

THE HYMN SOCIETY

OF GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND

BULLETIN

VOLUME THREE

NUMBER TWO

SPRING, 1952

Editor: REV. ERIK R. ROUTLEY, M.A., B.D., D.Phil.,
17 Norham Road, Oxford.

Hon. Secretary: REV. F. B. MERRYWEATHER, M.A.,
Oxhill Rectory, Warwickshire.

CONTENTS

Editorial	21
Hymnody Since the Oxford Movement — I								
						by the Revd. Cyril Pocknee		22
Reviews :								
<i>Congregational Praise</i> (L. H. Bunn)			26
<i>The Kingsway Hymn Book</i> (Editor)			32
"I'll Praise My Maker", by Erik Routley						(C. W. Towlson)		36
Shorter Notices and Society Notes			37
Cambridge Conference			38

EDITORIAL

It has been suggested by one or two members that our *Bulletin*, which is achieving an almost respectable age, should be numbered serially as well as in volumes. In compliance with this suggestion we are placing the serial number, in the present case, "59", prominently on the first page of each issue. It will be clear from this how long we have been in continuous publication—we are now in our fifteenth year; may we have a peaceful and prosperous journey to number 100 !

HYMNODY SINCE THE OXFORD MOVEMENT — I

by the Revd. CYRIL POCKNEE.

At the close of the 18th century the metrical paraphrases of the Psalter still remained the staple of public praise for Anglican congregations; and compositions that were not paraphrased from Holy Scripture were frowned upon by authority and considered to be suitable only for Dissenters and Methodists.

The founder of the modern Church hymn-book was Bishop Reginald Heber (1783-1826). But as late as 1820 Heber failed to get any recognition or official authorisation for his *Hymns* when he submitted the manuscripts to the Archbishop of Canterbury and the Bishop of London. His book was published posthumously by his widow in 1827 under the title *Hymns written and adapted to the Weekly Church Service of the Year*. The work was dedicated personally to the Archbishop which was the nearest approach to authorisation that the cautious Primate would permit. Heber's hymns inaugurate a new period in Anglican hymnody, and they mark the beginning of the Church's emergence from the trammels of "Tate and Brady". For they aim at expressing religious feeling but also at deliberately controlling that expression by the canons of poetic art. At the same time they remain true to the doctrinal and liturgical concepts of the English Liturgy, e.g., "Virgin-born, we bow before Thee" and "Holy, Holy, Holy, Lord God Almighty".

The same year that witnessed the publication of Heber's book saw the issuing of *The Christian Year* by the Revd. John Keble. This was a collection of poems written over the course of several years and following the order and plan of the Christian Year as set out in the Book of Common Prayer. The poems also included meditations and reflections on the Prayer Book Offices of Baptism, Confirmation and Matrimony. Keble had distinguished himself at Oxford in the literary sphere, and was qualified to write such verse. In considering the contents of *The Christian Year* we need to remember that their author did not intend them to be used in public worship. They were intended for private meditation on the liturgical theme of the Sunday or season under consideration, as the text "In quietness and in confidence shall be your strength" (Isa. 30.15.) on the title-page quite clearly indicates. This fact has not always been borne in mind by those who criticise "New every morning is the love" or "Sun of my Soul". It was *A Companion to the Prayer Book* (1832) that brought some centos from Keble's book into congregational use.

Meanwhile Keble's associates in the Oxford Movement were considering other sources of inspiration for hymnody and for enforcing the tenets of Tractarianism. Stressing as they did the continuity of the Church of England as the Catholic Church of the land, it was inevitable that the Tractarians should consider the Latin Office Hymns with their doctrinal and objective appeal. One of the first

attempts at translating some of these hymns was made by Keble's pupil, Isaac Williams (1802-65). They appeared from time to time in *The British Magazine* between 1832 and 1837. In 1839 Williams published them together under the title *Hymns translated from the Parisian Breviary*. Few of these have passed into popular usage. It is thought that Isaac Williams purposely made his translations in awkward and irregular metres in order to prevent their passing into congregational use. The three translations that remain in use today from his efforts are, "Disposer Supreme", "O Heavenly Jerusalem", and "O Word of God Above".

However, the example of Williams inspired John Chandler (1806-76) to take up the task of rendering the Office Hymns into English, and in 1837 the latter published his *Hymns of the Primitive Church*. The work was rather too scholarly for ordinary congregational use containing as it did 108 Latin hymns with English translations. Moreover the title was not an accurate one. For Chandler not only englished some of the ancient Latin hymns, that had been in use all over Western Europe for many hundreds of years, but, like Williams, he drew upon the French diocesan breviaries of the late 17th and early 18th centuries for some of his hymns. So that at the time he made his translations some of his "Primitive Hymns" were scarcely a century old. This lack of historical perspective was one of the faults of the Oxford Movement to which we shall have to refer again. The book also contained Ken's "Awake my Soul" and "Glory to Thee", and "Hark the herald angels", so that its title was rendered even more misleading. In 1841 Chandler issued another edition under the more accurate title *The Hymns of the Church, mostly Primitive*. His translations of ancient Office hymns have not remained in use until today. But it is otherwise with Chandler's translations of the hymns from the French breviaries. These were seized upon and used in Church and Nonconformist hymnals alike, and they remain in popular use to-day, for "On Jordan's bank", "The Advent of our God" and "Now my soul thy voice upraising" are still sung by congregations of every degree of churchmanship.

