

THE HYMN SOCIETY

OF GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND

BULLETIN

60

VOLUME THREE

NUMBER THREE

SUMMER, 1952

Editor: REV. ERIK R. ROUTLEY, M.A., B.D., D.Phil.,
17 Norham Road, Oxford.

Hon. Secretary: REV. F. B. MERRYWEATHER, M.A.,
Oxhill Rectory, Warwickshire.

CONTENTS

Editorial	41
Hymnody Since the Oxford Movement — II (concluded)								
						by the Revd. Cyril Pocknee		42
Two Scottish Collection of Tunes :								
						Bruce (1726) and Bain (1779 and 1786)		
						by the Revd. Maurice Frost		48
Welsh Hymnody Today :								
						A Discussion of <i>Emynau'r E glwys</i> (1952), by Erik Routley		50
Review :								
						<i>The Hymn Festival Movement in America,</i>		
						by R. L. McAll (Editor)		56

EDITORIAL

It is disagreeable to have to record that the Cambridge Conference was, after all, not held this year. Nothing is to be gained by holding conferences, in these days of more and more frequent conferences, for gatherings of eleven people. That is what we should have had at Cambridge. The executive will have to meet some time fairly soon and decide what shall be done. Apologies were due, and were, of course, offered, to those few who had arranged to be present at the Conference. But nobody, we think, who knows of the almost insupportable pressure under which some of the officers of the Society are at present working will quarrel with the decision to cancel what would have been in effect a small family party.

The first necessity, of course, is that we should find ourselves a proper Convener for our conferences. At the present stage in our fortunes it looks as if this Convener must be a person who can travel and spend a good deal of time preparing the ground. It is now clear that the mere announcement of a conference is not enough. If there is no Convener, we had better not try to hold a public conference. If the necessity of a public conference makes itself sufficiently felt in the society, there will be a Convener.

It need not be thought for this reason that our Society is necessarily dying. Our losses by death have been more than compensated by the addition of new members, and efficiency on the part of the Acting-Treasurer has ensured that our income from subscriptions has substantially increased. It seems that on the home front (if our readers will forgive the expression) we are in good shape, but that our foreign policy is defective in technique. We must hope that we may be guided to better things. Two things will wreck the Society in the eyes of most of us, and will betray the exalted aims of its founders. One of these is facile, vulgar and sensational publicity. The other is a stuffy insularity.

HYMNODY SINCE THE OXFORD MOVEMENT — II

by the Revd. CYRIL POCKNEE.

The typical high Anglican hymn book, as exemplified in the books we have already discussed, was a combination of hymns drawn from Latin and Greek sources, in which the dogmatic and traditional elements predominated, together with modern hymns of a more subjective nature but which were dear to the people and also spiritually effective. Since all these books could only be competitors and stand in one another's light, a project was conceived for pooling their resources and evolving a common book which would commend itself to all churches that attempted to follow the principles of the Oxford Movement. The project was set on foot by the Revd. F. H. Murray, Rector of Chislehurst; and through the Revd. Sir H. Williams Baker arrangements were made that the proprietors of a number of competing hymn books should withdraw their respective publications and combine in a common book under the chairmanship of Sir William Baker. A detailed account of the formation of the committee will be found in the historical edition of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* (1909). Thus the most celebrated of all Anglican hymnals came into existence. The original edition appeared in 1861 with 273 hymns. Its success was without parallel in Anglican hymnody and its influence was felt far beyond the Church of England. In the first three years 350,000 copies were sold.

The success of the book was due in no small measure to its title "Hymns Ancient and Modern", which it is thought was suggested

by the musical editor, Dr. W. H. Monk, at that time organist of King's College, London. The book appeared at a time when the Gothic Revival was in full spate and when too, the novels of Sir Walter Scott, with their romantic ideas of the middle ages, had left their mark on the nation. It is difficult for the twentieth century critic to view dispassionately the contents of the book, so different is the temper of our age from that of the mid-Victorian era. Both in words and music "A. & M." was inferior to hymnals that had already appeared, e.g., Blew and Gauntlett's *Church Hymn and Tune Book* (1852). Amongst the original compositions that are likely to have abiding value are, "The King of Love, my shepherd is" and "Lord, thy word abideth" both from the pen of the editor. The liberties taken with traditional, and even 18th century, melodies have left a mark upon Anglican hymnody which the editors of later books have been unable to eradicate. Let the reader look at the version of the tune MOUNT EPHRAIM as given in *E.H.* 196. It is almost impossible to recognise this as the original form of the emasculated ST. HELENA found in all editions of "A. & M."

In the revised edition of 1875 the number of tunes by contemporary musicians such as Dykes, Barnby and Stainer was greatly augmented. These tunes have the merits and defects of their period; and it is the superabundance of this type of tune in *Hymns Ancient and Modern* which makes the book so characteristic of its period, and also has made it such a vulnerable target for 20th century criticism. Nevertheless, it was through these tunes, with their cloying harmonies and unenterprising rhythm, that the book found its way into parishes where the influence of the Tractarians had not penetrated hitherto.

