

# THE HYMN SOCIETY

OF GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND

## BULLETIN

VOLUME TWO

---

NUMBER TWELVE

OCTOBER, 1950

*Editor:* REV. ERIK R. ROUTLEY, M.A., B.D.  
17 Norham Road, Oxford.

*Hon. Treasurer:* W. LESLIE CHRISTIE, Esq., W.S., 31 Queen Street,  
Edinburgh 2.

*Hon. Secretary:* REV. F. B. MERRYWEATHER, Oxhill Rectory, Warwick.

---

### CONTENTS

The Tercentenary of the Scottish Psalter (contributed)	-	177
The Public School Hymn Tune by Leonard Blake	- - - - -	180
The Cambridge Conference, 1950	- - - - -	185
Reviews :		
<i>Hymnal for Scotland</i>	- - - - -	187
<i>Hymns in Christian Worship</i> (Jefferson)	- - - - -	189
" <i>Nostra Maxima Culpa</i> "	- - - - -	192

---

### THE TERCENTENARY OF THE SCOTTISH PSALTER.

CELEBRATIONS IN GREAT BRITAIN AND AMERICA.

(contributed)

#### *In Scotland.*

The celebration of the 300th birthday of the metrical Psalter still in use in Scotland is now at an end. Circumstances suggested that it should be devised in a modest form. There are people to whom the survival of the old Psalter is quite frankly a matter for regret — people with a scanty equipment, or none, of the historic sense and historical knowledge, who therefore are devoid of sentiment bred by remembrance of the past; and others who think the



day for metrical psalmody should end as it has done in England, and give place to chanting the psalms in prose. These classes together represent a minority of the Scottish people. The majority may not be able to whip up much enthusiasm about so familiar a phase of their national tradition; but they retain a settled reverence for what has played a vital part in their country's worship, and love to maintain the best of the metrical psalms in the Church's use.

At the same time there was no call for celebrating the Tercentenary on any ambitious scale. The Psalter is in universal use in the Presbyterian churches. One of the unhappily still disunited sections which did not enter the great union of 1929 proclaimed that *it* had no need for any commemoration; its people commemorate it every Sunday by still using nothing but the 1650 Psalter as its manual of praise. But the vast majority of Scottish Church people, though long since won over to the Christianising of their praise by a generous use of expressly Christian hymns, still regard their worship as incomplete if there is not in it at least one metrical psalm to link it with its past. It was therefore felt that the best method of commemoration must be congregational, in the ordinary worship of the "gathered church" as near as possible to the commemoration date.

Sunday, April 30th was therefore fixed as the day for a united act of remembrance, thanksgiving, and worship. Ministers were given timely notice of what was intended, and the General Assembly's Committee of Public Worship and Aids to Devotion prepared and issued two services for the day — the first envisaging the story of the evolution of the Psalter itself, a subject on which there was a generally admitted need for enlightenment, and the second giving an account of the various types of musical usage employed throughout the three centuries.

For the first purpose Dr. Millar Patrick's *Four Centuries of Scottish Psalmody* was the mainstay of ministers in the preparation of their addresses. For the second a list of tunes was carefully selected to illustrate the vicissitudes of psalmodic musical history, from the beginning to the present day. Full notes were furnished — so full indeed that not uncommonly ministers simply used the notes as an address illustrated by the tune from stage to stage. Probably the most interesting illustration was *THE OLD COMMON TUNE*,<sup>1</sup> written when it was recognised that many congregations would not be able to sing at all, and to give beginners help in learning how to use their voices in the common praise. The melody alone was sung, without harmony or accompaniment. The effect would have been enhanced if it had been possible to reproduce the quavering uncertain vocalisation with which at first it was sung; but even as it was, the impression produced by it was by many felt to be profound.

<sup>1</sup> This tune is printed on page 67 of Dr. Millar Patrick's book. (Editor).

The entire selections of praise for the day were taken from the Psalms. The purely Scottish tunes were of course given the pre-eminence, but due recognition was made of the changes of style produced by influences prevailing south of the Border, and of the many tunes derived from the same sources.

