

THE HYMN SOCIETY

OF GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND

BULLETIN

62

VOLUME THREE

NUMBER FIVE

WINTER, 1952-3

Editor: REV. ERIK R. ROUTLEY, M.A., B.D., D.Phil.,
17 Norham Road, Oxford.

Hon. Secretary: REV. F. B. MERRYWEATHER, M.A.,
Oxhill Rectory, Warwickshire.

CONTENTS

<i>Harmonia Sacra</i> — II, by the Rev. Maurice Frost	...	73
Reviews : <i>Hospital Hymn Book</i> (T. C. Micklem)	...	79
<i>Hymns and Human Life</i> , by Erik Routley (J. Blair-Fish)		81
The Hymn Society : Report of Executive Committee, 1952, with a report from the Editor of <i>Julian Revised</i>	...	85
French Church Melodies, by C. E. Pocknee	...	86
Playford's <i>Divine Companion</i> , a note by Maurice Frost	...	86

HARMONIA SACRA, By THOMAS BUTTS — II by the Revd. MAURICE FROST.

Now what are we to say about the date of this edition? I would be much happier if it did not contain the hymn "And let this feeble body fail", which appeared first, as I have said, in *Funeral Hymns*, 1759. Unless the hymn had been in use before it was printed therein the British Museum date c. 1760 must stand, in which case it is hard not to conclude that Wesley, in *Select Hymns* 1761, was referring to an earlier lost edition. The only similar case I have come across is S. Wesley's hymn, "The Sun of Righteousness appears". According to Julian this was first printed in his *Poems on Several Occasions*, 1736. But it appears in Smith and Prelluer, *The Harmonious Companion*, 1732, as a hymn for Easter Day, changed from C.M. into D.L.M. with "Alleluias". Of course it may be that Wesley altered an existing L.M. hymn, in which case the parallel between it and "And let this feeble body fail" is imaginary.

If we can by-pass the evidence of "And let this feeble body fail" is there any other evidence which might enable us to date the book more in accordance with Wesley's "Some years ago"? One of the tunes which DMM and HS have in common is the one called WESTMINSTER or DUBLIN. In the former book it is set to "Loving Saviour Prince of Peace", the metre being 7.7.7.7.D. Butts, however, sets it to "Love Divine, all Loves excelling", 8.7.8.7.D. These words date from 1747, and were surely written for the tune, for they are a parody on "Fairest Isle, all Isles excelling". It is hard to believe that Whitefield was the first to adapt the tune in 1754! But is that an adequate reason for dating Butts's book first? Personally I do not think it is — certainly not adequate for so dating this edition — for both Whitefield and Butts must have codified, to a certain extent, tunes which were familiar before they put them into print. I shall not feel really satisfied until someone discovers another copy of *Harmonia Sacra* which can be safely dated before (a).

When we turn to the edition which I have called (b) we find that thirty-four tunes have been omitted and fifty-five added. The latter include the Canon "Non nobis" and the round "O Absolom my son", together with three pieces without name or heading. None of these five appear in the Index. The tunes traced to definitely earlier psalm books are:

A.G. 1558	p. 187. NEW YORK (Ps. cxix).
Divine Companion 1701	p. 99. Anon. (Anthem xvii, by Thomas Clark).
Foundery Collection 1742	p. 149. TRINITY (HEMDYKE).
Lampe 1746	p. 147. DESIRING DEATH (9).
	p. 182. AT LYING DOWN (15).
John Travers, Psalms, 1746	p. 41. Anon. (Psalm ix).
James Evison, Psalmody, 1750	p. 220. CUDHAM (STROUD).
Divine Musical Miscellany 1754	p. 222. FOR THE EPIPHANY (WANSTED).

I feel uncertain about the tune CUDHAM. Evison is the earliest dated book in which I have found it, but it appears in the 6th and later editions of Abraham Adams's *The Psalmist's New Companion*. The first edition, which I have not yet found, was published c. 1751 (the second edition was advertised in 1752). It is named there CUDHAM, not STROUD. It also appears in Abraham Milner's *The Psalm Singer's Companion* (1751) as NEW NEWBURY. But possibly earlier still is its appearance in an edition of Michael Beesly's *A Book of Psalmody*, without a name, and set to Psalm 77, O.V. pt. 2. Milner certainly used this book, for he prints one of the tunes and calls it BEESLY. Butts, I imagine took it (and the name) from Adams.

With regard to some of the other tunes there may be some doubt as to which book has priority of claim.

DORSET (p. 36) also appears in the Lock Hospital *Collection*.

OATHAM (p. 75) is in both the Lock Hospital *Collection* and in the second edition of *Sacred Melody*, 1765, where it is called HOTHAM. It is one of Madan's own tunes.

