

THE HYMN SOCIETY

OF GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND

BULLETIN

81

VOLUME FOUR

NUMBER EIGHT.

WINTER, 1957/8.

NOTE CHANGES OF ADDRESS :

Editor: REV. ERIK R. ROUTLEY, M.A., B.D., D.Phil.,
17 Norham Road, Oxford.

Hon. Secretary: THE REV. A. S. HOLBROOK,
31 St. John's Road, Knutsford, Cheshire.

Hon. Treasurer: D. C. B. HARRIS, Esq. A.A.C.C.A.,
28, Halford Road, Stratford on Avon.

CONTENTS

Charles Wesley's Hymns and the Anglican Tradition, by the Archdeacon of Westminster	113
The Tunes associated with Hymn singing in the lifetime of the Wesleys, by Maurice Frost	117
REVIEW :	
<i>Christian Praise</i> (1957)	126

CHARLES WESLEY'S HYMNS AND THE ANGLICAN TRADITION

*(Extracts from a lecture given by the Venerable Adam Fox, Arch-
deacon of Westminster, at the Bristol Conference, 13th November
1957)*

I think it will be useful straight away to observe that it is illegal to have hymns at a Prayer Book service, except the *Veni Creator* at an ordination, or at a Consecration of Bishops. The clergy of the Church of England still promise, as they always have, to use the said Book (that is, the Book of Common Prayer) and no other; and it is interesting to reflect that until about 1820 no incumbent really thought himself entitled to use anything else. But I must add in justice to my fellow ministers that the present apparent neglect of the promise is made in perfect good faith. Even the extremists, whether they take their inspiration from

Rome or lift up their voices in extempore prayer genuinely believe that they at any rate are using the Prayer Book properly by a doctrine of intention, or several doctrines of intention, which might be hammered out. And to be sure, no use of a Book of Common Prayer can be static if the Church is alive. The very ancient liturgy in use in the Coptic Church is not a credit to them. If parts of the Prayer Book grow obsolete, the minister or a group of ministers may try experiments: and if the church as a whole accepts them, then they need no legal authority: but if they remain unacceptable then the innovators are in duty bound to drop them, because they are bound by the Acts of Uniformity.

There is no question but that, on this view, hymn singing in divine service needs no legal authority. Yet this situation was only reached after a deal of controversy. Although hymn singing established itself among Wesley's followers in the middle of the eighteenth century, their decisive acceptance in the Church of England is reckoned from 1860.⁽¹⁾

The most decisive demand that the Church of England makes of its hymns is that they are easily singable and easily learnt by the congregation, and at the same time not so catchy that people will tire of them. If these conditions are fulfilled, almost any words will succeed and come indeed to be greatly cherished, and so where a tune has come to be closely associated with particular words, we must be cautious on supposing that these words are specially close to the mind of the Church that uses them.

But the words certainly do not count for nothing. Air-borne by the music they do at least reach their destination; and in most congregations, besides nearly everybody knowing the tune, some, and sometimes quite a number, will know the words.

As to the sense, this must be religious, and worship is the most appropriate attitude in the hymn singer: and they must be orthodox or at least not obviously unorthodox. They ought to teach something about the Faith, because Englishmen cannot easily be persuaded that there is anything to be *known* about Christianity; it is something to *do*: and what theology they do know is largely derived unconsciously from hymns, such as 'There is a green hill' and 'At the name of Jesus'.

On the other hand, the Anglican does not want to sing hymns which represent the Christian community as a rather superior friendly society: or if he does want to, he should be encouraged. The ethical aspirations of prominent American Unitarians and Deists, both male and female, occupy much too much space in our Christian hymn books.

In the first edition of *Hymns A and M* there were, I think, only nine hymns by Charles Wesley. In the Revised edition of 1889 the nine had been increased to 22, but as the total number had increased from 273 to 638 the proportion was only very slightly increased. The percentage was rather less than 3½. But in the Sec-

ond Supplement of 1916, ten of the 141 new hymns were by Charles Wesley, raising the total proportion to rather more than 4%. In *AMR* the number fell from 32 to 30, with quite a number of omissions and compensating additions, and a negligible change in the percentage rate of 4. It is apposite perhaps to report that the Charles Wesley hymns in *Congregational Praise* amount to just on 6%, in the *Methodist Hymn Book* now in use it is very little short of 25%, and in *E. H.*, only 3%.

In a book designed to be a companion to the Book of Common Prayer there is a special preliminary consideration about the hymns for Communion. They have tended to grow more numerous as the practice of having a sung Eucharist has become more frequent. In the earliest *A & M* there were only five Communion hymns, and 'Victim divine' was (understandably) not among them. In 1889 the number of Communion hymns had been increased to 25, and 'Victim Divine' was among them. Of 14 new Communion hymns in the Second Supplement, four were by Charles Wesley, but among the 41 Communion hymns in *A.M.R.* there are only three by Charles Wesley, and 'Victim Divine' has disappeared. I think this omission significant as well as surprising. It may be an indication that doctrine is less emphasized than it was, and this may be the trend in all hymn books, possibly from B.B.C. influence.

And now when I come at last to try and say what it is that makes Charles Wesley's hymns specially valuable to the Church of England I am afraid I shall disappoint you. The truth is that all the Christian denominations in England have a stock of popular hymns which they share in common, and we need not interest ourselves in unpopular hymns, because hymns must attract this element of popular affection or else they are useless. There are much too many hymns floating around, but hymns that are both good and successful are in short supply, and Charles Wesley wrote several of the best. But these are, as I say, only part of the common stock. And the common stock includes also hymns by Cardinal Newman: two or three are in all the books: it includes hymns by Keble: there are some in all the books. Nearly all the books even have that horrid Pelagian hymn by Mrs. Love Maria Willis, 'Father, hear the prayer we offer', in which I don't detect a word of Christianity. But Charles Wesley's at any rate are very Christian and they are very successful. I don't know that we can say that they have a greater or less success with Anglicans than other Christian bodies, or that their success is peculiarly their own. They belong very much to the common mind of the Church of England.

