or at the rate of 22/6 a day. Those who wish to come are asked to write to the Secretary, whose address is temporarily altered to 30 Grove Road, Stratford-on-Avon.

SUBSCRIPTIONS

The annual subscription, due on 1st January, has had to be raised to seven shillings and sixpence. Our members will, we are sure, understand the reasons for this: the *Bulletin* must be paid for and paper is an expensive luxury. Please note also that the American Hymn Society has kindly made arrangements by which, on payment of an additional subscription equal to our own (7/6), our members can join that Society as well, and receive its publications. It is to be hoped that many of our members will be able to avail themselves of this hospitable gesture by our American friends. Subscription forms and envelopes are enclosed with this *Bulletin*.