JOHN XVI (p. 118) is in the Lock Hospital *Collection* as LOVE DIVINE.

NARBATH (p. 158) appears first as far as I know in Aaron Williams's *The Universal Psalmist*, 1763. Tunes printed for the first time in this book are starred — this tune is not so marked. It is headed "Foundling's. Psalm 27 O.V. Or to the Foundling's Hymn". In 1765 John Arnold joined forces with Riley to improve parochial psalmody by issuing his *Church Music Reformed*, in the preface to which he writes "Also at the Foundling Hospital Chapel, a Set of Psalms, being set to Music on Purpose, are correctly sung by Note by the Foundling Children belonging to that Hospital." He sets this tune to "Whilst Shepherds watch'd", heading it "An Hymn for Christmas Day". One is not surprised therefore when it is found as the first piece in the Hospital's own tune book, published in 1774, and headed "The Foundling's Hymn taken out of Psalm xxvii. Set by Mr. Smith".

MODBURY (p. 183) is another tune which leaves one guessing. It is in the Lock Hospital *Collection* with the name HEIGHINGTON, and the information that it was "Altered from Dr. H." In the Foundling *Collection* (1774) it is headed "Psalm xvii. Set by Dr. Heighington."

WATTON (p. 189) is also in the Foundling book, headed "A Hymn. Set by Mr. Green." The words are the same as in Butts: "Come sing the great Jehovah's praise".

SUSSEX (p. 206) is another of Dr. Green's, and appears in the Foundling *Collection* as "Psalm xcii. verses 1.2.3.4.5. Set by Mr. Green", where it is for solo and chorus.

I suspect that all four of these tunes originated at the Foundling Hospital, and that the date when we first find them in print is no guide as to their date of composition.

There are three other tunes which must be noticed, as they also appear in contemporary or nearly contemporary books.

ON THE DEATH OF A BELIEVER (p. 77) is Isaac Smith's *Collection*, which it is customary to date c. 1770, under the name PORTSMOUTH, and with the same name in the 5th edition of Aaron William's *New Universal Psalmist*, 1770. But the interesting thing is that both Smith and Williams have another version — a straight forward S.M. tune — with the name IPSWICH. This version, with the name WALPOLE TUNE, comes also in Crompton's *Collection*, 1778. Crompton was a Suffolk man

from Southwold, and was a great hand at finding new names for the tunes he included, so I would not be surprised if the S.M. version were original and had its birth in Suffolk. John Wesley took the PORTSMOUTH version (6.6.6.6.4.4.4. and repeats) into *Sacred Harmony*, 1781, renaming it TRUMPET.

PSALM CL (p. 85) appears in Thomas Moore's *The Psalm-Singer's Pocket Companion*, 1756, and *The Psalm-Singer's Delightful Pocket Companion* (c. 1762), where it is called *King David's Delight*, and set to Isaac Watt's Psalm CL. In *Harmonia-Sacra* the words are from King James's version of the same psalm, hence the ascription there given.

Wesley took it into the second edition of *Sacred Melody*, 1765, with the name CHIMES.

LONDON (p. 219) is another tune which Wesley has in the 1765 edition of *Sacred Melody*, renamed CANTERBURY.

The above are all more or less normal psalm and hymn tunes of the period. What follow are adaptations on the same lines as those listed for edition (a).

Handel leads with nine :

WARWICK, p. 28, from *Alexander Balus*.

TRIUMPHANT PRAISE, p. 60, from *Samson*, "Great Dagon".

LEWES, p. 60, from *Judas Maccabeus*, "How vain is man".

SWINDON, p. 96, from *Joshua*.

NEEDHAM & KENT, pp. 130, 131, from *Occasional Oratorio*, "May balmy peace".

HALIFAX, p. 141, from *Susannah*, "Ask if yon damask Rose be sweet".

NEATH, p. 212, from *Semele*, "Turn hopeless lover".

SONG IN SAMPSON, p. 224, from *Samson*, "Total Eclipse".

Arne is represented by two tunes :

AT LYING DOWN, p. 108, from *Eliza*. It was known later as SALTERS.

ON THE SUN'S RISING, p. 156, from *Artaxerxes*, "In Infancy". This is the adaptation which sets 1762 as one limit for the dating of this edition.

Lampe also provides two more items, both headed :

SONG IN THEODOSIUS, p. 48, "Canst thou Marina! leave the world."
p. 84, "In humble Weeds but clean Array."

They are printed with other of his songs in *Ladies Amusement: bring a new Collection of Songs, Ballads etc., with Symphonies and Thorough-Bass. The Music by John Frederick Lampe. Lublin. Printed by James Hoey. (B.M., H. 1625.b).*

H. Carey gives us :

TRUMPET TUNE, p. 110, from his song "He comes!" Wesley has it

as JUDGEMENT in the first edition of *Sacred Melody*, 1761.