Where choirs were small, combinations of them were formed to give the illustrations effectively at some central spot in their district. The cumulative effect was good, and abundant evidence was given that, strong as is the hold which hymnody has taken upon Scottish worship, the historical value of the old Psalms is now better understood, and, among the older people especially, affection remains unabated for this distinctive part of the national way of offering its sacrifice of praise.

#### *In England.*<sup>1</sup>

The celebrations in England were, for obvious reasons, not conducted on a national scale. But it is worth recording that the B.B.C. broadcast a Service of Praise on Sunday, May 7th, consisting entirely of Scottish Psalms with commentary, in the Home Service, and that the "Sunday Half-Hour" period on April 30th was given to singing of Psalms from the Glasgow studios (broadcast in the Light Programme). A lecture on the subject was broadcast on the Third Programme during the intervening week.

#### *In America.*

The Hymn Society of America, under the enthusiastic leadership of Mr. George Litch Knight, made elaborate arrangements for participation in this commemoration. It did so on a scale and with a wealth of detail with which Scotland itself could not compete.

In New York there were three celebrations — on 29th January in Fort George Presbyterian Church, on 23rd April in the great Riverside Church, and on 26th April in Union Theological Seminary. At the first the preacher was the distinguished President Emeritus of Union Seminary, Dr. Henry Sloane Coffin, who delivered a most fitting and memorable sermon: at the second, Dr. R. J. McCracken, the Scottish minister of the church, who gave what one who heard it described as "one of the finest short addresses I have ever heard". At the third there was no address, but only praise, prayer, and Scripture lessons; the one blemish here in an otherwise well-ordered service was the singing of the 23rd Psalm version which is in the 1650 Psalter to the lamentable *BROTHER JAMES'S AIR*, which, especially in this connexion, Scotsmen regard with something sterner than disapproval.

At the Fort George service the "Scottish clans" of New York formed part of a large attendance. In Riverside Church, 1,500 people attended, and in the massed choirs and church groups there

<sup>1</sup> This paragraph is an editorial interpolation.



were nearly 750, including in the second balcony 220 children, who acted as the antiphonal chorus. In this case the chief complaint was, "Why were there no bagpipes?" — these unaccustomed instruments having been assigned a part in the proceedings at Fort George.

The commemoration in the United States is not yet at an end. "America has caught the imagination of the Anniversary", says one correspondent, "and we shall have a rush of services in the Fall on Reformation Sunday. You have no idea what a magnificent response has come from our people to this celebration. It has been heart-warming to us."

### THE PUBLIC SCHOOL HYMN-TUNE.

By LEONARD BLAKE.<sup>1</sup>

The school chapel and its services occupy a central place in the life of any of our great public boarding-schools. That can be asserted without entering into any discussion of "public-school religion". It has been quite natural, therefore, to find the great musical advances which the public schools have made in the last half-century or so springing from the opportunities which the chapel services provide. Until the days of Edward Thring at Uppingham there was little employment for a musician in a public school beyond playing the chapel organ. The wide range of activities which now make it appropriate to call the man in charge of them a Director of Music (dignifying him beyond the heads of all other departments) has been developed from the chapel outwards. Directors of Music are still primarily organists and choir-masters, as the ease with which many of them are able to move between school and church posts shows: and a man going to a school where music is in a backward condition still finds that to put the chapel choir and congregational singing on its feet is his surest way of winning confidence and providing himself with a foundation on which other musical activities can be based.

In a public school, if anywhere, one may expect to find a discriminating choice of hymns and their tunes, and congregational singing at its best. Tradition, in the shape of Old Boys and veteran masters, may demand a few things that make the progressive Director squirm; but in general it is vigorous youth which has to be catered for, ready to lift its voice in chorus, instinctively responsive to fine words and a fine tune, and — rightly handled — refreshingly free from prejudices. There is no shrewder critic of weak or false sentiment in hymn-verses than the adolescent boy, and no-one readier to see the funny side of the most innocent-looking lines. Dr. Stanton, reviewing the newly revised edition of *The Public*

<sup>1</sup> Our contributor is Director of Music at Malvern College (Editor).