In the preface to his hymn-book Chandler is careful to disclaim any authority for his compilation. It is intended to "supplement, not displace, the Psalms of David". This reflects the Tractarians' dislike of metrical psalmody and their insistence that Mattins and Evensong with the proper prose versions of the psalms provided in those Offices shall be the outstanding feature of the English Choir Offices. For the leaders of the Oxford Movement were fully aware that the Prayer Book Offices were a modification of the older Breviary Offices. With their concern to underline the continuity of the Church of England before and after the Reformation they were careful to see that nothing should detract from the authorised forms of liturgical worship.

The year that Chandler's collection was published also brought

forth *Ancient Hymns from the Roman Breviary, for Domestick Use* by Bishop Richard Mant (1776-1848). Here again the title betrays some confusion, for most of Mant's translations were based on the Roman Breviary of 1632 in which the ancient Latin hymns were recast—often beyond recognition—to suit the taste of the renaissance Popes and Cardinals.

The lack of historical and critical perspective already mentioned, displayed by Isaac Williams, Chandler and Mant in confusing the really ancient Latin hymns with those of the 17th and 18th centuries was exposed with authority and vigour in *The Christian Remembrancer* for October 1849 by John Mason Neale (1818-66). Moreover in many cases, said Neale, these translators had failed to reproduce the metres of the originals and their work betrayed "carelessness, haste and slovenliness." Dr. Neale followed these criticisms by producing translations of the ancient Latin hymns, and it is no exaggeration to state that his work in this direction has secured a place for these hymns in most Anglican hymnals. In 1851 he put forth *Mediaeval Hymns and Sequences* in which famous hymns such as *Pange Lingua*, *Vexilla Regis*, and *Urbs Beata* appeared in English form. This was quickly followed by *The Hymnal Noted* (1852-54), which contained only translations of Latin hymns, 94 of which were by Neale. He was assisted by Benjamin Webb, Vicar of St. Andrew's, Wells Street, London, who also contributed some translations, the best-known being "O love how deep, how broad." The music was entirely plain chant, each hymn being set to its traditional melody. This work was done by Thomas Helmore, Chaplain-in-Ordinary to the Queen. *The Hymnal Noted* marks the extreme swing of the pendulum in favour of plainsong Office Hymns, and its contents were too much of one type to commend it to widespread congregational use. It was only in churches that were determined to be "Catholic" at all costs that this book, with its austere melodies, was used exclusively. Nevertheless it impressed upon Churchmen the importance of Office hymns, and although *The Hymnal Noted* has not survived in use until today, it is Neale's translations from that work which have gained the widest acceptance. Even Roman Catholic writers and books borrow Neale's Office-hymn translations, e.g., *Liturgical Prayer* by Abbot Cabrol, O.S.B., page 354.

Much as Neale admired the Latin hymns he realised very well the incompleteness of a book that contained only these things; and his claim to fame as a hymnologist does not rest simply on his translations from the Latin Breviaries. He also wrote original hymns such as, "They Whose Course on Earth is O'er". There are, too, his Christmas and Easter Carols. He was not only a poet but an accomplished liturgist and historian; and it was this sphere that suggested to him another source for hymnody. In his *Hymns of the Eastern Church* (1862) he claims to be the first person to attempt to render into English portions of the lengthy poetical compositions

that are a conspicuous feature of the Orthodox rites. The task was a difficult one, and many of these compositions with their involved metaphors and hyperbole even when translated into English would remain foreign to the pragmatic western mind. In this field Neale was a pioneer. Not all his "Eastern Hymns" have been traced to a Greek original, and it is, perhaps, a little ironical that the two that found widest vogue with 19th century congregations should come under this criticism, viz., "O happy band of pilgrims" and "Art thou weary." These two hymns no longer have the appeal that they once had. The same year as the first part of *The Hymnal Noted* was published (1852), there appeared also *The Church Hymn and Tune Book*, edited by the Revd. W. J. Blew with music set by Dr. H. J. Gauntlett. In passing we note the high standard of typography achieved by this book, which is in contrast to the poor printing and format of many religious publications at that time. Most of the hymns in this book were translations from the Latin; they included one or two by Isaac Williams and Chandler, but the greater part were the work of Mr. Blew. We commend Blew's translations to the editors of future hymn-books in the high Church tradition. They are felicitous and well-balanced, yet they seem to have been strangely neglected. Those for Saints and Holy Days might well have been used instead of some of the specially-written compositions for particular Saints that have appeared in Anglo-Catholic hymnody.

With few exceptions the translated Latin hymns are set by Gauntlett in this book to modern tunes and not to plainsong. He was a reformer in Church music, and unlike many of his contemporaries Gauntlett observes the original style of the psalm tunes when he employs them.

The year 1852 also brought forth an *English Hymnal* edited by James A. Johnston. A second edition appeared in 1856. The editorial preface says the object of the book is "a supply of hymns in strict harmony with the Book of Common Prayer." The book follows the seasons set out in the Prayer Book. Usually two hymns are provided for each occasion. There are hymns by Ken, Watts, C. Wesley, and original translations of Breviary hymns, including the French diocesan books, by the Editor. This book might be described as a typical high church book of the middle of the last century.

Another hymnal that follows the same lines is *The People's Hymnal* (1867) edited by Dr. R. F. Littledale, the friend of Neale. It contains 600 compositions of varying kinds which, according to the editor represent "a blending of stern simplicity and clear doctrinal teaching of the ancient hymns, with the more emotional and personal type that later ages have produced." A prominent feature of this book is the number of metrical litanies that are included, some of which were written by Littledale. Perhaps the outstanding achievement of the book is the editor's translation of

Bianco da Siena's 15th century Italian poem *Discendo, amor santo*. Now that this translation "Come down, O love divine" has been wedded to Vaughan Williams' tune DOWN AMPNEY it has become widely known and popular. Another translation that Little-dale made for his hymn-book is the hymn for Trinity Sunday "Eternal Light, Divinity", now known to have its origins in *The Cologne Breviary* of 1780.