Dr. Worgan is responsible for :

BERKSHIRE, p. 209, set to its original words "Hark! Hark 'tis a Voice from the Tomb", by Moore. Wesley changed its name to TOMB STONE in 1761, and set it to "When I survey the wond'rous Cross".

It reappears c. 1810 in *The British Orpheus . . . Stourport, Printed and Published by George Nicholson*, among the "Love Songs", and headed LUCY.

The two later editions, (c) and (d), are identical with (b) except that a tune headed FOR SUNDAY which in (b) was on p. 1 is moved to p. 228, and LOW DUTCH (the tune for Psalm iv in Este, 1592) substituted. One fresh tune called NEWARK is added on p. 229.

Does anything definite emerge from all these rather dull details? As regards the edition (a) I have said all that I can : in other words it awaits evidence that the hymn "And let this feeble body fail" was known and used before Wesley printed it in 1759; and with that is linked the possibility that it is not the first edition. Perhaps some authority on Wesley and his friends can tell us which is the more likely, that (i) Butts and Whitefield drew on a common stock of tunes not yet in print (except for those drawn from the *Foundry Collection*), or that (ii) one used the other's collection, and if so which came first. Although I would find it hard to give any adequate reasons for my choice, I at present feel that *Harmonia Sacra* came after the *Divine Musical Miscellany*.

With the edition (b) the only certain fact is that it is later than 1762, and that it was preceeded by an edition other than (a). Does the contents provide any guidance as to how much later?

Anyhow we can safely neglect the tunes appearing in the *Foundling Hospital Collection* of 1774. The evidence of Aaron Williams in 1763, and of John Arnold is enough to show that the tunes used in the Hospital were available before then. The tunes common to the *Lock Hospital Collection* are not so easily passed over. HOTHAM is one of Madan's own tunes, and it seems more likely that it would appear first in his own collection. LOVE DIVINE is anonymous, and DORSET is by "W.B.", i.e. W. Bromfield, who contributed eight tunes in all to Madan's book. All three come within the first dozen pages, and HELMSLEY is on p. 16. Madan claims that the tunes were "Never Published before". Was he telling the truth? It is usually assumed that he was not, because HOTHAM and HELMSLEY are found in the second edition of *Sacred Melody* (1765). Is this conclusive? Madan issued his words book in 1760, and what is more likely than that he started on the accompanying tune book straightway? We know moreover that the tunes were issued first in parts at 2/- a copy, printed one side of the paper only. When the complete book was published in 1769, "Price one Guinea

bound", it was not made up from the previously printed parts, but was printed both sides of the paper — an entirely fresh printing, in fact. This would have taken time, and as the tunes which concern us are all in the early part of the book, *i.e.* the first part issued, they may well have been known to Butts as early as c. 1763.

A glance at the actual contents of *Sacred Melody* may be the best way to bring these inconclusive notes to a conclusion!

In 1761 *Sacred Melody* had 102 tunes. Of these 92 were in the (a) edition of *Harmonia Sacra*.

Of the remaining 10 tunes, two are in edition (b). These are JUDGEMENT, and TOMB STONE.

But of these two JUDGEMENT (or TRUMPET) was in the edition used by Riley, which must have been later than (a) and earlier than (b). It is quite possible that TOMB STONE (or BERKSHIRE) was also in Riley's edition, and that he did not object to it because Butts had printed it with its original words, and had not adapted it as a hymn tune. Therefore I do not think it necessary to assume that Butts drew on *Sacred Melody* for any of his tunes.

How about the second edition of *Sacred Melody*? There are twelve additional tunes. They appear in this order:

JERUSALEM (5.5.11), YORKSHIRE (C.M.). I have not yet found these in any other earlier or contemporary books.

CHIMES in (b), p. 85, PSALM CL.

MANCHESTER in (b), p. 220, CUDHAM from Evison (STROUD).

COMPLAINT in (b), p. 221, WANTAGE.

OLIVERS in *Lock Collection*, p. 16, HELMSLEY.

THE TRAVELLER'S in (a), p. 126, and (b), p. 191, ST. MICHAEL'S.

CANTERBURY in (b), p. 219, LONDON.

HOTMAN in *Lock Collection*, p. 7, set by M.M., and in (b), p. 75, OATHAM.

THE SHEPHERD OF ISRAEL in (b), p. 108, AT LYING DOWN.

ST. PETER'S in *Lock Collection*, p. 11, LOVE DIVINE, and in (b), p. 118, JOHN XVI.