By 1860 the effects of the Oxford Movement were noticed in the manner in which the Holy Communion was celebrated particularly on Sundays. There now began a revival of traditional ceremonial and a full choral celebration of the Holy Eucharist. Consequently we find a number of hymn books were published designed solely for the Service of the Altar. While not strictly speaking a hymn book, but rather an anthology of religious verse and prayers connected with the Holy Eucharist, mention should be made of *Lyra Eucharistica* published first in 1863, and enlarged in 1864, by the Revd. Orby Shipley. The book contains many hymns and prayers from ancient and modern sources related to the Holy Eucharist. The second edition of 1864 is noteworthy for its translation "Let all mortal flesh keep silence" by the Revd. Gerard Moultrie from the ancient Greek liturgy of St. James. Moultrie's translation is today widely known and used in churches that have a sung Eucharist. Hymn books designed to make full provision for Eucharistic worship continued to be published in increasing numbers amongst which we would mention *Eucharistic Hymnal* (1877) and the *Altar Hymnal* (1884).

The first of these books contains 119 hymns and follows the usual order of the Christian Year as set out in the Book of Common Prayer. Usually four hymns are provided at the Eucharist for each season or occasion in the liturgical cycle, viz., Processional, Offertory, after Consecration, after Blessing. Typical hymns are: W. Chatterton Dix's "Allelluya, sing to Jesus" and Bishop J. R. Woodford's translation of the *Adoro te devote* as "Thee we adore." The *Altar Hymnal* was edited by Mrs. C. R. Hernaman and contains much original matter including some new translations from the Latin by Dr. R. F. Littledale. The 182 compositions consist, however, not only of metrical hymnody but also of the Propers of the Mass for every Sunday and festival in the Liturgical Year. The Propers are translations of the Introits, Graduals, Offertories, and Communions found in the *Sarum Missal*. Another feature of the book is its translations of some of the Sequences that were sung between the Epistle and the Gospel in the pre-Reformation rites, and also a number of translations of the celebrated Latin prose for use in processions known as the *Salve festa dies*. The translators of these latter have however, failed to preserve the rhythm and metre of the Latin text so that the translations cannot be sung to the melody traditionally associated with the *Salve*.

Mention should also be made of *The Hymner* (1882) which follows much on the lines of the *Altar Hymnal* and is to be noted for its felicitous translations by the Revd. M. J. Blacker of the Latin sequences, some of which have passed into wider use through their inclusion in *The English Hymnal* (1906). The Third edition of *The Hymner* came under the editorship of the Revd. G. H. Palmer in 1891. He was an outstanding authority on plainsong and liturgical music; and his publication with its use of plainsong and pre-Reformation hymns and sequences may be said to represent the high-water mark of liturgical hymnody in the 19th century.

The appeal of such a book was, however, limited to congregations that had been educated in history and liturgy. At the end of the 19th century *Hymns Ancient and Modern* seemed to be at its zenith, and unchallenged in the affections of the average high-church congregation. But the closing years of the century witnessed the publication of a work that was a portent of 20th century criticism of Victorian hymnody. Published in four parts, between 1895 and 1899, *The Yattendon Hymnal* set a standard that has remained unchallenged down to the present day. Apart from its contents the book is a collector's piece, both in format and typography. The letterpress was in Fell Roman and Italics and the music types by Peter Walpergen. The editors were Robert Bridges (later Poet-Laureate), and H. Ellis Wooldridge, Professor of Poetry at Oxford. The collection has 100 hymns, a number of which are original compositions by Bridges or his translations from Latin and Greek sources.

The book did not command a widespread use but later hymnals have drawn freely upon it. Amongst Bridges' original compositions that have passed into wider use is "Rejoice, O land in God thy might", and his translation "O gladsome light, O grace" from the 3rd century *φῶς λαμπρόν*. In his translations of Latin hymns he did not always adhere closely to the meaning of the original, e.g., "Happy are they" for Coffin's *O quam juvat*. But this is not the case with "Joy and triumph everlasting" from Adam of St. Victor's sequence *Supernae matris gaudia*. In our opinion this hymn wedded to Bourgeois' psalm-tune is one of the outstanding achievements of the book. Attention should also be drawn to his excellent translation of the celebrated *Veni Creator Spiritus* as "Come, O Creator Spirit, Come". Now that this is included in *Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised* and *English Hymnal* it is much to be wished that it will displace the unsatisfactory version "Come, Holy Ghost, our souls inspire". It is to be hoped too, that the editors of future hymn books will prefer Bridges' virile rendering "When morning gilds the skies" from the German *Beim fruhen Morgenlicht* instead of Caswall's sentimental translation that is still found in *E.H.* and *H.A.M.R.*