Let us look at those nine hymns of Wesley which were in the first edition of *A & M*, and are still in it, and see if possible what made Sir Henry Baker and his collaborators choose them. (Let me say in passing that I think Sir Henry himself was Wesley's true successor in hymnography). The nine hymns were these:

1950	1861	
7	5	Christ whose glory fills the skies
336	6	Forth in thy name, O Lord, I go
51	39	Lo, he comes, with clouds descending
60	43	Hark, the herald angels sing
147	121	Hail the day that sees him rise (altered by Cotterill)
272	169	Let saints on earth in concert sing
193	179	Jesu, lover of my soul
303	181	Soldiers of Christ, arise
195	199	O Love divine, how sweet thou art.

In order of popularity at the present time, I suppose 'Jesu lover of my soul' would come first, and 'O Love divine' last. The hymns for Christmas and Ascensiontide are in high favour for their appropriate seasons. The rest are not in the highest favour. I imagine that 'Rejoice, the Lord is King', added in 1875, may now occupy the second place, and I should think that 'Love divine, all loves excelling', added in 1889, occupies a high place too. Only two others of those added at that date can be said to be frequently sung in Anglican services, 'O for a thousand tongues' and 'O for a heart to praise my God'. Wesley's hymns, then, are not in the front rank of popularity in most parish churches, but they are highly valued and respected. And so they should be.

Now as to these nine hymns, it must be said at the outset that they have been fortunate in their tunes, and therefore the words need not necessarily be good to be acceptable. I am afraid they need only be innocuous. (Hymns which have absolutely nothing to them except perhaps a misinterpretation of Scripture as in Hosmer's 'Thy kingdom come : on bended knee' are sung by Anglicans with fervour).

But the qualities which have commended Charles Wesley's hymns to the church of England are, I think, first, that they inspire a picture in the mind, quite easily in fact in very simple minds; secondly, they are very hopeful, and suggest that spiritual progress, even spiritual success, is within our reach; thirdly, they suggest doing something. These are all qualities which Englishmen like very well. Consider the picture in—

One army of the living God,
To his command we bow;
Part of his host hath crossed the flood,
And part is crossing now;
or the hopefulness in
And run my course with even joy,
And closely walk with thee to heaven.
and the sense of 'doing' in
From strength to strength go on,
Wrestle and fight and pray.

Forth in thy name, O Lord, I go
My daily labour to pursue.

Charles Wesley is not a specially good versifier, not nearly so good as Robert Bridges : but that does not matter. His verses are simple in construction, and we do not have to take in too much at a time.

From the Anglican point of view a more serious defect is that he is not always very real, sometimes rather subjective, not infrequently rhetorical. These qualities do not appear in what I have quoted, because the first editors of *Hymns A and M* certainly would not appreciate this much — although I do not think that this (from 199) is very real :

My joy, my heaven, my earth be this
To hear the Bridegroom's voice.

I think they must have hesitated a good deal over admitting 'O love divine, how sweet thou art'. It is good rhetoric, but not very real or appropriate to be sung in churches.

Eighteenth century hymns, and for that matter tunes too, are on the whole the best because, whether or not they are subjective, they aim at the attainable. But I don't want it to be thought that Charles Wesley is successful because he is an eighteenth century man. He is far from typical of the period, and far nicer. When all is said and done it is Charles Wesley the pious, genial, hopeful, diligent romantic and passionate evangelist and presbyter who has conferred these divine songs upon the church, and not least on the Church of England, more especially where his instinctive moderation in all things spiritual and material has been his guide.

To seize the opportunity of inculcating doctrine and applying Holy Scripture by the use of Charles Wesley's hymns needs much more steady thinking by Anglicans than they have yet given it. But this is only part of the much larger task of (shall I say?) Methodising our hymn-singing and making our own 'body of experimental and practical divinity' out of them. We have the material, but hardly have the will. Perhaps we quail before so great a task. For our special problem is to weave our hymns into the office and liturgy of the Book of Common Prayer, and a hymn is a poor thing compared to the Prayer Book : even Charles Wesley seems light-weight in that company. But it may be that the Prayer Book seems heavier than it once did, and hymns provide the light relief. Perhaps that is their real significance in the Church of England service. And the whole business is utterly confused because, after all my talk, I must conclude by observing once more that it is the tunes that matter.

THE TUNES ASSOCIATED WITH HYMN SINGING IN THE LIFETIME OF THE WESLEYS

by MAURICE FROST

A lecture given at the Bristol Conference

I started to write this paper with good intentions: but if they have not yet led me to the proverbial destination they have not produced the result for which I hoped. My idea was to deal with four groups of tunes: (a) those which Wesley adopted from books familiar to him from their use in Anglican circles, (b) those he took over from Moravian sources, (c) those written specially by musicians of standing, and (d) adaptations from secular and other originals.

On reading it through I find I have shirked some of the specially written tunes, that adaptations have not kept to their allotted place, and that on the whole all I seem to have produced is a list of rather dull book titles. However I have brought a few of the books mentioned, so that those interested can see what they looked like.

Before we turn to our main subject, the tunes to which the early Methodists set their hymns, I must ask you to bear with me while I say a word or two about the books to which I shall be referring.

- (a) *A / Collection / of Tunes / Set to Music. / As they are commonly Sung at the / Foundery / London: / Printed by A. Pearson, and sold by / T. Harris, at the Looking-Glass and Bible / on London-Bridge; T. Trye, at Gray's-Inn- / Gate, Holborn, and at the Foundery, near Upper- / Moorfields, MDCCXLII.*

It contains 42 tunes (one being repeated) with the words of the first verse. It is abominably printed, full of mistakes; and one can only assume that Pearson took no trouble over it, probably on account of it having to be done as cheaply as possible. A fac-simile reprint was published in 1882.