CHESHUNT in (a), p. 195, and in (b), p. 72.

I think that if we can assume that the hymn "And let this feeble body fail" was in circulation before 1759 we might reconstruct the sequence of editions etc., on these lines.

(a) c. 1756, Butts's first edition.

(aa) The edition used by Riley, which must be dated before 1762, probably about 1759, Wesley will have used this edition when compiling *Sacred Harmony* in 1761.

Between 1760 and 1765 Madan will have made a start on his *Lock Hospital Collection* and have issued the earlier parts. This would make it possible for Butts to have seen them before

(b) his rearranged and enlarged edition, published about 1763.

Wesley would then have a revised edition of *Harmonia Sacra* and also the earlier parts of the *Lock Hospital Collection* available when

he came to enlarge *Sacred Melody* for the second edition of 1765.

Acknowledgements: Honour to whom honour is due. Many of the identifications of secular melodies are owing to notes written in my copy of (d) by a former owner. Judging from the handwriting (which appears in many other books on my shelves — one of which contained a signed letter) they were by the late J. Allanson Benson. Dr. A. K. Blackall kindly checked the Handel tunes for me.

Only one of the tunes listed by Riley has escaped me: "Sure Jocky was the bonniest Swain". The nearest I have got is a song entitled *Jockey / A Favourite Scotch Ballad Sung by Mrs. Baddeley at Vauxhall*. In places it reminds one of BULF. Perhaps a reader may know of a version with words identical with Riley's quotation.

HOSPITAL HYMN BOOK

*Obtainable only from the Free Church Federal Council, Inc.,
27 Tavistock Square, London, W.C.1.*

If it is defensive caution which has moved the promulgators of this little book to conceal its price, its date, and the names of its editors, they need not have worried. These are mere prefatory irritants, and are soon poulticed with unqualified admiration for a selection which, though restricted to 73 general and 46 special hymns, leaves one trying to puzzle out what has been omitted.

The choice of hymns for services in hospitals presents formidable problems. Old and young, Christian and post-Christian, desperately ill, and gladly convalescent, recalcitrant and resigned — all these, though not usually present on a single occasion of worship, must be provided for by any book seeking general hospital use. Further, the day-room of the quondam Poor Law Institution stands no less in need of a compendium for its praise than the surgical ward of a great infirmary: yet the spiritual requirements of the two are likely to be as different as the limited range of hymns with which each patient is familiar, (and here, as not in normal congregational worship, familiarity is a respectable and all-important criterion).

It is a sad comment on church relations in England that while almost any of the great denominational hymn-books would serve as staple for our hospitals, none of us knows enough about the contents of any but our own to think it safe for this to happen. For this reason, and because in recent years hospital chaplaincy, under County Councils, has become so much less haphazard, a book with the aim of the one under review was much to be desired.

But how could anyone have guessed that it would be so good? With great wisdom, the editors have waived the claims of "something for everyone", and have adopted a principle much more like "everything for someone": in other words, it is out of practical

and pondered experience of the needs of real "someones" and not out of a theoretical construction of what ought best to cover the variegated ground that this book has obviously been born. In this way it in fact succeeds in providing something for everyone in a far more valuable way and in a far smaller compass than it could otherwise have done. The arrangement in alphabetical order produces some piquant and exhilarating contrasts for the consecutive reader: with its *in extenso* Scripture passages and its prayers the book thus makes an excellent devotional enchiridion. But it is as a hymn-book that it asks to be considered in these pages.

In general, the selection is a nicely balanced blend of the subjective and the objective types of hymn; there are some noteworthy particularities which raise wider issues:—

Does a specialized prayer like "Eternal Father, strong to save" (5) really merit its place in such a short list?

In "Hail to the Lord's Anointed" (15) a more imaginative selection of verses would have included "Arabia's desert ranger . . .", with its bright and spacious variety of images — surely just right for a grey morning in hospital.

We are most properly allowed to lisp to God's praise (49): why then forbidden to bring peculiar honours (30)? (And incidentally why play into the hands of the experts in Plagual Cadence by writing "And earth prolong (sic) the joyful strain (sic). Amen."?).

In these verbal matters the book is well-intentioned, but not meticulous. "O God, our help" (43): Bethlehem single-streeted (80): John Logan unmentioned and unabridged (42): Arminius uncooled (41) — surely the alteration of Wesley's order of verses adopted by most hymn-books is very desirable. "Death of deaths, and hell's destruction" (14) curiously alters the sense of the trope — more, let us trust, by compositorial accident than by editorial design.