The Hymnary (1872) is another work on the same lines edited by the Reverends W. Cooke and B. Webb, with music by Sir Joseph Barnby. Mr. Webb was Vicar of St. Andrew's, Wells Street, a church celebrated for its choral services in which the florid music then in fashion was employed to the fullest extent. With Barnby as editor we are not surprised to find the musical content of this hymnal chiefly represented by Dykes, Gounod, Sullivan as well as the compositions of the musical editor. The book follows the Prayer Book cycle of seasons. But there seems to be nothing of great originality in the book. We note that two of Neale's translations from the Greek are among the contents, viz., "Come ye Faithful raise the strain" and "The Day of Resurrection", both by St. John Damascene and now steadily popular.

(To be concluded)

CONGREGATIONAL PRAISE, 1951

(incorporating by permission an article contributed to the *Congregational Quarterly*, April, 1952)

Let it be said at once that Congregationalists have cause to be proud of their new manual of praise which, in its handsome pale-blue and silver case, does credit to everyone concerned in its production.

This book was projected just before the War to replace the Hymnary current since 1916, but, in the inevitable postponement of all such labours, its predecessor has now done extended duty for thirty-five years. During that period of world-wide spiritual unrest Christians have had to look carefully to their resources, not least in hymnody, lest they should find their faith betrayed by a broken staff or an unsure guide. One criterion of changing need and accent is afforded by the fluctuating recourse to Isaac Watts. Of a thousand *Psalms & Hymns* in 1859 almost four hundred were of his authorship, but Dr. Barrett reduced the number to sixty-three in his *Hymnal* of 1887, while in 1916 the *Hymnary* admitted only twenty-five. There is thus an obvious significance in the inclusion today of forty-eight, for this resolute reinstating of Watts sets the tone of the new hymn-book. It has often been remarked, indeed, that the *Congregational Hymnary* showed a strong bias—dating from the *Supplement* of 1874—towards the poetry of free-thought; but while Unitarians and Quakers have undoubtedly enriched the

"common" of Christian praise, their total contribution is now judiciously reduced from about 75 in 1916 to something like 45.

A relatively "high" doctrine of the Church probably accounts for the placing of this section before hymns on the Christian Life. The same order was followed in 1916 and also by the *Church Hymnary*, 1927. Both Presbyterians and Congregationalists have thus reversed the positions held largely in the 19th century, and the Evangelical emphasis which they then shared with the Baptist and Methodist hymnals is today maintained by those alone. This is not to deny that the present collection provides in fine and generous proportion hymns for inward needs of the soul and for missionary and public action, but since Barrett's day it does seem to occupy a different ground in theory.

Then, notwithstanding the welcome inclusion of a few Scottish metrical psalms, the strength of the book lies in its being a standard hymn-book for English Congregationalists. For instance, psalm-versions far more numerous by Watts and others are scattered throughout the text. Also, while containing many more translations than its precursor, and as many from the German as the *Church Hymnary* if not as the *Methodist Hymn Book* (*M.H.B.*), it does so unobtrusively without printing their titles. Perhaps English Independency is less conscious than other Calvinists or Methodists of being bound to the Reformed and Evangelical Churches of the European continent.

Taking the Sections in order we may now observe briefly a few points of interest.

The Eternal Father (1-71). Quite wisely in No. 2 and elsewhere (if not yet in the dictionary) we find the word "aweful": as language depreciates it becomes necessary to remind the coinage. Watts' "performing God" (65) is suitably emended, as in 1916, to "fulfilling" (*M.H.B.* 72 misses the point), but no one has managed to improve the unwanted "taste" of Cowper's "bud" (56).

The Lord Jesus Christ (72-197). We welcome "Vom Himmel hoch" (78) in Hunt's lovely variant on the familiar Winkworth version. Among several good hymns on the Life of Jesus is one by Canon Briggs (117), with Dr. Elvet Lewis' practicable substitute (115) for "There's a Friend" still set to Stainer's tune. With the Passion hymns it was well to revive Watts' "Alas, and did my Saviour bleed" (130), abandoned since 1859; also Crossman's 17th-century "Love unknown" (128) where John Ireland's tune might have stood alone with a cross-reference. Here, too, and not with the Communion hymns as Watts designed, stands "When I survey" (131), in full integrity of "His dying crimson (st. 4) and even, in a footnote, the "young Prince." There is fine singing for Easter, dating from Wither (151) to the recent Dean of Durham (149); upon the inevitable inclusion of Wesley's classic (145) should be read the late Bernard Manning¹. In "Crown Him with many

¹*The Hymns of Wesley and Watts*, p. 135 note.

crowns" (166) the compilers have not shrunk from the authentic "rich wounds," but why perpetuate "chosen" (st. 1) for "matchless"? They do well to give "Join all the glorious names" almost entire as two hymns (176), but to sing five of Dr. Bridges' superb double stanzas (194) would be a stern test of endurance. Canon Bland Tucker's noble verses (197) are acceptable alike for their own sake and as introducing Stanford's great tune ENGELBERG.

The Holy Spirit (198-218). This section might have been further strengthened by "Spirit of flame" (348). But need there be two versions, though admirable each, of the *Veni Sancte Spiritus* (202, 203)? Brownlie's translation from the Greek (198) is good and well suited with its new tune (cp. *A.M.R.* 237).