- (b) *Hymns / on the / Great Festivals, / and / Other Occasions. / London: / Printed for M. Cooper at the Globe in Pater-noster-Row; / and sold by T. Tryer near Gray's-Inn-Gate, Holborn; / Henry Butler in Bow Church-yard; the Book-sellers / of Bristol, Bath, Newcastle upon Tyne, and Exeter, / and at the Musick-Shops, 1746. /*

There are 24 tunes by J. F. Lampe.

- (c) *A / Collection / of / Hymns / and / Sacred Poems. / Dub-
lin: / Printed by S. Powell, in Crane-lane. / MDCCXLIX.*

There are 22 tunes at the end. Four of these I have failed to trace to earlier books, and among them is the tune we know as IRISH. It is now at The West. Theol. Semin. Pittsburgh.

- (d) *The / Divine Musical Miscellany. / being, / A Collection of Psalm, and Hymn Tunes: / great part of which were never before in Print. / London. / Printed by R. Williamson and sold at Mr. John Morgan's in / Half-Moon Alley, the 3d. House from Bishopsgate Street. 1754. /*

This is almost certainly the tune book provided by George Whitefield for his following. For a long time the only copy known to have survived was in the hands of the late Mr. J. T. Lightwood, and is now in the library of Kingswood School. But recently another copy has been found in the British Museum — among the Julian collection, I believe, which is now housed there.

- (e) *Harmonia-Sacra, / or / A choice Collection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes, &c. / In Two, Three, and Four Parts, with a Thorough Bass, for the Harpsichord, and Organ. / Collected from the most Celebrated Masters and made Use of in the Principal Churches and Chapels, in / London. / Particularly at the Foundling Lock, and Magdalen Hospitals. / With an Introduction to Psalmody. / and Several New Tunes, never before Published. by / Mr. Thos. Butts / London. Printed Edwd. & Chas. Dilly. Booksellers in the Poultry near the Mansion House. Price 15/-.*

I do not think the earliest surviving edition can be dated earlier than 1759/60; but I am equally convinced that there must have been an earlier edition — possibly before 1754.

Please note that the last three books are earlier than the next definite Wesley book:

- (f) *Select Hymns: / with / Tunes Annexed: / Designed for the Use of the / People / called / Methodists. / London: / Printed in the year MDCCCLXI.
Sacred / Melody / or / A choice Collection of / Psalm and Hymn / Tunes, / with a Short Introduction. / Bland Scupl / Praise him in his holiness. Praise him in his greatness. Let all things that have breath, Praise the Lord.*

There were two further editions, one in 1765 at London, and another in 1770 at Bristol.

Finally we have

- (g) *Sacred / Harmony, / or a choice Collection of / Psalms and Hymns. / Set to Music / in two and three Parts, for / the Voice, Harpsichord and Organ.*

It was advertised on the cover of the Arminian Magazine for 1781. Another edition was issued c. 1789 with a slightly different title page as a tune book, since it only contained the first verses for the hymns:

Sacred Harmony / or / A choice Collection / of / Psalm and Hymn Tunes, / In two or three Parts, / For the Voice, Harpsichord, and Organ. / Price Two Shilling & Sixpence.

Yet another edition was issued as late as 1822. This had been "revised and corrected by ... Charles Wesley Esq."

Such then are the seven books to which I shall have occasion to refer. I am sorry to have started off with such a dull catalogue, but it is as well to have some indication of the country we are going to explore.

But before we consider the distinctively Methodist tunes we must consider Wesley's Anglican background as regards hymn books. The Anglican Church had been very loath to admit novelties into its public worship. The Old Version as represented by Playford's *Whole Book of Psalms*, 1677, was the staple diet, supplemented perhaps by Henry Playford's *Divine Companion*, 1701, which he had provided "for the use of Those who already understand Mr. John Playford's Psalms in three parts", and according to his preface, "as the next step towards the practice of Divine Musick".

In addition there would be *A Supplement to the New Version of the Psalms*, which saw light about 1700, but was of no musical interest until the 6th edition in 1708 which contained the tunes usually attributed to Croft.

Another book with a wide circulation was Chetham's *Whole Book of Psalms*, 1718, from which we will see Wesley drew one tune; another was Timbrell's *Divine Music Scholar's Guide*, which also contributed one tune — an exasperating book, none of the editions I have seen agree in contents, and none are dated. It was certainly before 1723, and may be as early as 1717. It also contributed one tune. These, together with *Lyra Davidica*, 1708 (one tune) and Tans'ur's *A Compleat Melody; or, The Harmony of Zion*, 1735 (three tunes) account for all the traceable tunes from English sources in Wesley's first book of 1742.

Let us have a look at what he chose from this group. First from Playford's *Whole Book of Psalms*, 1677.

- (a) The OLD 112TH, which he actually calls 'Playford's tune' — evidence of his source. A tune dating from 1539 in Germany, and 1560 in English use (EH 462).
- (b) The OLD 113TH, dating from 1536 in the Strasburg book, and 1561 in England (EH 544).
- (c) The OLD LXXXI, which he calls 'Cripplegate Tune', and which is English in origin, dating from 1562 (EH 461).

Those three are all he took from the original Old Version corpus of tunes, but Playford provided him with one or two more: (d) the shortened form of TALLIS'S CANON, and (e) ST. MARY'S TUNE, otherwise known as 'Hackney', which came originally from Pry's Welsh Psalter of 1621 (EH 84). One other of approximately the same date is 'Angel's Hymn Tune', otherwise O'Gibbon's SONG 34 (EH 259). But I don't know where Wesley got his horrid version: not from Playford 1677 where it is C.M. Possibly from Playford's

1671 book where it is in the correct L.M. But I suspect from some much later source.

All the above are well known, and there is no point in asking for them to be played over to us.

Now let us turn to *The Divine Companion*. From this we have five tunes.