Two Doddridge inclusions command notice. "See Israel's gentle Shepherd stand" (54); and in the Easter section "Ye humble souls that seek the Lord" (93) — both surprises, but indicative of deep editorial insight. It was a good idea, too, to put "Rock of Ages" (88) in the section for Good Friday; on the other hand, "Man of Sorrows! What a name" (86) in the same section is outside the reviewer's own tradition, which is perhaps why it appears to him almost blasphemously commonplace. Almost all the Whitsun hymns would have been better in the body of the book; and the subsuming of Advent and Epiphany under Christmas for simplicity's sake will probably lead to the perpetration of a nonsense or two.

The appended prayers, readings, etc., are for the most part unimpeachable. It is however advisable to make the "Prayer before an operation" when about to consider the version of the General Confession here preferred: and two pages later the question "When is a benediction not a benediction?" is provided by implication with

the answer "When it's a prayer". But all the same these things are useful and well done: and the book as a whole ought to make easier and richer a task as difficult as it is rewarding. The Free Church Federal Council may be proud of producing a book which can be (let us hope that it will be) used by chaplains of all the reformed churches without hesitation. It meets a need long felt by one chaplain at least, at whose hospital there are two hymn-books — early A. & M. for the Anglicans, and the Fellowship Hymn Book for the Free Churches: (not the later, fuller, more adequate FHB, but the 1st edn., with its very limited intention, and a first-line index which contains the peerless progression—

Sound the battle-cry.

Speak gently: it is better far.)

If the book now under review were in use, it would make such duplication unnecessary, and relieve the reviewer of a perpetual hymn-choosing headache, which on the great Festivals of the Christian Year becomes so acute that he is driven to the (in others' eyes) uncouth extreme of using A. & M.

That the latter is in many ways equally (though differently) unsuitable and inadequate for hospital use will be shewn by a glance at the comparative index at the end of "Hospital Hymn Book". To say that this feature is entertaining as well as illuminating is not to decry but rather to underline its usefulness and success. Note too the dry humour of the asterisks on the acknowledgements-page, which, in their solemn indication of the hymns for whose inclusion a fee has been paid, lend considerable support to the view that the best things in life are free.

Tunes are almost throughout the book indicated only by the printing of the hymn's metre at its head — a wisdom which will please connoisseur and crimondière alike.

Doubtless the promulgators have their reasons for not publishing this most useful and well-arranged book for ordinary retail. But it is greatly to be hoped that this will not hinder its wide circulation and adoption. A copy of it in every hospital-locker in the island (yes, there are 6 Welsh hymns — in Welsh — and a psalm in metre for the Scots) would not only be an excellent circumstance in itself but would warrant the addition of a "The", which has been modestly, if somewhat baldly, omitted from the title.

The editors end their unpretentious Foreword thus: "Our prayer is that this hymnal may take into our hospitals the consolation, guidance and courage of the Christian faith, and that the blessing of Almighty God may rest upon it". A loud Amen to that!

T. C. MICKLEM.

HYMNS AND HUMAN LIFE

by ERIK ROUTLEY (John Murray 16/-).

Those familiar with C. S. Phillips's "Hymnody Past and Present" might well think that there is little justification for another book on the same subject; but a glance at any chapter of Dr. Routley's "Hymns and Human Life" should cause them to revise any such opinion. For once, I have found a publisher's blurb to be an understatement; for this book is described as "Serious, yet entertaining" and I find the description is too modest for over 300 pages of witty and delightful reading, supported as it is by copious notes.

Chapter 1 gives the reader a foretaste of the delicious sense of humour which pervades the whole book. Dr. Routley heads it with the apposite quotation — overheard as the judge enters the court :

'ere 'e comes, the 'oly 'umbug, 'umming 'is 'ymn.

'Ow I 'ate 'im!

and every page has an appropriate caption. Part II, which is devoted to hymn-writers, contains chapters with such original titles as "The Cloister and the Hearth", with a sub-title of "Bishops, Priests and Deacons" (not the only indication that the author is as much at home among Anglicans as with his own church people). Other titles include "The Manse, The Mission and the Presbytery," followed by "Men of Letters," Men of Business even, and the usual run of Women and American writers. Not least in interest is the chapter on "Youth and Hymns", for it came as something of a surprise to me that the contribution of the young has been so considerable and distinguished. We are told that the inspiration to write hymns develops early — Isaac Watts and Milton both began at 16 — and, like musical geniuses, many hymn-writers have not outlived their thirtieth year.

A valuable feature of this book is the numerous excerpts from lesser known hymns from many sources. References abound to those in current hymnals. In all, over 600 hymns are dealt with in reference or comment. All the familiar writers, The Wesleys, Watts, Doddridge, John Newton and a host of others come under review and the author traces how the Calvinist stream of psalmody was joined with "the warm stream of Lutheran devotion", through Watts and the Wesleys respectively, to become "the richness of our English heritage". In an analysis of a verse of a Wesley Hymn we are given, line by line, the underlying scriptural thought: thus, "Jesus the first and last" stems from "I am Alpha and Omega", and the next line, "On thee my soul is cast" derives from "Cast thy burden upon the Lord", and so on to illustrate the essential soundness of the writing.