*School Hymn Book* in the April issue of *English Church Music*, instanced a number of lines which few boys could be expected to utter seriously. As with words, so with music. Boys quickly know when they are "on to a good thing", and there is little excuse for lack of courage or adventure in the choice of new hymns.

The congregational practice — in most schools now a part of the weekly routine, like the full choir practice — enables a wide repertoire of hymns to be kept in constant repair, and new tunes to be learnt, to say nothing of the chances of adding descants by the choir, arranging for "choir only" or "congregation only" verses, and so on. Since the whole school attends and the event is regular, the Director of Music can pursue a consistent policy in his revival of "old" tunes and introduction of new ones. There is competent organ or piano accompaniment — so vital to the success of a congregational practice — by himself or an assistant. There is normally a strong and enthusiastic choir, centrally seated, to lead the singing or to "pattern" when necessary: and since everybody has copies of the hymn book with tunes, and many boys, apart from those in the choir, sing in the school choral society or learn a musical instrument, or do both, the task of teaching tunes is greatly eased. The entire school can, in fact, be treated as a choral society, and most public school congregations are now able to make well-disciplined and effective contributions to service settings (like Stanford in B flat and Walmisley in D minor), as well as singing their daily hymns and psalms.

Many public schools have for long had their own collections of hymns, or their own "local" supplements to standard hymnals. The immense care and labour which have been expended on the original compilation and subsequent revisions of these books afford striking evidence of the hold which school chapel services have had upon successive generations of masters and boys. A copy of his school hymn book is as cherished a possession of many an Old Boy as his 1st XI cap, however infrequent his churchgoing may latterly have become. The first school to make a hymn book of its own was Rugby, which published in 1824<sup>1</sup> *The Psalms, Anthems and Hymns used in the Chapel of Rugby School*, though this contained only four hymns proper — "Jesus Christ is risen today", "Come, Holy Ghost, our souls inspire" and Ken's morning and evening hymns. Revised and enlarged editions, from which the psalms and anthems soon disappeared, were published in 1843, 1850, 1857, 1876, 1897, 1906 and 1932. Harrow produced its first hymn book in 1855, and within the next few years Marlborough, Cheltenham, Repton, Wellington and Clifton all followed suit.

*The Public School Hymn Book* (first edition 1903) was the fruit of experience gained in many school chapels and through many

<sup>1</sup> Julian (p. 937 i) seems to have been unaware of this date (Editor).



separate collections of hymns. For the second edition (1918) the choice of words and tunes was drastically overhauled in the light of post-Victorian changes in taste, taking particular account of such books as *The English Hymnal*, *The Yattendon Hymnal* and *Songs of Syon*. It included a number of tunes by public-school musicians, some of which have since attained a wider currency, e.g. WOLVERCOTE (RVCH 508) and LADYWELL (RVCH 139), both by W. H. Ferguson, WOODLANDS (SP 299), by W. H. Greatorex, and GONFALON ROYAL (SP 593), by Percy Buck.

The latest edition, published at the end of 1949, though it contains 554 hymns as against the 426 of the 1918 edition, does not go as far as one might expect in increasing the representation of public-school composers. It takes no account, for example, of Sir George Dyson's tunes in the Marlborough and Winchester College hymn books, nor of those by John Wilson in the *Clarendon Hymn Book*.<sup>1</sup> Wilson's RAVENDALE, to "And now, O Father, mindful of the love", and BEMERTON, to "King of glory, King of peace", are very distinguished pieces of work. The omission of R. S. Thatcher's NORTHBROOK, also to be found in *The Clarendon Hymn Book*, is surprising, since it was specially written for Sir Frank Fletcher's words, "O Son of man, our hero strong and tender". (Why set these to Parry's ENGLAND, with its quite different associations, or, alternatively, to LONDONDERRY, which ought never to have got into any hymn book?). On the other hand, the Musical Editor, Dr. C. S. Lang, formerly Director of Music at Christ's Hospital, himself contributes eighteen tunes to the new book, the majority of them showing very strongly the features of what at this stage may not unfairly be called the "public-school hymn-tune".