The Holy Trinity (219-224). The useful *Index of Alternative Hymns* on p. 1015 might add under this heading the abridged version of Rawson's "Father, in high heaven dwelling" (624).

Holy Scripture (225-236). In this group are excellent hymns by two founders of this Society, our good friend Canon Briggs (236) and our first secretary, the late G. Currie Martin (235).

The Church (237-365). Under Worship, "Light up this house" (272), first introduced in 1859, is adequate, but its "shekinah-cloud" recalls Gannett's similar allusion (*S.P.* 655) which requires an explanatory note. T. T. Lynch has a charming Baptismal hymn (288), and Dr. Elvet Lewis another (290). There is a good section upon the Lord's Supper, enriched from Watts (294, 295) and with Doddridge's "My God, and is Thy Table spread" (297) printed at length as in 1859. "Triumphant Zion" (319) is a valuable recovery, while the more modern "Trumpet of God," with Charles Wood's telling RANGOON, is equally grateful (338). One good hymn by A. F. Bayly is included (347), though it is long, and perhaps not his best. We note, too, that Bishop Coxe's missionary hymn is altered, as in *M.H.B.*, to "Saviour, quicken many nations" (336), thus serving both good sense and sound exegesis (cp. Isa. 52¹⁵ *R.V.* mg). Hymns about Heaven include "My soul, there is a country" (356), sole representative of Henry Vaughan; also Wesley's "Come let us join" (361), but does not the incongruity of his last two lines justify alteration, as in *Rv.C.H.* 227 (= *A. & M.* 1861-1950) beginning "Let saints on earth"? Two newer pieces are Charter Piggott's "For those we love" (364) and the Bishop of Chichester's splendid "Christ is the King!" (365).

Discipleship (366-535). We find a beautiful meditation on the Prodigal Son by R. F. Horton (379), and some fine verses (421) for young people by J. W. Butcher. In "Lord, it belongs not" (435) the editors have not adopted Dearmer's emendation of st. 2 (*S.P.* 105), though that is the only one which preserves Baxter's allusion to the Hiring-parable of Matt. 20⁸. Other treasures range from Sidney Godolphin (434) to Geoffrey Hoyland's "Lord of good life" (466). "Fore-runners" (517) interprets Neale's "vaunt-couriers" (which few collections have dared to print); yet his

pleasant Latinisms "social joys" and "conjubilant" (352) are retained. "My God, My Father" (530), though evidently modelled on Charlotte Elliott, regards the Will of God in more robust mood.

Social and National (536-586). Here are excellent lines by Dr. Fosdick (563) and G. B. Caird (564); also by Sir Henry Newbolt (574) as in 1916, but, *pace* Amos 3⁶, does our Lord really "give despair"?

Times and Seasons (587-653). For "God of the morning" (592) we must look back to 1859 when compilers also knew their Watts. Some of John Austin's stanzas (616) are known in other hymnals, but to print his hymn (almost) in full adds distinction to this book. The otherwise admirable hymn "Lord Jesus, in the days of old" (628) illustrates the peril of using archaic speech; "wist" is not a past participle (cp. too the rather clumsy correction (105) of Theodore Parker's "... Thou . . . who once appeared"). We may venture to approve a harvest hymn by a living writer, H. R. Moxley (652). Then again, the Church is now significantly less concerned that God should "guard our dust"; hence, after more than a century, Doddridge is allowed to end his hymn (638) in his own words which truly should never have been changed.

Special Occasions (654-682). Here, for Ordination, is Mr. Moxley again (659), with lines of tender beauty by Doddridge for Charities (669). Provision for weddings and funerals, based doubtless on experience, is slight, but can be augmented from the index of "Alternatives".

Children (683-705). Many hymns suitable for young people's use are carefully tabulated on p. 1013. The present section for little children contains two delicate pieces of Canon Briggs (687, 689) and one by Ada Skemp (694). The well-loved "Rocking" carol is here (693), and also "Infant Holy" (696) from the Polish (but described as Czech; we hope this act of annexation will have no European repercussions!).

Carols (706-728). Here, with Ben Johnson (713), Neale (725) and G. R. Woodward's "Joyful Eastertide" (726), are several capital modern pieces.

After a few *Scottish Metrical Psalms* (729-744) there follow—*Doxologies* (745-752). First and best is the venerable "God be in my head" (745) to Walford Davies' exquisite setting.

Congregational Anthems (753-761). It is good to have Baxter's profound "Christ Who knows all His sheep" (757) given in his own words and not as in *S.P.* and *B.B.C.*

Private Devotion (762-778). Seeing that "Jerusalem, my happy home" appears in all its twenty-six stanzas (762) and is also briefly paraphrased at 353, we could dispense with the shorter version at 354. This, finally, is the only possible section for Mr. Carter's searching lines (778) which in the hymnal proper speak the last word.

Musically this book is of the highest order, edited with excellent judgment from the copious resources available, old and new. Any comment upon the tunes will not asperse the recognized competence of the musical editors; rather it will reflect the present writer's experience, gathered during years spent mainly in small congregations, rural and urban, where a good attendance may number thirty, the choir (uncertain in presence and practice) can seldom read music, and the unpaid American-organist usually has a preference for known tunes and an aversion to "four sharps." Such material is by no means ideal, but it is not to be despised: it is amazingly loyal, sometimes enthusiastic and even teachable, and it doubtless abounds within Congregationalism as without, yet it is not always kept in mind by the compilers of tune-books.