I suppose the one which interests Methodists most is that which Wesley called CRUCIFIXION TUNE, and which is said to have been sung by him on the night of his conversion, 24 May, 1738 (EH 340). I was asked the other day if we knew to what words he sang it. If there is no documentary evidence against it, I see no reason why he should not have sung it to the words to which it is set in the *Divine Companion*.

Dear Saviour Oh! What ails this Heart?
Sure, 'tis of stone, it cannot smart;
Nor yet relent the death of thee,
Whose death alone could ransom me;
Can I behold thy pains so great,
Thy dying sighs, thy bloody sweat.

Thy Back with Whips, and Scourges torn,
Thy sacred Temples crown'd with Thorn;
Thy Hands and Feet nail'd to the Wood,
And all thy Body drown'd in Blood;
Canst thou pour forth such streams for me,
And I not drop one Tear for thee?

Evidently the tune was found unfit for general use, for it was dropped after 1742, and the present Methodist book banishes it to the appendix.

The next tune from this source is 'London New', well known I hope to most of us as TUNBRIDGE (EH 88). It maintained its position in S.M., S.H., D.M.M., and Butts, but it had its name changed to 'Brays' by Wesley and to 'New York' by Whitefield; possibly because 'London' was wanted for another tune.

This habit of changing the names of tunes is very annoying, since it means you cannot trust to an index for information of the contents of a book. Both Wesley and Whitefield were constantly doing it, and the habit, though of respectable age — old enough in fact to have died out — is maintained by modern editors who should know better.

'Clark's Tune' is another which has reappeared in modern books with the name UFFINGHAM (EH 434). It also maintained its place in Wesley's books, though he renamed it 'Bradford'. 'Evesham' also kept its place — this was the tune for the Hymn to the Holy Ghost.

Of the fifth tune I am a little uncertain: Wesley called it 'Bristol'. The late Dr. Cairns told me that he thought it was a rather free adaptation of Croft's tune for Psalm cxvi (EATINGTON,

EH 639). It did not retain its place in Wesley's books, and I am not surprised.

One other tune from the *Divine Companion* made its way into *Sacred Melody*, and also into *Butts*. This is the tune we know as DAVID'S HARP (EH 378), but which Wesley called 'Norwich'. As you will be singing it later there is no need to play it now. Wesley set it to 'O God our Forefathers, hear'.

From the *Supplement to the New Version*, 1708, Wesley took three tunes. Two are sufficiently well known: 'ST. MATTHEW' (EH 526), and what we know as HANOVER (EH 466). Wesley called it 'Bromswick' at first, and then 'tallys', though what grounds he had for thinking Tallis composed it I don't know. The third tune is less familiar, 'St. Luke'. It maintained its position in the Wesleyan canon, but modern books disregard it.

Of the same date is the well known Easter tune from *Lyra Davidica* (EH 133). It suffered various indignities as time went on, but Wesley at first kept fairly close to the original, only going really gay when he came to the final *alleluia*.

I sometimes wonder at what pace the composer expected his tune to be sung. It was originally printed in quavers and semi-quavers — nowadays we are given it in minims and crotchets.

Chetham provided two tunes, both in the first edition of 1718: 'Fetter Lane' later known as WIRKSWORTH and AYLESBURY (AMR 236), and 'St. John's tune', better known as BURFORD (EH 447). Timbrell's *Divine Music Scholar's Guide* gave Wesley one tune to start with, namely BEDFORD (EH 447). Later when he was producing *Sacred Melody* two more were extraced: Campian's BABYLON'S STREAMS (EH 487), and 'Never weather beaten sail' (SP 587), which Timbrell had included in his collection. It is possible that Wesley took them from Butts, in spite of his poor opinion of that book. Only the first of these two tunes is in the present *Methodist Hymn Book*, but both are in *Songs of Praise*. That amazingly prolific tune and book maker (not the turf variety, though his various collections must have been something of a gamble) Tan'sur provided three tunes for the Foundry collection of 1742, but only one has survived. Wesley called it 'Bexley', but its original name was COLCHESTER (CP 50).

Before we pass on to the next group of tunes we might look at those from similar sources which Wesley adopted later; they are few in number.

The first edition of *Sacred Melody* saw the inclusion of Carey's 23rd psalm (EH 491), Knapp's 'Dorchester' renamed 'Cornish', and Sheeles's LONDON (EH 297) set to Addison's proper words. The 2nd edition added Evison's 'Stroud' from his edition of 1751, with a new name, 'Manchester'. All remained quite popular during the 18th century.

One other book deserves consideration at this point: The book

issued in Dublin in 1749, which gave us IRISH (EH 504). None of Wesley's choice from the Old Version is there. Instead we have COMMANDMENTS, OLD 100th, and OLD 119th. Nor are Wesley's tunes from the 1708 *Supplement* included: instead we have ST. ANNE. It is, I think, fairly obvious that someone other than Wesley had a hand in editing it, and it has been suggested that Lampe did it when in Ireland.

Now let us turn to the tunes which Wesley extracted from Moravian books. I feel rather incompetent to deal with these, and hope there are some present who will expand and correct my rather amateur notes.

The earliest English Moravian tune book is undated, but Moravian authorities put it c. 1745. Its title page reads:

The / Tunes / for the / Hymns / In the Collection with / several Translations / from the Moravian / Hymn Book. / London / Printed for James Hutton, at the Bible and Sun, in / Little Wildstreet, near Lincolns Inn-Fields. /

There are 49 tunes, with no indication of sources or composers. Also they are unnamed. Of these Wesley has 9 in his book of 1742. So if the dating of Hutton's book is correct Wesley must have got them from MS sources, or possibly direct from continental collections. But as Grimm produced his collection in 1755, and Gregor edited the first complete tune book for the revived Moravians in 1784 it is evident that Wesley must have found what he wanted elsewhere — probably in Freylinghausen, whose vast collection first saw light in 1704. I believe Wesley's copy still exists somewhere.