In 1892 the Convocation of Canterbury suggested that the next revision of *Hymns A. & M.* should be in the hands of a committee appointed by Convocation, and that after publication proprietorship should be vested in Convocation. After some negotiations the idea of an authorised hymn book was abandoned; but in the meantime the Committee of *Hymns A. & M.* had agreed to undertake a revision of their book. The revision took ten years and the book was published at Trinity, 1904. The "New Edition" (as it was called) contained some valuable new material, both in words and music. Dr. A. J. Mason, an accomplished theologian and scholar, was amongst the contributors. While on the musical side the eminent musicians (Sir) Charles V. Stanford and Sir Hubert Parry gave much assistance and wrote several hymn tunes. The plainsong texts were carefully corrected by the Revd. W. H. Frere and the Revd. G. H. Palmer. A number of 18th century English melodies as well as some French ecclesiastical tunes were included for the first time. But the book remained over-weighted with Victorian compositions and it failed to take account of the social aspects of the Christian message of which there was now a growing consciousness amongst thoughtful people.

Hymns A. & M. (1904) was a colossal failure, and an immense financial loss was incurred by the proprietors. The book received a number of bad press reviews and one eminent journal made much of the fact that the editors had restored Charles Wesley's "Hark, how all the welkin rings" for the familiar but bowdlerised version "Hark, the Herald angels sing".

In 1904 there also appeared *Songs of Syon* edited by the Revd.

G. R. Woodward and assisted by Charles Wood, Mus. Doc., and the Revd. G. H. Palmer. A full set of Office hymns from the Sarum cycle was included and set to their proper planchant melodies. The editors also rescued from oblivion some of the finest 16th, 17th and 18th century melodies. There were many new translations from Latin, Greek and German sources, some from the pen of Dr. Woodward. Like *The Yattendon Hymnal* the book did not command widespread use, but it has been an inspiration and used as a source-book by the editors of later hymnals.

By the turn of the century the Anglo-Catholic movement had grown rapidly in numbers and importance; and an active section of its leaders had adopted a "progressive" attitude that differed considerably from the cautious traditionalism of the older Tractarians. It was from this progressive element in the movement that there was produced on Ascension Day, 1906, *The English Hymnal*. This book is undoubtedly the most important hymnal that has appeared in this century; and in certain aspects of hymnody it was a pioneer. Writing in 1952 in connection with a review of *The B.B.C. Hymn Book* Dr. Henry Havergal states: "Every good book since 1906 is indebted to *E.H.* and it is a measure of the greatness of that book that this indebtedness is still increasing after nearly half a century" (*English Church Music*).

The book was produced under the general editor, The Revd. Percy Dearmer (1867-1936), Vicar of St. Mary-the-Virgin, Primrose Hill; and he was assisted by a committee of scholarly and influential churchmen, composed of priests and laymen. With prophetic insight Dr. Dearmer invited a then comparatively unknown musician, Ralph Vaughan Williams, to be responsible for the music. Many of the hymns with their tunes were "tried out" on the congregation at St. Mary's Primrose Hill before the book was published.

A full set of Office Hymns, Sequences and Processionals was provided from the Sarum Use, and a set of Propers of the Mass was drawn from the same source. Many new translations were provided for the book from Latin, Greek and German hymns. The general editor contributed some of these as well as some original verses of his own amongst which are to be found "Jesu, good above all other" (598). Amongst the hymns written for the book we select, "O faith of England" by Dr. T. A. Lacey (1853-1931), and the translation from the Greek *Liturgy of St. James* "From glory to glory advancing" by C. W. Humphreys, as being of outstanding merit.

Although the editors in their preface disclaim any intention of producing a party book, it has a high sacramental tone and in this respect reflects the views of the Committee, all of whom were associated with the Anglo-Catholic movement. Had the book included only hymns of that character its appeal would have been limited. Dr. Dearmer was however a Christian Socialist and under his in-

fluence a number of hymns were included that reflected the teaching of Maurice, Kingsley and Westcott. Such hymns are written in a style that is broadly theistic and has a "non-ecclesiastical" flavour. These hymns appearing for the first time in an Anglican hymnal made an appeal to many minds that were unaffected the liturgico-dogmatic compositions in the book. Hymns of this type include: "Judge eternal, throned in splendour" (423) by Canon H. Scott Holland (1847-1918), "City of God, how broad, how fair" (375) by Samuel Johnson (1822-82), and "Immortal, invisible, God only wise" (407) by W. Chalmers Smith (1824-1908).