Such congregations, however, will be comforted to learn that well over three hundred familiar hymns in this book are set to some well-known tune, though it is surely a needless offence to write CREDITON (143) in the key of B when C would do perfectly well! Nor can the editors be unaware that almost everybody who plays hymns in small churches instinctively (and accurately) transposes the key of E into E-flat and so on; there is therefore little need to print tunes in both keys, as is often done (e.g. FRENCH): a cross reference would be sufficient.

Yet these small congregations are not unwilling to adventure. They will probably master J. C. Bach's ST. LEONARD (119) or REPTON (408) as surely as many have learnt MARCHING or LOBE DEN HERREN, for they have a true instinct for smooth construction as in HAREWOOD, FROM STRENGTH to STRENGTH or THORNBURY. Thus it is likely that in time they will take gladly to several of the new tunes here offered, among them Eric Shave's EASTWOOD (466), K. G. Finlay's LYLE ROAD (118), Dr. Thiman's STORRINGTON (618), and perhaps his STOKESAY CASTLE (666) and Erik Routley's WYCH CROSS (628). Now that "I'll praise my Maker" comes at last to town, people will want to sing it, but BEVERLAC (8) may not successfully rival LUCERNE (= DRESDEN). In contrast to these could be named a good many tunes which bear an unfamiliar idiom that will hardly attract any but well-trained musicians.

There are a few instances of doubtful mating. Surely no Scotsman, acquint with "The Stilt," would have set the Lord's approaching footsteps to the halting strains of YORK (156)! Dr. Harris' ALBERTA is now widely adopted for "Lead, kindly Light", but if this tune must be sung, let it be presented less forbiddingly in C (as in A.M.R.); this writer, however, rather inclines to S. S. Wesley's PATMOS (Rv.C.H. 568). WETHERBY (225), like UFFINGHAM (23), lays some unfortunate stresses on weak syllables.

In "The day Thou gavest" the same fault (at least avoided by the despised ST. CLEMENT) attends LES COMMANDEMENS, but there it is the effect of the "gathering-note" which has been

troublesome ever since the *English Hymnal* in 1906 made it *de rigueur* for psalm-tunes. The lengthened initial note always falls awkwardly on a weak syllable, as in "O for a closer walk" where CAITHNESS is otherwise a most effective choice (yet it is confusing to find this tune also given (443) with equal notes). Incidentally one is dismayed to see that WILTSHIRE (not alone) is apparently meant to be sung through (as in A. & M. 1950) without perceptible pause for breath; even if it could be done it would scarcely be artistic, and we prefer the treatment in the *English Hymnal* or B.B.C.

Another matter in which compilers might helpfully seek agreement with each other is that of a standard form for certain tunes. This is the more important now that Congregationalists and English Presbyterians are being encouraged to worship together. But, for example, ORIENTIS PARTIBUS in triple time accords with S.P. and M.H.B., and differs from A. & M. and Rv.C.H., neither form being quite the original. Boyce's SHARON (16;=HALTON HOLGATE) and Old 137th (6) also display variations of expert opinion. Since BEDFORD (99) is not written in duple time as in M.H.B., one wonders why it does not conform to Rv.C.H. and B.B.C., while FULDA (101) does not agree exactly with either its Methodist namesake or WALTON in Rv.C.H. The syncopation of SONG 22 (217) makes it difficult in ordinary use, and we prefer the slightly modified form in Rv.C.H. and A. & M. / 1939 (although not in 1950).

There are inevitably some tunes included which, while structurally good, are little used. Thus probably few congregations actually sing Bishop's LEICESTER (219) or WHITEHALL (268), and the "proper" melody of "Aus tiefer Noth" (381) is both difficult and dull. One would like, indeed, to put forth the plea that a comprehensive "Appendix" might include all such tunes of undoubted worth but small popularity. With them might be placed a great many of the more intricate settings, such as ICH HALTE and MON DIEU, PRETE-MOI and even LADYWELL, and also most of the experimental new compositions. This section could embrace the pieces grouped as "Congregational Anthems" which in other hymnals are mostly found in the main text, and it could even offer asylum to the inferior tunes too dear yet to be discarded. It would thus be a large and important reserve, ensuring that while each hymn was assigned its own singable tune, there was also a choice of more ambitious alternatives.

In these days of high costs one would have welcomed a smaller book although, indeed, by excising anthems it is less bulky than the old *Hymnary*. Space is sometimes wasted, and tunes are often needlessly duplicated (e.g., WOLERCOTE). By such economies and without prose-psalms a smaller page might have been possible. To what extent canticles and psalms are chanted, or desired, by Congregationalists can be known only among themselves; in any

case good chanting is sufficiently rare. The reviewer's judgment is that in the vast majority of their churches the Reformed tradition will be satisfied by hymns and metrical psalms.

But in present conditions it is matter for serious question whether closely-related Christian communions are justified in continuing to produce separately hymnals which necessarily contain so much of common treasure. A basic "Free Church Hymn Book" might require denominational supplements, but economic pressure may compel such a concerted measure, and the technical difficulties should not be insuperable.

To conclude. Granting the need for all that has been put into *Congregational Praise*, the book is very well arranged, and fulfils the evident intention to produce a hymnary worthy in form and content. A few minor slips have been communicated to the Committee. The indexing is admirable; the only omission (of a list of original sources of translated hymns) might be made good in a forthcoming "Companion," as in the *Handbook to the Church Hymnary*, 1927. A small point is that, contrary to modern custom, the dates of authors and composers might be excluded from the hymns; with living writers it would be less depressing, and in any case it would save much re-printing if dates were furnished once for all in the personal indexes.