Of the 49 tunes in Hutton's book two, The OLD 148th (SP 197i) and AYLESBURY, are English, and the sources of ten have not yet been discovered. Of these ten Wesley has one which he called 'Leipsick' It appears twice in the Foundry book: once in an un-singable form, and again with the pitch lowered, and most errors corrected. It remained in the Wesley canon, but with an altered name: 'Brockmer's in S.M. It is also in the modern Moravian book as CHRIST THE GOOD SHEPHERD (*Moravian Liturgy and Hymns*, 466).

The present Methodist book, however, retains seven of the Moravian tunes which Wesley used in 1742, five of which were also in Hutton. Three of them, by the way, also come in the new Yale *Hymnal for Colleges and Schools*. One of these three, AMSTERDAM (MHB 17), is generally assumed to make its first appearance in print in 1742 — both Lightwood and the Yale book agree on this point. But as a matter of fact it comes from a collection by Hille, which was published in 1739 (*Zahn* 7341a), which gives the melody and bass.

Another tune from this group, which is not in the Methodist book, but is in the Moravian book and also the Yale one is that

called 'Hemdyke' in 1742. It goes back to 1666. It suffered from having its name altered twice: HAVANT and TRINITY HYMN are its aliases.

Possibly one of Wesley's most disastrous efforts at adaptation was the tune he called JERA. It was not due to his version that it had a triumphant progress through the 18th century as ST. GEORGES (MHB 587). I think it was more likely Jacobi and his *Psalmodia Germanica* that contributed to its popularity. Listen to Wesley's version of the melody from 1554. It is in the Methodist H.B. at NICOLAUS, 587.

I don't think I need say more about this group of tunes, but before I pass on there is one tune in the Foundry collection which should be mentioned if only because it is a warning of what was to follow. I mean JERICHO, taken from Handel's 'Richard P. I know E.H. has included it in the 1933 edition (381 ii), and that it is still in the Methodist book (819), but I feel it was an ill day when Wesley started on lifting secular tunes.

I don't think I need say much about the next book: Lampe's *Hymns on the Great Festivals*, 1746. Of the 24 tunes Whitefield included three in *The Divine Musical Miscellany*, in 1754, Wesley has 15 in S.M., and Butts took 23 into his *Harmonia Sacra*. Evidently they proved popular, though the present Methodist book has two only. One of these, now called KENT (EH 347) has found its way into most books.

The next book, *The Divine Musical Miscellany*, just mentioned, raises a problem of which I don't know the answer. What tune books (if any) were the Methodists using between 1742 and 1761 when Wesley produced S.M.? We know that Butts produced his *Harmonia Sacra* some time before 1761, but I think it is impossible to date any surviving edition earlier than 1759. We find tunes in Whitefield's book included later in S.M. Some of them must have been in use before. Let me give a definite illustration: In S.M. Wesley sets 'Love Divine, all loves excelling' to Purcell's *Fairest Isle, all Isles excelling*,¹ and I find it difficult to believe that the words were not written for the tune: the parody of the verse is so obvious. And yet seven years earlier we find the tune set to words of a different metre, and with a different name. Whitefield set it to 'Loving Saviour, Prince of Peace' (eight 7's), and calls it DUBLIN TUNE. Wesley calls it WESTMINSTER.

Another tune suggests a similar uncertainty. Now called OLD 23RD (MHB 361), it goes back to Roner in 1721. I find it first as a hymn tune in Thomas Moore's collection of 1750, with the name KNUTSFORD. Why he chose that name I know not; at the time he was in Glasgow, but when he published his *Pocket Companion* in 1756 a bookseller in Knutsford was named on the title page. Whitefield renamed it KINGSWOOD, and Butts changed it again to OLD 23RD. Wesley went back to Whitefield's name.

¹ Methodist School Hymn Book 253.

There are two other tunes to notice in this book: both adaptations. HUNTINGTON TUNE is Arne's "Waters parted from the sea". It duly found its place in the canon under the name of COOKHAM, and appears in Butts, S.M. and S.H. HAVERFORD WEST is a bolder choice being Purcell's duet for Cupid and Bacchus, 'Come, let us agree'. It is also in Butts as TAMWORTH, and in T. Williams's *Psalmodia Evangelica* as BILSON. Wesley was certainly not responsible for this as the words are always Whitefield's 'O come let us join in Musick Divine'. There is yet another tune worth noting because for a long time it seemed as if Whitefield's book was its earliest appearance. It also comes in Butts, Aaron Williams, T. Williams, S.M., S.H., and Boyd. It was called BOSTON, and comes from a book called *The Second Book of the Divine Companion*, and is by Mr. William Marckam, set to Ps. cxix, verse 9, in Four Time. This was changed to 3/2 in the Methodist books. The date of the book is uncertain, but cannot be later than 1738, and may be 1725.

I won't keep you long over the next book: Butts's *Harmonia Sacra*, as I said all I have to say about it some years ago in the *Bulletin*. The main point here is the spate of adaptations: rather like the *English Hymnal* and its folk songs. I was told, by the way, that one of them (E.H. 389) cannot be used in the West of England because it is known to a song 'Old Tarry breeches'. There is a charming French Carol, called *Fragrance* in a recent hymn book, (S.P. 627) which I cannot hear without recalling a rollicking drinking song in *The Beggar's Opera*, 'Fill every glass'. Whether Butts's adaptations had a similar effect on their hearers one cannot tell. William Riley pilloried some in 1762, and if he had seen the second edition he could have enlarged his list considerably: Nine more from Handel; two Songs by Lampe, two more from Arne, and a production by Dr. Worgan to words by Moore. Butts disguised its nature by christening it BERKSHIRE, Wesley renamed it TOMB-STONES, which was far more in keeping with the original words, though he used it for 'When I survey the wondrous Cross'. It reappears to its proper words under the name LUCY in *The British Orpheus*, about 1810, among the Love Songs. ABINGTON, otherwise MACCABEES, is here (it was in the first edition): See the Conquering Hero comes, set to Easter words. I never expected to see it in a modern hymn book, but it is in *Christian Praise*, set to modern words¹. Anyhow we may be thankful that T. Williams's adaptation to the Dead March in Saul of Watts's words 'Unveil thy bosom, faithful Tomb' has not survived.