On the musical side the choice of melodies was truly "catholic" in both senses of that obliging word, ranging from plainsong through the French ecclesiastical tunes to German chorals, as well as French, Swiss and Scottish psalm-tunes. Welsh melodies are well represented including the splendid BRYN CALFARIA. English melodies range from Tallis and Gibbons to the 16th and 17th century psalm-tunes and also include delightful 18th century tunes such as HARRINGTON. Dr. Williams also drew upon English folk-song melodies, e.g. SHIPSTON (390), a source that had been previously ignored. The inclusion of this type of melody was much criticised by conservative churchmen and musicians. The musical editor also wrote some tunes himself including the beautiful DOWN AMPNEY to "Come down, O love divine" (152), and the virile SINE NOMINE to Bishop Walsham How's "For all the Saints" (641). These two tunes undoubtedly stand in the front rank of modern compositions.

In assessing the important contribution which *The English Hymnal* has made to Anglican hymnody in this century, and indeed to the general standard of worship amongst English-speaking Christians, we need to remember that the editors were able to draw upon other collections of outstanding merit, some of which we have already discussed. Thus several of Robert Bridges' compositions were taken from *The Yattendon Hymnal* such as "Joy and Triumph everlasting" (200) and "O gladsome light, O grace" (269). Some of the melodies from Woodward's *Songs of Syon* have also been employed. Dr. Dearmer was also indebted to W. Garrett Horder, for it is in the latter's *Congregational Hymns* (1884) and *Worship Song* (1905) that such hymns as "Immortal, invisible" by W. Chalmers Smith and "Thy kingdom come! on bended knee" by F. L. Hosmer (1840-1929) were first introduced into England.

The publication in 1950 of *Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised* is the first serious attempt that the proprietors of that book have assayed, since the failure of the 1904 edition, to produce a "reformed" book. Even so, this revision is both conservative and cautious; and the editors expressly disclaim any intention of "breaking fresh ground or of exploiting novel ideas". Nevertheless, it is obvious to anyone who looks through the book that they have pro-

fited by the researches and efforts that have been made over the last half-century to raise the standard of Anglican hymnody. The new book is indebted to *English Hymnal* for some of its new and best material. There are, as one would expect new hymns and tunes by contemporary writers. We note the late Dr. R. G. Parson's Eucharistic hymn "We hail thy glorious presence" is amongst the new compositions. On the musical side there is still much dead wood in spite of considerable pruning and the editors seem unable to abandon that *bête noire* of Victorian hymnody, the expression mark. In spite of these criticisms, if this book finds anything like wide acceptance in those churches where the older editions of *Hymns A. & M.* are cherished, it will help to bring about a long-needed reform in some aspects of Anglican Hymnody.

TWO SCOTTISH COLLECTIONS OF TUNES

by the REV. MAURICE FROST.

The / Common Tunes : / or, / Scotland's / Church Musick / Made Plain, / By Mr. Thomas Bruce School- / master in Edinburgh. / (Device) / Edinburgh : / Printed for the Author, and Sold by most Booksellers / in Town; as also by the Author, at his House in the Cow- / gate, near the College-Wynd. M.DDC.XXVI. There is a brief description of this book in Dr. Millar Patrick's *Four Centuries of Scottish Psalmody*, p. 123.

The book is a small 8vo volume, with an engraved frontispiece of a plump winged cherub (not unpunishable) holding an oblong music book open to view, against a background of a country kirk. After the preface (one leaf) comes "A / Description / of the / Antiquity, Use, Authors and / Inventors of Musick." This covers pages i to viii. We then have "The / Gam-ut, / or / Scale of Musick / Explain'd". This occupies pages 1 to 42. It is interesting to find the author using the old rhymes which I think go back to Byrd, and certainly come in Playford's *Introduction*, and are repeated, e.g. in Clifford's *Divine Services* :

*No Man can sing true at first Sight
Unless he names his Notes aright:
Which soon is learn'd if that your mi,
You know its Place, where'er it be.*

Bruce makes a few slight verbal alterations, but source of the rhymes is obvious.

*If that no Flat be set in B,
Then in that Place standeth your mi
But if your B alone be flat,
Then E is mi, be sure of that.*

And so to the end of the series.

We then come to twenty-one leaves of engraved music, printed on one side of the paper only. The first of these gives the various

notes, Cliffs and intervals, with a coat of arms at the foot, with the engraver's name, "Tho Calder sculp". Then come the Psalm tunes in three parts, followed by the music for seven songs.

The sources of the tunes are as follows :

Anglo-Genevan 1558 : PSALM CXIX.

Daman 1579 : ENGLISH and LONDON (the latter in the usual Scottish form).

Daman 1591 : DUNDEE.

Este 1592 : MONROS (KENTISH in Este).

Scottish 1615 : KINGS, DUKES, FRENCH, STILT, ABBEY, DUMFERMLING, GLASGOW, MARTYRS.

Ravenscroft 1621 : ST. DAVIDS, DURHAM.

Scottish 1625 : ELGIN.

Scottish 1634 : CULROSS, GALLOWAY.

Scottish 1635 : NEWTOWN, JEDBURGH, MELROS, INVERNESS, WIGTON, MAXTOUN.