The Section headed "Wrath and Praise — the Church Embodied" is a grand survey of hymns of the Church Militant in the

social sphere; the pioneer being Doddridge in the first half of the 18th century ("Hark the glad sound"), followed by Ebenezer Elliott ("When wilt thou save the people?") in the 19th century and so on to G. K. Chesterton's "O God of earth and altar" in recent times.

Dealing with hymns of the Reformation, Dr. Routley gives us some exceedingly good reading. His pictures of Luther, the "Witty, full-blooded, shrewd person with a dash of the mystic and a very keen intellect"; and of Calvin, "Alive to the necessity of having a few traffic-regulations in the City of God" are but samples of his brilliant pen-portraits. And the sterner aspects of Luther are relieved by the picture of the Reformer as the family man writing a carol for his little son — of which two charming verses are given.

As might be expected, hymns written for children include a good number that no modern child could be expected to sing. Dr. Routley makes a distinction between those in which the writers descends to the child's level and those where the endeavour is to raise the child to the level of adults. Of the latter he says: "When they understand, they will be children no longer". He points out that the modern child rightly delights in picturesque and fanciful nature themes and illustrates this by quoting a hymn by Canon Crum which includes the lines:

In the meadow and wood

The cattle are good

And the rabbits are thinking no evil.

But Dr. Routley observes that the farmer may "think the rabbits less white than they are painted"!

Suitable hymns for the young are far more important than many people realise. I wish Dr. Routley had given his views more fully on this, but I imagine that he would endorse the opinion of the compilers of the B.B.C. Hymn Book, who say in their Preface that for children over ten the discriminating use of hymns sung by adults is better than Children's Hymns of no special merit. One might include the awful Choruses which some well-meaning folk consider suitable for Youth Rallies.

Dr. Routley's *The Church and Music* no doubt accounts for only passing references to tunes in the present book. The right relationship between words and their tunes is so important that the two subjects need to be dealt with concurrently: for it is the tune, rather than the words which make the initial and often the most lasting impression on congregations. Unfortunately, in the past tawdry tunes have often been united to fine hymns and the tunes take "an unconscionable time a-dying". Referring to the "good tunes" that the devil is supposed to monopolize, Dr. Routley says that we have two options, viz: to compose something better, or "to march on the devil and recapture what he has taken from you"! That seems almost to suggest that anyone can compose a good hymn

tune: but we have suffered over much from people who imagine themselves capable of fitting a tune to words they like — even more from those who compose both words and music! And isn't there some confusion between the devil's and merely secular tunes? The devil has been just as active in the sacred as in the secular field and is very far from having "all the good tunes" in either.

FINLANDIA and LONDONDERRY AIR are mentioned as tunes recently used for missions; but I suggest that their merits as secular tunes do not make them *eo ipso* suitable for church worship. Dr. Routley seems to find a place for "Gospel" Hymns in the Sankey idiom, which he calls "the folk-music of the music hall". Hymns, or "Songs" as they are more properly called, of this *genre* are generally simple and pious, but more often jejune jingles and frequently escapist. Whatever justification they may once have had, their continued use can hardly be justified in an age so entirely different from the Victorian period in which they originated. The revivalists meant well, but they planted dragon's teeth in the soil of the Church. But Dr. Routley is reluctant to condemn bad hymns; possibly because the more feeble have already been expunged from recently revised hymnals. Of Faber's worst, "Hark, hark my soul", he quotes William Temple's apt description: "A minor, but quite indisputable part of the problem of evil"!

Few perhaps realise what a fine contribution America has made to the common stock of hymnody. The chapter on American authors will correct the perspective of any who imagine that Negro Spirituals and crooning are the chief musical exports of the United States. Among modern writers Dr. Routley quotes some verses of the late Howard Chandler Robbins, a minister of the Episcopal Church of the U.S.A. The example given lacks nothing in dignified style, but somehow I cannot imagine a congregation wanting to sing about the "light years which frame the Pleiades and point Orion's sword". Others of Dr. Robbins's hymns are far better suited for congregational use.