I am afraid I don't know what are regarded as typically Methodist tunes, and so have probably failed to refer to the right ones! Mr. Farnsworth most kindly supplied me with a complete list of the hymns in the 1791 edition of the Methodist book, with

¹ It is set to the same words in M.H.B. (1933), no. 213. The English words were first sung in 1928, the French original, to this tune, in 1904. (Lightwood) (E.D.)

the recommended tunes — my copies have words only and no recommended tunes. What stands out from that list is that *Sacred Harmony* is the only source drawn upon.

Two tunes perhaps deserve a note.

TRUMPET first appeared in the later edition of Butts. Here we have a song of H. Carey, best known for his setting of Addison's Psalm xxiii. 'He comes, he comes, the hero comes'. It was written to celebrate the taking of Portobello in 1739. Wesley's words, 'He comes, he comes, the Judge Severe' were published in 1758. When he inserted the tune in *Sacred Harmony*, he changed to the name to JUDGEMENT. It is in the modern hymn book.

The other is known as, CHIMES, or WITTON'S. It first appears in T. Moore's *Psalm Singer's Pocket Companion*, 1756, set to Watts's Psalm 100, and called King David's Delight. The attribution to King James in Butts is due to the fact that he sets it to the version in King James's Psalms.

THE NEW HYMN BOOK OF THE INTER-VARSITY FELLOWSHIP

Christian Praise, published September 1957
by the Tyndale Press, full music edition, 15s.

The work of the Inter-Varsity Fellowship, diversified through the Universities in the Christian Unions, is growing in power and influence at the present time, and the publication of this new hymn book is an indication of the confidence which prevails within that organization. This is not the place to comment on that Christian work, although no reader can be unaware of the sorry schism which prevails in all universities between the I.V.F. and that other, and younger, interdenominational Christian body, the S.C.M.

I feel bound to say, however, that my own earlier experience of the singing habits of the Christian Union in my own university led me to fear that when the new I.V.F. hymn book appeared it might well turn out to be a reactionary book. I well recall being introduced to 'In the secret of His presence' (Sankey's 1200, no. 1186) at my first O.I.C.C.U. meeting twenty years ago, and I know that visiting preachers at services held by this organization in this city have been heard to insist on the tune ARIZONA for 'We sing the praise of Him who died'. Some of us, then, feared the worst; but the appearance of *Christian Praise* has put us in a position precisely like that of those who were afraid that the new Woolworth's in Oxford's main street would be an architectural horror. Just as our new Woolworth's has turned out to be the best building erected in the Cornmarket for the past 200 years, so *Christian*

Praise has made the jeremiahs look foolish: for it is, let us say at once, a fine book.

Its limitations are strictly defined in its own Preface. It is not designed to be a church book, and few of us would want it as a church book. It contains 401 hymns (402 for some curious reason in the advertising brochure: which one was dropped at the last moment?), and these are arranged in an order and chosen on principles suitable to religious meetings rather than to public worship. It would go down excellently at a conference centre; and it would make an admirable supplement to an existing church book. But in its own right it is not a church book. Therefore it is beside the point to complain that it is liturgically unhelpful, that it takes little account of the seasons of the church's year, and that it contains nothing for baptisms, nothing for special seasons or rites, and no plainsong.

Considered as a supplement, it will, of course, be more educative to Anglicans than to Free Churchmen. What it contains is very largely familiar to Free Churchmen, especially to Methodists, and indeed I take it that the book would be otiose alongside the Methodist Hymn Book. But where your normal diet is English Hymnal or Hymns A & M, you would find much enrichment of public praise through the judicious use of this volume. It ought to be said, I think, that if any incumbent is moved to substitute this for his church book, he will be both going against the designs of editors and seriously impoverishing the worship of his congregation: for there are different kinds of hymn-singing, and the kind represented in *Christian Praise* is only one of those.

Although (as I believe) the editors are wholly or at least mainly Anglicans, the book has a strong Dissenting ethos. This is perhaps best exemplified in simply stating that there are 23 hymns of Isaac Watts, 36 of Charles Wesley, and only one of Robert Bridges ('Ah, holy Jesus'). The near-exclusion of Bridges (for only three of the five verses of that hymn appear) is, to my own mind, one of the very positive blemishes in the book. But a further glance at the authors' index confirms the impression that it is the Calvinist and Evangelical schools of the 18th century that appeal to the editors. John Newton, for example, has eight hymns, Cowper eight, Joseph Hart three, Thomas Kelly four, Toplady three: Neale, on the other hand, is down to seven (compare that with *A. & M.*!), Mrs. Alexander to three and Keble to two and a half (two of which we could well spare, the half being his two verses of 'Blest are the pure in heart'). Doddridge is shabbily treated — only four. (It really is time some editor recognised that in Doddridge there is still a good deal of undiscovered treasure). But on the other hand among the Newton hymns is one (110), beginning 'Let us sing and love and wonder' which makes its first appearance in a modern hymn book, and which may well be greeted with joy.

The hymns are arranged in sections that suggest, in their broadly credal arrangement, a dissenting hymn book. Among these sections those on strictly theological subjects are, of course, the strongest. In the Communion section the emphasis is entirely on the intimacy of the Family Meal, and not at all on the adoring and eucharistic act carried out in the presence of the angels and archangels: there is no 'Deck thyself, my soul, with gladness' nor 'Let all mortal flesh keep silence', nor (which is at first surprising, in view of the editors' love for Wesley), 'Victim divine'. The scale is always small and domestic, and this will certainly be regarded in many quarters as a serious impoverishment.