This category does not include all the tunes written by public-school musicians. The two by John Wilson which were mentioned above are conspicuous modern exceptions. Those of the earlier Directors of Music — men like Eaton Faning of Harrow, and W. S. Bambridge of Marlborough — were mostly in the Victorian tradition, avoiding the extremes of weak sentiment, but seldom achieving distinction. Bambridge's SHAWFIELD (WCHB<sup>2</sup> 72) is one of the best examples. The movement towards a bolder, more adventurous type of tune, for unison singing rather than harmony, and written with the special conditions of the public school chapel in mind, is seen in E. T. Sweeting's WOLVESEY, to "Judge eternal, throned in splendour" (WCHB 167) and ST. CROSS, to "Come, labour on" (*ibid* 134), and in the tunes of Percy Buck, of which GONFALON ROYAL and MARTINS (SP 247) have since become well-known.

The tradition of John Farmer and the Harrow School songs,

<sup>1</sup> Compiled originally for use at Charterhouse, and published by the Oxford University Press in 1936.

<sup>2</sup> *Winchester College Hymn Book*, 1928 edition.

which was inherited in turn by Faning and Buck, may count as one of the earliest influences in the evolution of the public-school hymn-tune. It is worth noting that until very recent years all hymn-singing in the chapel at Harrow was in unison, the tunes being printed in the school hymn book with the melody on a separate stave, and the harmonies properly arranged for organ-playing (e.g. with many sustained notes taking the place of repeated notes in the inner parts). Eleven of Dr. Lang's tunes in the revised *Public School Hymn Book* are for unison singing.

Hubert Parry has been another influence, through his power of writing broad melody fit for massed singing, with warm, strongly moving harmonies. LAUDATE DOMINUM (A. & M.<sup>1</sup> 308), with the independent accompaniment to its final unison verse, might have been expressly written for public school use. The name of REPTON (SP 481) indicates where the now familiar melody from *Judith* was first adapted to "Dear Lord and Father of mankind". No school would now consider its hymnal complete without JERUSALEM, and, as we have seen, the revised *Public School Hymn Book* has laid hands on ENGLAND.

The hymn-tune field has come, indeed, to overlap that of the modern unison song. JERUSALEM and Holst's THAXTED ("I vow to thee, my country") are in the latest edition of *Hymns A. & M.* as well as in *The Public School Hymn Book*. The 1918 edition of the latter already contained Martin Shaw's BATTLE HYMN ("Mine eyes have seen the glory"); now this is joined by Vaughan Williams's setting of "Let us now praise famous men", another Curwen unison song. Arnold's Singing Class Music series includes Dyson's WINTON (WCHB 15 and 115), set to "Abide with me", and I VOW TO THEE, MY COUNTRY (*ibid* 113). This enlargement of the field of traditional hymnody, both in words and music, was greatly quickened by the appearance of *Songs of Praise*, which set out to be not merely "a collection of hymns for use in public worship" but "also of such 'spiritual songs' as are akin to hymns and suitable for certain kinds of services in church, as well as for schools, lecture meetings and other public gatherings". The title *Songs of Praise* was very aptly chosen. We may well ask, How far can the term "hymn book" reasonably be stretched?

Though in a different vein from the big melody for massed singing, Parry's FRESHWATER (260)<sup>2</sup> is more a partsong than a hymn-tune. It makes a strong musical appeal to boys by its "romantic" modulation to F major. This kind of "harmonic crisis", to which youth is very susceptible, characterises a number of tunes which the public schools have either produced themselves or taken firmly into

<sup>1</sup> Standard Edition.