The tunes which have not yet been traced to any earlier book are : EDINBURGH, THE PRINCE OF WALES, THE PRINCESS OF WALES, HADDINGTON, ST. JOHNSTONE, ST. ANDREWS, BRUCE'S.

Following the psalm-tunes are the songs :

1. Coridon arise.
2. Doe not, O do not prize thy beauty at too high a rate.
3. Go to bed sweet Muse.
4. Joy to the person of my love.
5. Gather your rose buds whilst you may.
6. Sheperd did you see my dear.
7. Oh the bonny Christ Church Bells.

Then come the "Lines for lettering the Common Tunes", which Dr. Millar Patrick printed in full on pages 165 and 166 of his book. Finally we have additional verses for Songs 1, 4, 5 and 6. The music pages are unnumbered, but these last four pages of words carry on the earlier series, being numbered 43 - 46.

The next book is considerably later, but is also a Scottish publication. There is a copy of the fourth edition in the National Library of Scotland, and a copy of the fifth lies beside me. The imprint of the former is :

By John Baine, Teacher of Music in Glasgow. / Fourth Edition / Glasgow : Printed for and sold by the Author. / MDCC LXXIX.

The title page of the fifth edition reads :

An / Easy Introduction / to the / Principles of Music : / with a / Collection of Church-Tunes, / Suited to the different Metres in that Version of the Psalms, authorised by the General / Assembly of the Church of Scotland. / By John Bain, late Teacher of Vocal Music in Glasgow. / The fifth edition, with corrections and improvements. / Glasgow : Printed for, and sold by, William Bain. / M.DCC.LXXXVI.

After the title page comes "An Introduction to Music", pages 3 to 16 (pages 1 and 2 being the title page — page 2 a blank). There then come sixteen pages of engraved music, the first two being the Gamut or Scale and other similar tables, and the actual tunes starting on page 3.

The tunes in the two editions are identical, except that the fifth edition has two extra leaves at the end, printed on one side only, containing the tune ST. JAMES'S, the Treble and Counter for WALSAL and CROWLE, and a NEW HYMN from Thomas Moore's 1756 book.

The sources of the tunes are as follows:—

Anglo-Genevan 1558: Psalms 119, 124, 148.
 Anglo-Genevan 1561: Psalm 100.
 Scottish 1565: Psalm 143.
 Daman 1579: LONDON (Scottish form).
 Daman 1591: DUNDEE, SOUTHWELL.
 Scottish 1615: FRENCH, ABBEY, MARTYRS, STILT.
 Ravenscroft 1621: ST. DAVIDS.
 Prys 1621: ST. MARY'S.
 Scottish 1625. ELGIN.
 Scottish 1635: LONDON NEW.
 Barton 1644: COLESHILL.
 (Select Psalms 1697: ST. JAMES'S).
 Supplement to N.V. 1708: ST. ANN'S, ST. MATTHEWS.
 J. & J. Green 1715: ST. NEOTS (Set to Ps. 128 by Green and called WORKSOP), GREEN'S 100 (Ps. 125, 2nd metre in Green).
 Chetham 1718: NORWICH, WIRKSWORTH.
 Anchors c. 1721: WALSAL, STROUDWATER, (STROUDWATER NEW in Anchors).
 Green 1724: CROWLE.
 Tans'ur 1735: BANGOR.
 Lampe 1746: Psalm 145 (Hymn 18, later known as KENT or DEVONSHIRE).
 Chalmer's 1749: ST. PAULS.
 T. Moore 1750: ST. IVES, WHITECHURCH.
 Knibb c. 1753: ST. THOMAS.
 (T. Moore 1756: NEW TUNE).

Even a tiny book like this shows how rapidly the repertoire of Scottish psalm-singers had been enlarged since Bruce broke away from the twelve common-tunes.

WELSH HYMNODY TODAY

by ERIK ROUTLEY

This article, which (for reasons which will presently appear) I prefer to write under my own name than as Editor, is based on the new hymn book of the Church of Wales, whose full description is as follows: *Emynau'r Eglwys*, Western Mail and Echo, Ltd.,

Cardiff, 1951. (No price is mentioned). This cannot be a full review, because all but three of the hymns are in Welsh, and I confess with shame that my knowledge of the mysterious tongue of my Welsh friends is not sufficient for me to write intelligently about their hymns. Nor am I certain that it is not an impertinence for an Englishman to offer a review of a Welsh hymn book. It is very likely that one needs a closer knowledge than I have of the traditions of the Episcopal Church in Wales, and of the tensions between those traditions and the Calvinist-Methodist and other evangelical bodies, to do justice to any Welsh hymn book. I propose, then, to confess and even to advertise my ignorance in order that perhaps some of my questions and infelicities may provoke an answer from Wales that will enlighten and help me and others beside me.