The book concludes by comparing the Westminster Abbey Service Sheets of 1913-14 with those of 1931-32 and again the hymns used on special occasions (Memorial Services, etc.) from 1886 to 1936 in order to show the change in the public taste for hymns. The indefatigable author has also analysed the hymns broadcast in the first half of 1950 and those sung in 14 Oxford churches (Anglican) on the Sunday after Trinity in 1950. All round, the hymn which still emerges as the prime favourite appears to be "Praise my soul the King of heaven". Few will regret the virtual disappearance of "Hark, Hark my soul", "Nearer my God to thee" and "Forever with the Lord" from present day worship. Finally, Dr. Routley gives a "Basic Canon" of 52 hymns which the ordinary Englishman can be counted to know. He calls them "Our National Anthems".

Enough has been written to indicate — however inadequately — that this is an extraordinarily interesting scholarly and delightful book, and one which every hymn-lover, clergyman and choirmaster will want to possess. If the price frightens some, it is worth while to pool every Gift Book Token that comes one's way in order to obtain this pearl of price!

J. BLAIR-FISH.

MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

OCTOBER 7th — 9th, 1952, at OLD JORDANS HOSTEL,
Near BEACONSFIELD.

There were present, Messrs. Maurice Frost, L. H. Bunn, T. Tiplady, A. Holbrook and F. B. Merryweather. Apologies for absence were received from other members of the Committee. Mr. Pocknee was able to get to the meeting on Wednesday, October 8th, and stayed during the afternoon and evening. He was co-opted as a member of the Committee.

The main business was connected with a report from Mr. Bunn about his work on *Julian*, and during the whole of Wednesday good progress was made and much useful work done.

(Mr. Bunn's Report is attached hereto).

The Agenda included a Resolution, proposed by Mr. Frost, and seconded by Mr. Tiplady, that the Committee should meet at least once a year. This was agreed to by all present.

Consideration was given to a letter from a member of the Hymn Society, suggesting a meeting of the Society at Stratford-on-Avon, in the Autumn of next year. The Secretary was asked to explore further this possibility, and to report to the next meeting of the Executive to be held in the Spring of 1953.

It was proposed by Mr. Tiplady and seconded by Mr. Holbrook that an honorarium of Fifty Pounds be paid to Mr. Bunn, to cover expenses to July, 1952, and that the matter be reviewed next year.

Julian's Dictionary. The Committee gathered from Mr. Bunn that the Publishers, John Murray, have asked our Society to be responsible for £2,000 (being half of the estimated cost of publication). In view of this, Mr. Holbrook suggested that the Bishop of Sheffield (a Vice-President), might be approached by Maurice Frost in the hope that some financial help, through the bishop's influence, could be obtained towards the cost of publication, with special regard to the fact that Dr. Julian was Vicar of Wincobank, now in the diocese of Sheffield.

(Note by F.B.M.: The first Bishop of Sheffield was L. H. Burrows, 1914).

With regard to the appointment of an Hon. Treasurer, the

Chairman, supported by the committee present, instructed the Hon. Secretary to write to Miss Ann Macaulay, who has acted as Treasurer since the lamented death of Mr. Christie, and, thanking her for her valued services, ask her to accept the appointment as our official Hon. Treasurer. It was also agreed that she should be asked to furnish a Statement of the present financial position of the Society, to be presented at the Spring meeting next year.

Looking ahead, Mr. Holbrook invited us to consider the possibility of a Hymn Society Conference in Sheffield, in the year 1954, which will be the centenary of James Montgomery. The suggestion met with general approval.

F. B. MERRYWEATHER.

EDITOR'S REPORT TO THE EXECUTIVE

at "Jordans", October, 1952.

Mr. BUNN reported that as a result of careful examination of the text of *Julian*, it appears that about one-third of the existing material can be entirely omitted from the new book. This leaves some 2000 columns to be condensed and brought up to date. In addition, a very large quantity of new material has appeared in hymnals published during the present century, and these have so far been collated in respect of letter "A". A list of the important LONGER ARTICLES in *Julian* was produced, and much time was devoted to considering possible contributors who might be invited to undertake their revision.

The general principle of inclusion was defined in terms of material which has found a place in hymnals of this century. While exceptions may occur, this rule helps to settle the treatment of, e.g. Carols.

The Editor expressed the opinion that the new work should be constructed in two respective alphabets for authors and subjects, with cross-references wherever necessary given *in loco*. There would thus be no need for an index to the text, but every article omitted from *Julian* would be indexed (similarly in two alphabets) at the end of the new book, so that it might still be found on its appropriate page in the original volume.

These proposals received the general approval of the Executive, the Editor stated that Sir John Murray, the Publisher, was willing to consider the publication of such a work up to the limit of 1,000 pages, double column.

L. H. BUNN.

FRENCH CHURCH MELODIES.

By the Rev. C. E. POCKNEE.