<sup>2</sup> Where a number is not preceded by initials the reference is to the revised *Public School Hymn Book*.



their affections from outside, e.g. Charles Wood's RANGOON (A. & M.<sup>1</sup> 734), Thatcher's NORTHBROOK (CIHB<sup>2</sup> 252) and Hugh Allen's MIDIAN (so mistakenly omitted from Hymns A. & M. Revised, after being included in the Shortened Music Edition). All of these, incidentally, like so many of Dr. Lang's new tunes, exhibit Parry's sequential methods of construction. Unfortunately, striking key-changes and harmonic high-lights can easily be overdone, becoming manneristic in a composer and palling in their effect when repeated for a number of verses. Dr. Lang exploits them in TREBETHERICK (313), ST. MINVER (464), SAN SEBASTIAN (475) and BURRINGTON (500).

The last line of BURRINGTON recalls Basil Harwood's THORNBURY (534), though for once Dr. Lang does not end his melody on the dominant. Whether under the influence of Harwood, of Stanford's ENGELBERG (216), or Walford Davies's TEMPLE (169), he manages to do this in no less than eleven of his new tunes. Such frequent suggestions of defiant strength or tight-lipped aspiration become rather monotonous.

Other tunes of Basil Harwood besides THORNBURY which seem to have had some influence on public-school composers are LUCKINGTON (432) and LOWER MARLWOOD (152), (compare its second phrase with that of Lang's TREBETHERICK). Ferguson's LADYWELL is very reminiscent of Harwood, both in its melody and its rather florid four-part harmonisation.

The public-school hymn-tune is always on the march. It is an affair of the Church Militant. The tramping basses of Holst and Vaughan Williams are recalled in Thomas Wood's SCHOOL HOUSE (192). (In *The Clarendon Hymn Book* the setting of the OLD 124TH to "Turn back, O man", is taken direct from Holst's extended treatment of the tune. Its two introductory bars of descending crotchets are known in one school as "the death-watch beetle"). Lang's ST. KEVERNE (383) and POLRUAN (546) are exceptional in being in triple time, but are none the less militant. They do not move in the gracious, easy-flowing triple of WILTSHIRE or ROCKINGHAM, or, to take modern examples, Vaughan Williams's MAGDA (38) or Nicholson's BOW BRICKHILL.<sup>3</sup> That type is hardly represented at all in the work of public-school composers.

The mention of Vaughan Williams is a reminder that there is no more popular hymn-tune among boys than SINE NOMINE. But how far removed that is from our "public-school hymn-tune" category! It is no disparagement of Directors of Music to say that most of their tunes spring straight from the high-minded academicism of Parry and Stanford, whose pupils in many cases they were. At best they show the strong choral sense, the sober idealism and the sound

<sup>1</sup> Standard Edition.

<sup>2</sup> *The Clarendon Hymn Book*.

<sup>3</sup> *Hymns A. & M.* Shortened Music Edition, No. 200. Revised Edition, 215.

craftsmanship of their musical mentors. Sometimes they strive too self-consciously in a Royal College tradition. But Vaughan Williams was liberated from academicism by English folksong. Sequential repetition, so freely used by Parry, and distinctly overdone by Dr. Lang, for all his ingenuity about it, is conspicuously and refreshingly absent from SINE NOMINE. Folksong, too, freed Vaughan Williams from the ensnarements of classical tonality, and gave him a power of free melodic growth which is not dependent upon skilful modulations.

The "public-school hymn-tune" is curiously remote both from folksong and the older types of hymn-melody, in spite of the influence which *The English Hymnal* and the writings of Robert Bridges had upon the 1918 edition of *The Public School Hymn Book*. That influence is no less strong in the latest edition, where English traditional melodies, the Genevan and Scottish Psalters, the tunes of Orlando Gibbons and the German chorale are very fully represented: and, according to the Preface, the book was carefully revised by Dr. Vaughan Williams himself, a fact which only throws into relief the presence of a type that certainly had very little place in *The English Hymnal*. It will be interesting to see how many of the newest public-school hymn-tunes find their way into general collections as time goes on. Probably not many will until congregational singing in parish churches becomes as robust, intelligent and disciplined as it is in school chapels. But that is another story.

#### CONFERENCE AT CAMBRIDGE,

July 11th — 14th, 1950.