This hymn book is edited by two distinguished scholars who share the same name. The words-editor is Canon W. H. Harris of Lampeter, the music editor, Dr. W. H. Harris of Windsor. When you find the name on the pages of the book it is, with a single exception, the name of the words-editor, who has contributed a number of translations into Welsh. The music editor has modestly contributed only his celebrated ALBERTA — something of a change, this, from what we have seen in some new books recently reviewed in our pages.

The production of the book is, for these days, very fair. Normally the print and music type are legible and not unpleasant to the eye. Here and there a tune has been crowded on to a page in rather small type; and in two places we have the preposterous arrangement of a tune at the foot of a right-hand page referring to a hymn at the top of the next left-hand page. These (227 and 243) are obviously mistakes, but they are bad ones.

The book resembles very closely the *English Hymnal*. It is, indeed, a Welsh version of that book. (Here for the first time appears the chief question I have to ask). For one thing, the arrangement of the hymns in sections, even their alphabetical arrangement within sections, is exactly the same as that employed in *E.H.* Against *E.H.*'s 656 this book has 611 hymns, ending with Processionals and Litanies. These are followed by liturgical material corresponding to *E.H.* 657ff., a section of psalms pointed for plain-song chanting, settings of the Communion Service, and a few congregational anthems and carols. An appendix contains a Creed and another Communion setting, the *Miserere* pointed to the Tonus Regius, St. Patrick's Breastplate (in Welsh), a few Welsh hymns and three English ones, and a Calendar of Welsh saints. The book is, indeed, a complete manual of praise for the Church in Wales.

The resemblance to *E.H.* is further to be seen in the contents of the book. Of the 611 hymns, only 351 are Welsh originals, 119 are translations of English hymns that appear in *E.H.*, and 49 are

translations of English hymns not appearing in that book; 76 are Welsh versions of hymns originating in languages other than English, of which English versions appear in *E.H.* (but whether these are translations of the originals or of the English versions in *E.H.* I cannot judge), and 16 are translations from non-English originals of which *E.H.* contains no version. The proportion of *E.H.* hymns to the total is therefore something like 31 : 69, and the proportion of non-Welsh hymns to the total, 43 : 57.

Editorial details have been well attended to. The vexatious business of tracing sources seems to me to have been carefully conducted. I noticed one or two odd misprints — J. B. Southgate for T.B.S. at 586 (and what a dreadful tune, to be sure!) and “Thou who at thy first Eucharist” (headline of 289) for “O Thou who at thy Eucharist”.¹ Here also are a few questionable ascriptions — 74, SALM DON 51, known in England as SOUTHWELL (Old version) or LONDON OLD, goes back behind Prys at least to Daman (1579); 96, ACH GOTT UND HERR, here printed in its original minor-key version, appeared in *As Hymnodus Sacer* (1625) before Schein got hold of it; 130, STROUDWATER is certainly older than 1899, going back to Wilkins’ *Psalmody* of the early 18th century (the precise date is Mr. Frost’s province rather than mine — somewhere in the 1720’s). 16, FULDA, cannot be ascribed to “Beethoven” *simpliciter*. I fancy it is arranged by W. Gardiner (1812) from a snatch of Mozart’s *O Isis und Osiris* (in *The Magic Flute*). By the same token I should like to know more about the ascription of ENGEDI (255) to Beethoven and the origin of CARMEL (198), attributed to Tallis (it is similarly attributed to *Emynau a Thonau*, 1929). I wonder, too, whether it was wise to perpetuate the *E.H.* confusion between REX GLORIOSE and O AMOR QUAM ECSTATICUS (99 and 160; *E.H.* 125 and 215), which, except for three notes, are the same tune.

But it is the new musical material that interests me, and alarms me, more than all this. It is here that I want to raise my question; and perhaps it is not unfair to begin, not from a new tune, but from a single collocation of hymn and tune. Consider Hymn 77, “Ai am fy meiau i” by John Elias o Fon (1774-1841). This is a hymn as Welsh as a hymn could well be. It is in the Calvinist-Methodist book, *Emynau a Thonau*, to which I have already referred. Mention the hymn to any Welsh evangelical, and he will immediately sing you that almost intolerably dramatic tune CYMER, by Lewis Davies, set to it in that book (tune 302). Now why was this tune rejected, and replaced by (1) SOUTHWELL (new style, as *E.H.* 77) and (2) ST. BRIDE? Excellent tunes, these — for Englishmen. But has their psalm-tune austerity, their essentially impersonal gait, anything in common with this exceedingly Celtic hymn? Is it not true that its drama is indeed intolerable to the English mind?

¹ “O Thou who . . .” are the first words on the first appearance of the hymn in 1881. The other version is a variant in *Hymns A. & M.* (1889).

It is certainly true that you could not well sing it to any English hymn.

Now I am asking whether this is not a symptom of an anglicising tendency in this book, of which its close alliance with *E.H.* is another symptom. This is indeed an anglicising, even an anglo-catholicising book, and it poses for me an acute problem. Is it good editing? Is it good history? Or is it an inevitable consequence of ecclesiastical politics?