A number of hymn books now contain a selection of what are termed "French Church Melodies". Hitherto, little has been known

about the origins of these tunes and the ascriptions as to their sources have been given simply as: "Angers Church Melody", "Rouen Melody" etc. The editors of both, *Songs of Praise Discussed* and the *Handbook to the Church Hymnary* can only state, "these tunes were in many cases founded on the plain-song melody, and, in others, on favourite secular airs; but the original sources of the individual tunes have not been ascertained". It will surely be agreed that this statement is unsatisfactory and inconclusive.

It is now possible after some research to give rather more detailed information about these tunes. The hymn book that carries the largest selection of French Church Melodies is the *English Hymnal*; and for the sake of convenience reference will be made to the numbers in that book.

The tunes which we are discussing belong in origin to the French Diocesan Service books that were compiled towards the end of the 17th century and throughout the 18th century; and their use continued through part of the 19th century.

During the period under consideration the Roman Catholic Church in France developed a nationalistic trend known as Gallikanism; while at the same time French churchmen and theologians became highly critical of the breviary offices. In particular, the Latin Office hymns were either recast, or, more often they were replaced by entirely new compositions written by the brothers Santeuil, Charles Coffin and others. It was in connection with the new hymns that what are called the French Church Melodies came into use. In the Graduals and Antiphoners of the French Church these tunes were set in square note on a four-line stave as though they were authentic plainsong melodies. In fact, while they have a modal flavour they are not true plainchant, but are set in the major or the minor mode of modern music.

They were intended to be sung in unison, and in free rhythm. It is more than doubtful if the precise time values of crotchets, quavers and dotted notes that have been ascribed to these tunes in *English Hymnal* and *Hymns Ancient and Modern* can be deduced from the settings in the French Service books.

In some instances these tunes are based on the older plainsong melodies. Let the reader turn to the first tune E.H. 150, and compare it with the second tune E.H. 51. LUCIS CREATOR. This latter is simply a modernised form of the plainsong at E.H. 150. Here the transition was easy, as the plainsong of IAM CHRISTUS ASTRA is in Mode I, which approximates most closely to the modern minor scale. In the case of E.H. 636 ISTE CONFESSOR its adaptation from an authentic plainsong melody is less obvious. But a comparison of this tune with the plainchant one at E.H. 188 will reveal that this is the original source of ISTE CONFESSOR; and this is even more obvious when we remember that both melodies are connected with the same Latin hymn, *Iste Confessor*.

The plainsong melody in this instance is in Mode II having F as its dominant. The French Church musicians in their adaptation have altered the melodic line and made A the dominant; thereby bringing the tune into the modern minor scale.

In other instances entirely new melodies were written for the new Latin hymns. It has not been possible to discover the composers of these tunes, as in most instances they are given anonymously in the French liturgical books. But the tune E.H. 335 *CHRISTE FONS JUGIS* is now known to be the work of Philippe Goibaud Dubois (1624-96). It will be found ascribed to him in *Hymni Sacri* (Paris 1689) where it is set to J-B Santeuil's hymn *Matris intactae*; and is also found in the *Paris Antiphoner* 1736 set to the same words. In this connection it is perhaps useful to explain that the names given to these tunes in Anglican and other English hymnbooks are not necessarily the Latin of the first line of the hymn to which these tunes were first set. This fact has made the tracing of these tunes doubly difficult.

Three tunes, E.H. 165 (2), E.H. 174 (2), E.H. 465 that hitherto, have been ascribed to La Feillée's *Méthode du Plainchant* in a late 18th century edition, have now been traced to proper liturgical books of an earlier date.

Another tune of interest is the second tune E.H. 123 *SOLEMNIS HAEC FESTIVITAS*. This tune has six separate melodies and these belong to the sequence or prose in the *Paris Missal*, 1685, for our Lord's Ascension commencing "Solemnis haec festivitas".

PLAYFORD'S DIVINE COMPANION.

The editions usually cited in hymn-books and their accompanying hand-books are the first, 1701, and the third, 1709.

Mr. Wm. C. Smith informed me that a second edition was advertised in the *Post Man*, July 8th to 10th, 1707, but there appeared to be no copy in our main British Libraries. However, I have just heard that there is a copy in Congress Library, Washington:

"The Second Edition, with large Additions, / London: Printed by William Pearson, for Henry Playford, at his / Rooms in Queen's-Head-Tavern Passage, over against the Middle-/ Temple-Gate, Fleet-street. MDCCVII."

As the musical contents agrees with that of the third edition references given to 1709 can be altered to 1707.

MAURICE FROST.

NOTE: Subscriptions for 1953 are now due, and should be sent without delay to The Hon. Treasurer, The Hymn Society, 31 Queen Street, Edinburgh 2. A year's subscription is 7/6d., and cheques should be made payable to "The Hymn Society".