We reflect on our Cambridge Conference with strangely mixed feelings. Our speakers have never served us better, our supporters have never treated us worse.

To dismiss first the less happy aspect of the conference — our attendance was disappointingly small. We were delighted to welcome two members whom we had not had at our conferences before, but we were sorry to see that the attendance, apart from these, was almost confined to members of the Executive Committee. We were even more disappointed at the lamentably poor attendance at the public meetings which had been arranged. For some reason or other our impact on the public at Cambridge fell far short of the success we had at Oxford. It seems that we must develop wider variation of techniques, and must take new steps to make ourselves known to hymn-lovers in the country if we are to have the effect on the study and practice of hymnody which was the dream of our founders. From the point of view of our own profit and enjoyment, nothing could have been happier than our sojourn at Cambridge, but there is nothing to be gained by disguising the uncomfortable resemblance between us, in our gathering there, and the shepherds in Ezekiel who feed themselves and not the flock.



But what a happy time we had! What lavish and spacious hospitality! What courtesy and efficiency in the organisation which Jesus College put at our disposal. Above all, what felicity in making (some of us for the first time) friends with our learned and genial host, Dr. Brittain, biographer of Bernard Manning, and in many other ways a good friend of the Society. We cannot be too grateful to him and his staff for the way in which they made us welcome.

On the first evening we had a lecture from Maurice Frost, — a lecture which, of course, only he could have given. It dealt with the Psalm Tunes of England and Scotland up to the time of the 1650 Scottish Psalter, and was illustrated by the playing of many of the less familiar psalm-tunes on the organ in the College Chapel. We should have been delighted to print this lecture as an occasional paper; but an insuperable difficulty is the necessity of abundant musical illustrations. If it is found possible to reproduce any of it for the benefit of our readers, we shall do so; it was a model of grace and learning and highly appreciated by those who were present.

On the second evening (Wednesday the 12th), Kenneth Finlay presided over community singing of Scottish Psalms and some of Bach's hymn-tunes. Mr. Finlay's notable skill and enthusiasm amply overcame the initial difficulty created by the small attendance. He gave us an excellent evening's singing. We sang the following hymns and psalms:

Psalm 124.	OLD 124TH
Psalm 46 : 1-5.	STROUDWATER
Psalm 103 : 1-5.	COLESHILL
Psalm 122 : 6-9.	ST. PAUL
Psalm 43 : 3-5.	MARTYRS
Psalm 116 : 13-19.	KILMARNOCK
"Thee living Christ" (AMR <sup>1</sup> 422).	LAUS DEO
"Jesus the Conqueror" (MHB 243).	ICH HALTE TREULICH STILL
"The duteous day" (SP 57).	INNSBRUCK
"O God our everlasting Strength"	CAITHNESS

The hymns were not sung in that order, but it will be observed that we celebrated in chief the Scottish Psalter and the music of Bach, paying passing homage to the new *Hymns A. & M.* (with which we hope we may deal more fully on a later occasion), and using in association with the Psalms some older and some newer tunes.

<sup>1</sup> *Hymns Ancient and Modern, Revised 1950.*

The organist on this occasion was Mr. P. J. Hurford, the College organist, and this is the proper place to record our gratitude to him not only for the excellent accompaniments with which he furnished us at the hymn-singing, but also for allowing us to use the organ for the illustrations on the previous evening. Those of us who were present will have learnt with great satisfaction that the following week Mr. Hurford proceeded to the Fellowship of the Royal College of Organists.

On the Thursday evening we were given a lecture on Bach chorales by Boris Ord, M.A., F.R.C.O., B.Mus., the distinguished organist of King's College, who brought with him some of his trained singers to provide illustrations. This was a memorable occasion; the lecture lasted well over an hour, and all who were present wished it had been twice as long. Mr. Ord made clear to us in a new way the place which Bach occupies in the history of hymnody.

Readers who were not present will have gathered from this something of what they missed. We were excellently served by all three of our lecturers.