The other section which shows some weakness is that headed 'Service' (302-313). But the clue perhaps is in a tendency to equate Christian service with preaching the Gospel — a view, again, which is debatable, but on which no place is found for 'O God of earth and altar', or Timothy Rees's 'God of love and truth and beauty',

There are a few new hymns, apart from those which will be new to singers who are not familiar with *Golden Bells*. These, a modest collection, are chiefly of the aspirational kind. Five are by Frank Houghton, and one is by E. Margaret Clarkson. All show competence, but none, I think, distinction. The most dogmatic of these is Miss Clarkson's 'We come, O Christ, to thee' (108), a new hymn on the text 'I am the Way, the Truth, and the Life', in '148th' metre. It would have been vastly better had it begun with a statement of which the subject was Christ and not ourselves, and had it not contained the lines, 'To thee our youth and strength we bring' in the last verse, which immediately limits the usefulness of the hymn and places a slightly unwelcome stress on the muscular and energetic aspects of evangelism which some believe to be a property, but others hold to be only an accident, of the living church.

Frank Houghton has a greater lyrical gift, and his carol (89 and 390), 'Thou who wast rich beyond all splendour', has real literary charm. It is set to that Beggar's Opera tune (S.P. 627) which in its own right is delightful, and will give hesitation only to the very literate in music. At other points he shows the preaching rather than the lyrical style, as in the very characteristic preacher's phrase in

Facing a task unfinished
That drives us to our knees. (182)

The didactic style is never far from the newer hymns in this book: it was, of course, part of Charles Wesley's stock in trade; and even more of Newton's. Possibly the number of hymns in the book which consist of instructions from the congregation to the congregation, like 'Send forth the Gospel!' (167) and the more familiar 'Go, labour on!' (313) may tend to leave the singer feeling as much exhausted as exalted if too free use is made of them. Indeed, there

is in the whole ethos of the book a tendency away from the reflective towards the hortatory which, again, is proper to its 'supplemental' character but deprives it of that balance which would be needed in a church book. The book is very clearly not a complete manual of Faith, but a supplement song-book for evangelists.

A word, perhaps, ought to be said about the selections from Charles Wesley and Isaac Watts. Of the 36 Wesleys here, all, I think, are Wesleys that anybody will be the better for learning. I observe with gratitude, 'And can it be', and I think most will approve the alteration, derived from *Hymns A. & M.* (I think) of the final couplet of 'A charge to keep I have'. On the other hand, it was deplorable to omit both 'Let earth and heaven combine', and 'Eternal beam of life divine', the first of which is so eloquent a comment on the Incarnation, the second so moving an exposition of 'the power of His Resurrection'. On the other hand, the Wesley hymns of personal devotion are excellently represented, and we especially welcome 'Father, Son and Holy Ghost' (316) and 'Open, Lord, my inward ear' (319). Of Watts, I myself would gladly have given the rather wooden paraphrase of Psalm 103, 'O bless the Lord, my soul' (5) for 'No more, my God, I boast no more', but there is strong meat in 'Not all the blood of beasts' (60) and 'Alas, and did my Saviour bleed' (58: set to WALSALL).

The editors have resolutely set their faces against the indulgence of the old-fashioned 'chorus' — and perfectly rightly. One hymn alone seems to come perilously near that style, 'Give me a sight, O Saviour' (61); and opposite it stands 'Man of sorrows' (62), with its embarrassing final line 'Hallelujah! what a Saviour' and its rather dreadful tune. But these are exceptions to a most commendable rule of self-denial. On the other hand, for choruses the editors have substituted a most interesting group of carols (381-399). 'The Infant King' (385) alone will sell the book to many people. Here we observe only that the extension of this carol section to seasons other than Christmas would have been an enrichment. But what a wealth we have here — 'O leave your sheep,' Terry's 'I saw a fair maiden', Caird's 'Shepherds came their praises bringing' and a Bach setting of 'Beside the cradle' among them.

Now to the music. It is here, I think, that the book makes its boldest gestures. It cannot escape the careful reader that the chief influence on this book among recent publications has been *Congregational Praise*. The most interesting importations from that book are Peggy Spencer-Palmer's ELLASGARTH to 'None other Lamb' (106), with her descant, and Brent Smith's COTSWOLD, set to 'My hope is built on nothing less' (236). (How my housemaster would have snorted at being indexed as 'A. B. Smith'!). Other tunes from that book include ABINGDON (235) and WYCH CROSS (243), the latter set to Wesley's 'Thee will I love'. Dr. Eric Thiman is represented by BEEDING to 'Christian, seek not yet repose', one

of his very best contribution to *C.P.*, by SHERE (*B.B.C.* 26), which was not in *C.P.* and by his arrangement of STELLA (114).

Members of this Society will especially rejoice to see no fewer than eight tunes by Mr. Kenneth Finlay. Only one of these, AYRSIRE (here set to Father Andrew's 'O dearest Lord, thy sacred head', 320) is in *C.P.* The rest are new, and most of them are very exciting. Attend especially to his tune CARRICK for 'Open, Lord, my inward ear' 319.

Other new or not very familiar tunes include a decorous contribution by C. J. Allen (whom many of us know best as an authority on railways, but who has two tunes in *Golden Bells* and has composed several beyond those) — no. 331, EWHURST, to 'I am not skilled to understand'. Barham-Gould's serviceable setting of a rather charming hymn from *Golden Bells*, 'May the mind of Christ my Saviour', appears at 348 under the name ST. LEONARDS.