Let me turn to the tunes in general, and particularly to the new tunes. The editors will say, and justly, that many of the great Welsh tunes are here — MOAB, LLAGRISTIOLUS, TREWEN, LLEF, GLAN GEIRIONYDD; that they have some fine modern Welsh tunes, PENNANT, for example, and the three magnificent melodies of Morfydd Owen (1892-1918), RICHARD, WILLIAM, and PEN UCHA. They will earn my hearty gratitude, and that of many discerning Welshmen, for resisting CWM RHONDDA; and their omission of EBENEZER is also in line with the best Welsh traditions, though we like it well in England. But when all this is said, and we compare the contents of this book with those of *Emynau a Thonau*, it is quite clear that the general standard of Welsh music here is lower than there. John Ambrose Lloyd, justly popular among Welsh composers, but often more English than Welsh in his idiom, appears seventeen times in the index. David Evans, an apostle of Welsh music, to be sure, but seldom quite happy in his handling of the true Welsh idiom (though MYNWY, 36, is magnificent) appears sixteen times. Some names are here that are not at all in *Emynau a Thonau*, and though none are names of young men, their work lacks the spontaneous urgency of the classical Welsh tune. There were indications in the (at that time) young men of *Emynau a Thonau*, that the classical Welsh tradition still flourished. John Hughes’s MAELOR (58 in *E.T.*) and Parry Williams’s GLYNNEDD (178) are indistinguishable from the great Welsh melodies of a hundred years and more earlier. I believe, indeed, that there is an essential difference between the “precentor’s tune” and the “professor’s tune” in Wales, and that it is in the former that we hear the native Welsh genius.

It would perhaps be invidious to select particular tunes for the purpose of reinforcing this criticism. Either the reader will agree with the general point or he will disagree, and we must leave it at that. But it is proper that I should defend what some may think a dangerous generalisation in the preceding paragraph. What, historically, is the “native Welsh genius” that I claim is being retarded, and even repressed, in this hymn book? To pursue this I must rehearse the history of the Welsh hymn tune since the Reformation.

It will be familiar to our readers that the first great name in the story is that of Archdeacon Prys (1544-1626). Prys it was who translated the Psalms into metrical Welsh, and provided for them

certain tunes. Many of the tunes he provided were borrowed from English sources. But there appeared in his book for the first time ST. MARY (*E.H.* 84) and SONG 67 (*E.H.* 197), often mistakenly (as Mr. Frost has discovered) ascribed to Gibbons. There is nothing Welsh about SONG 67, but most certainly there is a queer quality of ruggedness about ST. MARY. If, further, you look at the tunes marked "Welsh tune" in Ravenscroft's Psalter of 1621, you find in a higher degree the same quality. One or two of these are positively unvocal. ST. DAVID in its original version (see *Songs of Praise Discussed*, at No. 301 or *Oxford Hymnal* 128) is steep enough to defeat all but the real rock-climbers; and several of the others are of the same kind.

Welsh psalmody of the classic Puritan period, then, manifests the surprising vice of unvocal ugliness, the very reverse of what we find in the "typical Welsh tune". It is possible that this was the result of Welsh puritanism's attempt to break away from secular idioms and to establish for itself a "church idiom", adding to its own difficulties by casting its tunes in a metre — Common Metre — which was quite foreign to the Celtic genius. However that may be, we find that apart from these few indigenous psalm tunes there is precious little native Welsh hymnody during the whole of the Golden Age of English psalmody. Welsh puritanism was content either to sing English psalm tunes or to emigrate to England and emerge in the John Penrys and John Owens of our puritan history.

I am told,¹ moreover, by those who have pursued close studies in this direction, that the Welsh contribution to theology during the period before the Evangelical revival was almost negligible. It does seem that the age of the puritans in Wales was singularly unfruitful in music and letters. In hymnody, at any rate, its unfruitfulness can be assessed by a glance at the dates in the author's and composers' indexes of any hymn book containing Welsh tunes. (*Emynau a Thonau*, shame upon it, has not these indexes).

The impact of the Evangelical Revival on Wales was, of course, as violent as it was anywhere else. Both there and in England its musical effect was to set the people free from the prevailing "church tradition" of psalmody, and cause them to exploit the popular idioms of the operatic and secular stage. But whereas in England this was to cut the people loose from a noble, if at that date decadent, tradition of psalmody, it was in Wales to liberate the singing Christian from an almost complete silence. The result was the great flood of Welsh music in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Characteristically, the Welsh preachers added to Wesleyan evangelism the dark and dramatic colours of Calvinism, and so the Welsh Methodists are traditionally also Calvinists and Pres-

¹ I should like to accord my gratitude to my friend, Mr. Emyr Evans, who has given me much help, including translating the Preface for me.

byterians. But in the Welsh Revival there was little time for denominational distinctions. What mattered was the new outflowing of the Gospel through preaching and singing. The Welsh still failed to produce theologians, because their theology was now in their music.