In our business meetings our chief matter of discussion was *Julian*, and we can only report a series of setbacks from these meetings. We hope, however, to be able to make an announcement very soon which will cheer our members greatly. We asked Mr. E. F. M. Maddox to join us on the Executive, and were highly gratified by his acceptance. We also heard an account of Canon Briggs' sojourn in America, which seems to have been very greatly to the profit of both parties. Our well-beloved Chairman Emeritus omitted, of course, any reference to what the Americans thought of him, but we were lucky enough to hear from other sources what a deep impression he had made on his hearers there. None of us who know him will be surprised to learn that his visit was a means of grace to many congregations and classes in the cities and universities of the United States.

Mr. Merryweather discharged his Secretarial duties with his usual faithfulness, and organised for us an excursion to Ely on the Wednesday afternoon. Once again we record our gratitude to him for organising the Conference and looking after us all.

## REVIEWS.

*Hymnal for Scotland*, Oxford University Press (Cumberlege), full music 10/6, words only 4/6.

This is a reprint of the 1933 *English Hymnal* with sixteen pages of hymns especially for use in Scotland added after the indexes by way of supplement, containing 15 hymns numbered 745-59.



Numbers 745 to 748 are hymns for Celtic saints. Saint Kentigern is treated by Helen Waddell and set to DECREE (SP 484). Saint Columba is given four verses on the "Who is this?" pattern by J. M. C. Hannah, set to EBENEZER (compare 108 and 514 in this book). Saint Ninian gets four verses of "six sevens" by G. T. S. Farquhar with Hubert Foss's CROYDON, and Saint Margaret, with words by Ursula Wood, achieves a brand-new tune by Vaughan Williams himself, which we are prepared to back as a "winner". The hymns are written with competence; "Lord who sentest Ninian forth" and "Praise God for Margaret" show the slight infelicity of introducing a proper name in the first line; we suspect a misprint in No. 745 —

The faith that spoke with thy great angel, Death,  
And knew *this hour*, and went out unafraid,

where we believe the author may have written "*his hour*"; this hymn of Helen Waddell's has some good lines but the rhyme of "home" with "moan" surprises us, coming from that source.

Nos. 749 to 752 are Communion hymns. The first two are marked "at the Offertory"; both are new and fill a notable need. Neither is distinguished in the literary way, but the introduction of Wesley's HEREFORD and the OLD 78TH to the *English Hymnal* is a notable enrichment for which these hymns give occasion. 751, "Lord be Thy Word my rule" is one of Wordsworth's shortest and choicest efforts it will be familiar to users of *A. & M.*, and is marked, very properly, "At the Gradual". It carries another tune new to us, NEW 143RD, whose source is given as *Psalms and Sacred Harmonies, Edinburgh, 1854*. It is of rare beauty. 752 is Edwin Osler's "O God, unseen, yet ever near", surprisingly set to CRIMOND; this tune, obviously required now in any Scottish hymn book, is here entertainingly harmonised by Dr. H. K. Andrews. The harmonies with which this tune is normally disfigured (not, of course, in the *Scottish Psalter*) badly need revision, and Dr. Andrews has provided part-writing more interesting than most of us felt this tune could carry.

Then comes "God of the living", marked "For the Departed" and set rather austere to Charles Wood's RECESSIONAL.

The remaining six hymns are "General Hymns", and five of them are familiar. "Be thou my vision", "Child in the Manger", "Christ is the world's Redeemer", and "O God Thou art the Father" are all set to the tunes associated with them in the *Church Hymnary* (though the arrangements of BUNESSAN and SLANE are those in *Songs of Praise*). To these are added another hymn attributed to St. Columba in an anonymous translation beginning "Alone with none but Thee, my God" and set to O JESU (EH 406), and, at the very end, "Ye servants of God" to PADERBORN as in *Hymns A. & M.*

Of the seven new hymns none are probably of more than local interest; but all three new tunes, OLD 78TH, NEW 143RD, and ST. MARGARET are conspicuous ornaments. It is to be hoped that this Supplement will achieve its purpose of providing a ready sale for the *English Hymnal* among the Scottish Episcopalians, and we are disposed to recommend the retention of Nos. 749 to 759, with their tunes, in future printings of *English Hymnal* for use in the Church of England.