Congregational Praise stands as a very distinguished contribution to hymnology, and in its generation will amply serve and stimulate the high worship of God.

L. H. BUNN.

THE KINGSWAY HYMN BOOK,

Edited by Dr. Leslie Russell,

(Evans Bros., London. Full Music edition 5/-, melody edition 3/- in cloth boards, 2/9 in limp cloth).

This is a bold gesture. The book contains 108 hymns, five canticles, and thirteen psalms. We must, in order to acquaint the reader with its purpose, make a few quotations from its brief but extremely controversial Preface.

"It has been my desire for a long time to produce a handy-sized hymn book instead of the usual heavy anthology . . . Few churches, or even school chapels, have an annual repertoire of as many as 100 hymns. . . I have limited myself. . . to the 100 best hymns—best, in words and music . . . It is to those with fresh outlook and unprejudiced minds. . . that this small volume is more particularly addressed."

This is an uncompromising start. Hymn books are too large. Churches need only 100 hymns. These are the 100 best hymns. Those who don't like this are in danger of being judged of stale outlook and prejudiced mind. That is not bad, as an exalted claim, in fifteen lines. Thus challenged, the reader, not to say the reviewer, may well expect something controversial in the contents of the book. Of this he will not be disappointed.

Comparing the book, first, with modern standard collections, we find that it stands nearest to *Songs of Praise*; only seven hymns in the *Kingsway Hymn Book* are not in *S.P.* The scale then proceeds—18 hymns not in the revised *A. & M.*, 21 not in *E.H.*, 22 not in *Congregational Praise*, 24 not in the *Methodist Hymn Book*, 26 not in the *B.B.C. Hymn Book* and 30 not in the *Church Hymnary*. Four hymns are in *S.P.* alone of these seven books—"No coward soul is mine", "Glad that I live am I", "Sing, all ye Christian People", and "Come, my Way"; one is in the *B.B.C.* book alone, T. E. Page's "Soldier, go!" and one is in none of them, Cennick's "Be with me, Lord, where'er I go". The last three of these, at any rate, have a clear claim to consideration in a book of distinguished hymns.

Now we feel bound to question the assumption in the Preface that churches usually have a repertory of 100 hymns or so. In this assertion there are two errors. In the first place it is surely not true. For example, I have just looked over the repertory of hymns used in our chapel at Mansfield College on Sunday mornings over a period of four years. We sing 110 hymns a year. The hymns are chosen by a different preacher each Sunday morning. The organist repressively discourages what he knows the student congregation will not sing with pleasure. We use no children's hymns, and, meeting only in term time, we always miss the seasons of Christmas, Easter and Harvest Festival. Even in these limiting conditions, our repertory is, I find, 216 hymns over the four years.

But, secondly, those who clamour for short hymn books do not commonly realise that even if it be true that a given congregation can get along with a hundred hymns, its neighbours, who also may be content with a hundred, will certainly not want the same hundred. We are prepared, indeed, to hazard the dogmatic statement that if any given congregation can be expected to be able to use two-thirds of a standard hymn book, the neighbour congregation using the same proportion but different hymns, then that hymn book is well and wisely edited.

We must now turn to the claim that this book contains the hundred best hymns. This is a preposterous claim and should be deleted from the Preface in the next edition. It contains a hundred good hymns. No editor ought to claim more than that. About seventy authors are represented. Wesley scores nine, Watts three: Neale has four, Heber and George Herbert three each. The three Watts' hymns are "When I survey", "Jesus shall reign"

and "Our God, our help" ("O God", of course, as printed).

The following, then, are not among the hundred best hymns. "All hail the power of Jesus' name", "Abide with me", "As pants the hart", "Come, let us join our cheerful songs", "God moves in a mysterious way", "Hark, my soul, it is the Lord", "Immortal love, forever full", "How sweet the name of Jesus sounds", "Love divine, all loves excelling", "Judge eternal", "O God of earth and altar", "O for a thousand tongues", "O God of Bethel", "The church's one foundation", "There is a land of pure delight", "Once in royal David's city", "We sing the praise of Him who died", "The head that once was crowned with thorns", "Jesus lives!", "The day Thou gavest", "The race that long in darkness pined", "Hark, the glad sound", "Christians awake!", "Come, Holy Ghost" (Cosin or Wesley). . . . The following, on the other hand, are included in the canon: "No coward soul is mine", "Glad that I live am I", "Soldiers, who are Christ's below", "These things shall be", and "Who is this, so weak and helpless?"

This is not as controversial a list as we might have made it. It includes nothing exquisite in its former part, nothing to which we ourselves take a temperamental dislike in the second. Indeed, we wish to make it clear, in case we be accused of injustice at this point, that we are criticizing not the hymns that are in the book, nor the editor's decision to omit certain others, but the claim that these are the hundred best hymns. We deplore the standardizing and pruning zeal of those who want to restrict a congregation's freedom of choice, and to close the canon of hymns in this fashion.

We wish now to join issue with the author on a slightly different point. Was it necessary to print so many hymns in arbitrarily shortened versions? We have noted, for example, "Hail to the Lord's Anointed" in three verses only, "O come, O come, Immanuel" in four, "Be thou my guardian" in three, "Forty days and forty nights" in four, "My song is love unknown" in four, "All glory, laud and honour" in four, "When I survey" (of course) in four, "Praise, my soul" in three, ending with "Father like He tends and spares us. . ." and "Praise to the Holiest" in five, omitting "O wisest love" and "And that a higher gift", but not "And in the garden".