The results of this in which I am at present interested are these. First, it meant that musically the traditional Welsh hymn tune (whether we know its composer's name or not) is anchored to eighteenth century tonality, rather than to the earlier modal idioms. The great modal Welsh hymn tunes like BRAINT are the exceptional survivals of an earlier art. Your typical Welsh tune is highly organised in form and its melody places great emphasis on the notes of the common chord, while its harmony exploits the tensions of the melodic minor scale to the full. This is the legacy not of Geneva or William Byrd but of Bach and Handel. Then, secondly, I find in the notable combination in Welsh tunes of musical discipline and urgency of rhetoric a reflection of the process by which the imaginative and visionary qualities in Welshmen were canalised and disciplined by the Evangelical revival, issuing in that fervour, often a narrow fervour, in the Gospel which is typical of Welsh evangelicals. Some Welsh tunes succeed in combining this rhetoric with an extreme economy of form, like LLANFAIR, JOANNA, and CRUGYBAR. Others use the device of melodic development, like LLEF and TREWEN and CYFAMOD. Yet others rely on that relentless yet shapely continuity of melody which is one of the crowning achievements of the music-maker's art; GLAN GEIRIONYDD is one of these.

And yet, though so rich in harmony, the classical Welsh tune relies hardly at all on the colour of modality: and though rhythmically so compelling, it rarely uses the devices of irregular rhythm. It is all in the context of the classical music of the eighteenth century; it has nothing in common with plainsong or with the Lutheran or Genevan idioms.

This technique of composition, essentially the precentor's technique, and usually the work of a mind natively but not professionally or learnedly musical, continues from the middle of the eighteenth century through the nineteenth century to the beginning of the twentieth. Among the great names are J. R. Jones (RAMOTH, born 1765), R. Williams (LLANFAIR, b. 1781), W. Lloyd (MEIRIONYDD b. 1786), R. Edwards (CAERSALEM, b. 1797), and E. Evans (GLAN GEIRIONYDD, b. 1795 or '99). In later generations we have John Ambrose Lloyd (b. 1815), Ieuan Gwyllt (MOAB, b. 1822) and D. Emlyn Evans (TREWEN, PENLAN, b. 1843), and so on down to Tom Carrington (b. 1881) and John Hughes (b. 1896). This technique comes from a culture which, long separated from English culture by historic barriers going back to the Saxon invasion itself, came to new and intense life under the Evangelical Revival.

This is my justification for referring to a comparatively recent

technique of tune-composition as a "native Welsh idiom". I find no trace of a native Welsh idiom in hymn tunes before this. The present hymn book makes me ask, what has happened to this technique? Why do the new tunes suggest so strongly a technique less spontaneous than that of the precentors, and more akin to that of the editor who (unlike Dr. Harris) writes a tune to fill a gap in his book rather than under compulsion of the Spirit?

I fancy that the strongest corroboration for my contention will be found in the Preface. It is there written by the musical editor that every effort has been made to enrich the book with music that will be acceptable to popular taste. Then popular taste wants this new and milder technique rather than the urgency of the older style. I suppose the Editor has his reasons for believing this, and I can only take his word for it. But if Wales will swallow this, what will Wales say to the direction (page ix) that the congregation should sing in unison, and that unless the choir is well balanced it ought to sing in unison too? Can this be acceptable to popular taste in Wales? Is our English admiration for the Welsh native genius for singing in harmony based after all on a legend?

I am truly alarmed by that last plain direction. It is, of course, based on the similar direction in Dr. Vaughan Williams's Preface to the *English Hymnal*. It may be right for England (I am not even sure of this); but it makes me think that we have here a Welsh version of a triumphantly English Hymnal. And I want to know whether, on the evidence of the Preface, the tune-collocations, and the quality of the new tunes, this is really the way to recall Wales to the Catholic Faith.

The Hymn Festival Movement in America, by Dr. R. L. McALL, Hymn Society of America, Special Paper No. XVI, 1951.

By now many of our readers will have seen this admirable and most interesting paper on the history and practice of Hymn Festivals. Dr. McAll, of course, is an acknowledged authority in this field. He divides his paper under the following heads: Introduction; The Rise of Modern Hymn Festivals; Organization of a Hymn Festival; Types of Hymn Festivals, with illustrations; Elements of Co-operation; Anniversaries, Community-wide Festivals, and the Significance of the movement.

Eight specimen orders are appended, including one from Wales and another from China. The necessity for some form of discipline, thematic or occasional, in any festival is very properly stressed. We hope that any who have the organization of such occasions in England as part of their duties will obtain and carefully consider this pamphlet. It may be had from the Hymn Society, 297 Fourth Avenue, New York 10.