We are pleased to see two appearances of Dr. Stanton's splendid tune CANNOCK, which he wrote for 'Fight the good fight', but which appears here at 167 and 284, both of which are (relatively) new hymns. Cyril Taylor's ABBOT'S LEIGH is also there twice — to 'Glorious things', and to 'Love divine, all loves excelling'. Its appropriateness at the latter place is doubtful, perhaps: but then that is a hymn on which we all have our own private ideas, and to which no tune has yet established itself as inevitable. The second tune to the same hymn (335), by J. Eric Hunt, is an excellent four-liner to which is added an atrociously florid and exhibitionistic unison setting for the last verse: the book would have been better without that, but the tune is good. Sir William Harris's ALBERTA is there, and also SENNEN COVE (84), from *A.M.R.* — a splendid setting of 'How bright those glorious spirits shine' (what an excellent composer of hymn tunes he is!). Sir Percy Buck is represented by DULCIS MEMORIA and GONFALON ROYAL (here set to 'He wants not friends', 148). Henry Ley's tune goes in with 'Fight the good fight' (293), and Miss Spencer-Palmer adds to ELLASGARTH three other tunes, all of which are of high musical interest; of these WOKING strike us as a shade tough and athletic (but then it goes to a hymn of which we should say the same — 184), but we especially welcome KEYNSHAM (300) to Newton's lovely hymn, 'Why should I feel the tempter's power'.¹

But the test of good editing is not so much in new discoveries — still less in editorial insertions, of which there are hardly any, and those discreet, in this book — but rather in the selection from what is already available. In this the musical editors really shine. One may note, for example, their use of Amps's splendid S.M. tune, VENICE (178), hitherto neglected by all but *A.M.* and *C.P.*, but surely one of the finest of all tunes in this metre; and in their search

¹ On what grounds is the descant to 'While shepherds watched' (37) ascribed to Brian S. Howard? Three lines of it are by Alan Gray, and have been sung these many years at King's College on Christmas Eve.

for good tunes in six eights they knew better than to overlook Arthur Warrell's really magnificent tune FARMBOROUGH, which is used both for 'Now have I found the ground' (237) and for 'Come let us with our Lord arise' (368).

Bolder than this, however, is the revival of F. G. Baker's ST. SAVIOUR (to 'Give me the wings of faith, 142), decently reharmonised: I have always thought this an unjustly neglected C.M. — but its original harmony was wonderfully unprepossessing.

Of the older composers, Orlando Gibbons is well represented (though they have unhappily perpetuated the wrong version of ANGELS' SONG, EAT; but Lawes appears only in FARLEY CASTLE (289) and a chant to the Te Deum (if that chant indeed has anything to do with Lawes). Nobody loves Lawes. It is such a pity! There are a few choice Welsh tunes, of which the finest is surely TREWEN for 'A sovereign Protector' (238).

There is much more one could say; but this ought to indicate that the book has been edited by people who know their way about. One wants to ask, of course, what on earth tunes like RIMINGTON (28) and GIDEON (53) are doing in a hymn book aimed obviously primarily at younger people. Could not something better than Morley's melancholy tune have been found for 'Eternal Light'? Or than Stebbins's SUNSET (365) for 'Saviour, breathe an evening blessing'? (Indeed, were those words really necessary?). But there are always things of that kind to say about any hymn book. The real point is that it is hard to find any section of, say, eight pages that does not show some evidence of editorial enthusiasm and inspiration. Was it not an entertaining idea to set 'Sweet is the work' to SOLOTHURN (372)? 'Awake, our souls' (291) to DEUS TUORUM MILITUM? 'Guide me, O thou great Jehovah' to ST. HELEN (283)? Such inspirations as this compensate for our shock at seeing the carol THIS ENDREYS NYGHT paired off with 'Approach, my soul, the mercy-seat'.

Here and there the editors have preferred a corrupt text; the worst example is in 'O happy day' (227), where they have not restored Doddridge's beautiful lines

With ashes who would grudge to part
When called on angel's food to feast.

That was naughty. It was perhaps a pity also that 'Come, thou fount of every blessing' was reduced to sixteen lines (252); in its original form, or nearer the original (as at *C.P.* 442), it contains some of the finest poetry of vintage Calvinism.

But these are minute points. We conclude with one major grouse, and one major commendation. To begin with the grouse, the Scriptural index is badly compiled and misconceived in intention. A scriptural index is a splendid thing to have, but it ought to be more comprehensive than this, and more accurately put together. Every hymn has a text written over it, with the

reference in Scripture. This would be well, but the texts are (presumably) placed there by editorial choice: they are certainly not always the texts that the authors had in mind. Where this is discoverable it should, surely, be the ruling factor. For example, in the hymn of Doddridge just mentioned, 'O happy day' the author's text was 'They first gave themselves unto the Lord' (II Cor. 8.5).¹ The text superscribed in the hymn book is Luke 5.28. A more appalling instance is Wesley's 'O Thou who camest' (341), whose leading text is 'The fire shall ever be burning on the altar' (Lev. 6.11); but the editors have written Luke 3.16. Thus arbitrarily superscribing texts, they then compiled the scriptural index from these texts. Not only have they misinterpreted the authors' intentions in many places, but they have lost the opportunity of making references to texts which, in addition to the leading texts, are to be found expounded in the hymns. For example, 'A sovereign Protector' contains important references to Isa. 60 and Ps. 84 which could have appeared in this index with greater profit than I Peter 5.7. A great opportunity was here lost, and the work ought to be done again for the next edition. (The absence of a reference to Gen. 32 in the index prompts us to remark with sorrow on the absence of both 'Shepherd divine' and 'Come, O thou Traveller' from the Wesley selection). I think it is permissible to be emphatic about this in view of the regularity with which those of us who are outside the I.V.F. fold are told by those within it that we know nothing about the Bible.

But right at the other end of the scale we must applaud the rest of the indexing work in this book, and especially the metrical index of tunes, which prints not only the name of the tune but also a facsimile of its first phrase in music type. This is the kind of thing that makes great editing; it shows that editors of the music want their book to be used easily and intelligently. This is a notion which no editor of any future book should ignore.

In sum, then, this is a most honourable and well produced book. The editors have set themselves a special task, and have performed it with distinction. For the third time we say, with all possible emphasis, that it is not a complete or compendious book, and could never replace any existing book of public praise of the liturgical sort. But it should sweep away *Golden Bells* into the limbo which that book has earned itself (limbo, remember, is the place, says St. Thomas, of *mitissima poena*), and, carefully used, should be a powerful force for the broadening and deepening of piety.