Upon this we wish to enter a general protest against the myopia which makes modern editors fail to see the difference between shortening (or better, dividing), a hymn of great length for the sake of expediency, and reducing temperamentally a hymn of twenty lines to sixteen. Obviously it is necessary here and there to leave out a bad verse (as we all do in "How sweet the Name", for example). Nor can you sing the whole of "Come, O thou Traveller" at once. But it is possible to take this pruning zeal beyond the bounds of taste. If the need is for short hymns—and this need we readily acknowledge: nothing is more admirable than

a really good hymn of twelve lines—then let us look for short hymns like "Rejoice, O land" or "Jesus, the First and Last" or "Come, dearest Lord, descend and dwell". But we do not usually see just why this editor has made his truncations.

And then, we would draw attention to the singular lack of new material here. Presumably the hundred best hymns must mainly be hymns of long standing: but neither in words nor in music does the editor print anything for the first time, with the exception of fourteen of his own tunes. This seems to blunt the point of his plea for the open and adventurous mind in the Preface.

Musically, the book is in many ways commendable. Its taste is contemporary without being fussy. The only composers (the editor apart who have more than two tunes are Dykes and Cruger, with three each: that epitomises a nice sense of proportion. Vaughan Williams's great pair are here, so is Parry's LAUDATE DOMINUM. We do not hold that Holst's setting of "Our blest Redeemer" is the most felicitous available, and we should have liked to see more of Gibbons (ANGELS' SONG alone) and just something of Lawes.

Of Dr. Russell's tunes we should say something. Five of the fourteen are written in G minor, but it is not this alone which causes us tentatively to place him in the tradition of Martin Shaw's tune to "And didst thou love the race" (S.P. 447). In Dr. Russell's we find the slightly folky cadence, the modal consecutive fifths, and the gentle movement of much of Martin Shaw's quieter work. His idiom is unaffected, but the general impression is usually undistinguished. We think, however, that his tune to "My song is love unknown", unnecessary though some might judge it, is truly moving. We find his tune for "When morning gilds the skies" (105) somewhat unpalatable at present.

Finally, we must offer a few textual comments. On page 127 in the top line the pronoun "I" has disappeared from the first verse of Psalm cxxx. The tune of Hymn 3 (RATISBON) should be ascribed not to Crüger but to Werner's Choralbuch, 1815. We doubt whether it has any connection with Crüger's JESU MEINE ZUVERSICHT. "He who would valiant be" (64) should not be ascribed to John Bunyan. UNIVERSITY (95) should not be ascribed to Randall but to J. Collignon. "Soldier, go!" (91) surely need not be marked "Anonymous". It was ascribed to T. E. Page in the *Clarendon Hymn Book*. EBENEZER (107) is by T. J. Williams (1869-1944). "Ye holy angels bright" should be ascribed to "R. R. Chope, based on Richard Baxter."

A few dates would add to the value of the references. A date on the title page is an absolute necessity.

In conclusion, we find here a book containing nine dozen excellent hymns, all set adequately and often admirably to music. For a small club or organisation that uses hymns only occasionally, and does not call for the deep things of the literature, the book

would be admirable, and we do not see why it should not command a ready welcome in that context. For church use it is too slight. And, for reasons which we have indicated and for one other which delicacy has forbidden us to bring to public notice, the Preface ought most certainly to be rewritten for a future edition.

E.R.R.

THE HYMNS OF THE CALVINISTS.

The eighteenth century was pre-eminently a period of prolific hymn-writing, and in that production the English Calvinists took a prominent and indeed a preponderant part. In "I'll praise my Maker" (Independent Press, 15/-), the Rev. Erik Routley gives a brilliant if at times controversial account of some of the hymns and hymn-writers in the Calvinist tradition between 1700 and 1850. He deals at some length with Doddridge, Cowper, Newton, Montgomery and Conder—analysing the characters of the writers, criticising and appraising their hymns, and quoting extensively from the less-known ones. In a final chapter he writes about six minor hymn-writers whose contribution to hymnody, if small, is of first-rate importance: Hart, Cennick, Davies, Robinson, Toplady and Kelly.

As might have been expected, Mr. Routley's treatment is scholarly and authoritative, but it is never dull. His dislike of careless workmanship is evident in his frequent criticism of "metrical infelicities", and his demand for sincerity in worship is seen in his sidelong thrusts at sentimental and commonplace tunes. But his assessments go much further than mere technical details: in his analysis of character, especially in that of Cowper, he displays a rare insight, and in his defence of Protestant doctrine (of the true Apostolic Succession, for instance) he lays about him manfully, though with a disarming smile—craft as well as craftsmanship!

Isaac Watts and Charles Wesley are, of course, *hors concours*, not merely by the limitations which Mr. Routley has imposed upon himself, but by the pre-eminence of the two writers. The author's admiration for them, however, is plain at every turn, and the writers whom he discusses are measured time and again by the yard-stick of these two giants. He has his favourites, of course, as every man with a mind must have. His restrained praise of William Cowper, for example, seems hardly justified in view of the warmth of his regard for Josiah Conder, surely a much smaller figure. Of the hymns of the former he says, "They are invariably rich in spiritual content and scarcely ever suitable for general use", and he contends especially that "God moves in a mysterious way" is too cold, logical and impersonal—"strangely dank and eerie"—to be congregational. On the other hand, his appreciation of Conder's "The Lord is king" is surprising, in view of his

devastating criticism of its many faults. Conder might well have said:

"It's all very well to dissemble your love,

But why need you kick me downstairs?"

In his defence of Cennick's "Be with me, Lord, where'er I go" as "a perfect devotional hymn", he seems less alive to "metrical infelicities" than elsewhere. The stress on "me" in "Teach me what Thou wouldst have me do" and in "Show me my weakness, let me see" is not altogether felicitous.

Mr. Routley has done us, however, a considerable service in bringing to our notice many hymns which have fallen into disuse or been undervalued. He shows the power in the monosyllables of James Montgomery, his rhythmic sureness and his sound doctrine; he reminds us of John Newton's vitality, high spirits and "heart-knowledge"; and his chapter on the minor hymn-writers unearths to us treasures many of us have never seen and are glad to possess.

This book is a joy to read. Mr. Routley writes with gusto, and with a touch of humour which will not be repressed. There is satire, for example, in his mild censure of James Montgomery for insulting modern Christianity "by telling it to weep", in his reference to the penitent spirit of the church seeking a pastor, and in the elbowing-out of one of Cennick's hymns by "such impudent queue-breakers" as

"Saviour, blessed Saviour,
Listen while we sing."

We shall eagerly await further chapters from Mr. Routley's pen.

CLIFFORD W. TOWLSON.

SHORTER NOTICES.

The Life and Works of Michael Bruce, Bicentenary edition, published by the Michael Bruce Memorial Trust, 12-14, Mill Street, Perth, 1951; pp. viii and 201, 5/6.

This admirable book will be welcomed by all our readers. It presents all the extant works of Michael Bruce together with an introductory essay of 38 pages by the Reverend Edward Vernon, M.A. This introduction tells the story of Bruce's short life, and discusses without either rancour or indecisiveness the vexatious behaviour of John Logan whose by-product has been the hesitancy of editors to ascribe Bruce's hymns to their author. Though Bruce did not live to be a great poet, he lived to write some imperishable Paraphrases; and it is perhaps fitting that a not unworthy place has been given to his work in the two hymn books of 1951. The book is amazingly inexpensive, but it is produced with adequate taste.

The Hymn, January, 1952.

An unusually valuable issue of the American society's journal leads off with a hitherto unpublished article by the late Dr. Millar Patrick entitled "Congregational Song". Austin C. Lovelace writes an important article on "Early Sacred Folk music in America", of which the second part will appear in the next issue. Waldemar Hille writes on the controversial subject of "Evaluating Gospel Songs"; a lively debate could begin from this article. R. Benjamin Garrison on "Hebrew Hymnody" is refreshing and scholarly. Frederick A. Earle's meditation on some Lenten hymns may prove valuable to those who plan services of meditation with and through hymns. Reviews and notes include an account of the dedication of Mr. Tiplady's new buildings at the Ideal Mission, Lambeth. We judge this the best issue that has yet appeared. Its twenty editors, led by George Litch Knight, deserve our thanks.

CONGRATULATIONS.

We rejoice with our friend, Dr. Reginald McAll, in his marriage on February 2nd to Mrs. May de Forest Payne, a distinguished musician and Bach scholar. Dr. and Mrs. McAll now live at 15 Gramercy Park, New York 3.

CAMBRIDGE CONFERENCE, 1952.

Our Cambridge Conference, as we have already announced, will be held at Wesley House, Jesus Lane, Cambridge from July 1st to 4th. Our activities will follow the usual pattern. The two principal lectures will be given by our joint-chairman, Mr. Frost, on hymnody of the middle eighteenth century, and by The Reverend Dr. J. Alan Kay under the title "For Goodness' Sake! — some standards of value in hymns and tunes". These will take place on the evenings of Tuesday and Wednesday respectively.

It was the convener's intention to arrange a session of hymn singing; unfortunately the church which had arranged to afford us hospitality for that occasion has found itself otherwise committed and has had to withdraw the invitation. This was done with the utmost courtesy and deep apologies, but it means that our third evening is still blank. It is hoped that we may arrange a third lecture. The arrangements will, of course, appear on the detailed agenda which will be circulated to intending members of the conference nearer the time.

Our mornings will be given to business. Mr. Bunn will, we hope, report on *Julian*. We must make further efforts to find a permanent Treasurer. The Editor will ask leave to present a report on the society's file of new hymns and tunes.

Afternoons will be left free, and the early evening will be kept for informal discussions to be led by members of the conference.

If any readers would like to apply for membership of this conference, they are asked at this stage to write to the Convener — Erik Routley, 17 Norham Road, Oxford. These applications should reach Oxford by the end of May. The cost of hospitality at Wesley House will be three guineas for the three days, or 45/- for two days.

ERIK ROUTLEY,
Convener.

Our meetings will be given to patients & friends with a
large report on them. We must make further efforts to find a
permanent speaker. The ladies will ask help to find a speaker
on the subject of life of new friends and friends.
At present will be left free and the early evening will be kept
for musical discussion to be held by members of the choir.
If any readers would like to apply for membership of the choir
they may be asked to write to the Secretary - Miss
Boulton, 14, Grosvenor Road, Oxford. These applications should
reach Oxford by the end of May. The date of payment of fees
there will be some notice for the next day or two for the choir.

REPORT OF THE CHAIRMAN

During the year the all England Conference has been held
at various times and the results have been most successful.
The all England Conference has been held at various times and
the results have been most successful.

REPORT OF THE SECRETARY

Our all England Conference has been held at various times
and the results have been most successful. The all England
Conference has been held at various times and the results
have been most successful. The all England Conference has
been held at various times and the results have been most
successful. The all England Conference has been held at
various times and the results have been most successful.
The all England Conference has been held at various times
and the results have been most successful. The all England
Conference has been held at various times and the results
have been most successful. The all England Conference has
been held at various times and the results have been most
successful. The all England Conference has been held at
various times and the results have been most successful.