*Hymns in Christian Worship*, by H. A. L. Jefferson, Rockliff, pp. xvi-282. 17/6d.

This well-produced and spaciouly priced book is to one reader at least something of a disappointment. Its title led us to expect not the familiar story of the history of hymnography, but a study of the liturgical use of hymns. This latter study still needs systematic treatment, and a book which told us of the different liturgical traditions within Christendom and of their effect on the use and the writing of hymns, would have filled a real need. We doubt whether, except in details, this book does much that has not already been done by Dr. Patrick in *The Story of the Church's Song* (which costs a penny more than one sixth of the price of the book under review), by Dr. Fleming in *The Highway of Praise* and by Dr. Phillips in *Hymnody Past and Present*. As it happens, neither of the first two of these books appears in the bibliography, and the author explains, in regard to the third, that he seeks to fill some gaps left in the history of nonconformist hymnody by Dr. Phillips. What this amounts to in fact is an extensive and generous treatment of the late Garrett Horder.

There are various points of fact and principle which this book raises, and we feel it our duty to deal with them here because we doubt whether they will be dealt with in any other reviews, and we feel that it is our Society's duty to take such things seriously.

1. *Matters of fact*. We find only a few slips in this direction; how difficult it is to avoid them in a book of this sort we readily appreciate. On page 19 it is stated that "My song is love unknown" appeared first in the *Public School Hymn Book*; we have not traced it further back than 1871, but in that year it was in the *Anglican Hymn Book* (set to Iawe's PSALM 47), and in 1887 Dr. G. S. Barrett included it in the *Congregational Church Hymnal*. On page 56 the author makes a very common error (supported by the misascription in a well-known anthem-setting by Eric Thiman) in ascribing "Christ hath a garden" to Isaac Watts *simpliciter*. It is, in fact, more Robert Bridges than Watts, as a reference to Watt's *Hymns* I, 74 will show. On page 128 the author follows *Songs of Praise Discussed* in rejecting the late date for "Abide with me", and seems to disregard the discussion, concluded by evidence



from Lyte's great-grandson, W. Maxwell Lyte, conducted about this matter in 1947. Perhaps it is not fair to charge this author with the error of ascribing "Jesu, good above all other" to Percy Dearmer *simpliciter* (page 210). We all thought this was the fact until two verses appeared in the 1950 *Hymns A. & M.* ascribed to "J. M. Neale, based on Adam of St. Victor" as follows:

Jesu, *kind* above all other,  
Gentle child of gentle mother,  
In *the* stable born our brother,  
*Whom the angel-hosts adore:*

Jesus, cradled in a manger,  
*Keep us free from sin and danger,*  
*And to all, both friend and stranger,*  
*Give Thy blessing evermore.*<sup>1</sup>

We quote this for the information of our readers as well as of the author. It will be seen that in his first two verses Dearmer borrowed several phrases and the rhyme-scheme. Henceforth we shall, presumably, have to say "Dearmer, based on Neale, based on Adam" — clumsy but unavoidable.

2. *A Matter of principle.* An awkward problem in writing this kind of book, which may not have occurred to those who have not tried to do it, is the question of the text to be quoted in giving examples. Hymns alter bewilderingly from book to book, especially when they claim some antiquity. But when a hymn is quoted as evidence of an author's style or thought, it is surely necessary to quote his text, not an amended text. A very clear case of error here is in the quotation of "The wise may bring their learning" (p. 206), where the author quotes the *S.P.* version of the hymn as evidence of the healthy spirit now prevailing in children's hymnody. It may be recalled that The Revd. Eric Shave in 1946 quoted the line "We bring the little duties" (which is original) as an example of the kind of phrase we now seek to avoid. Other examples of quotation of amended texts without notice of amendment are "Praise to the Lord, the Almighty" (p. 146), and "Art thou weary" (p. 157).

3. *A Matter of Debate.* We feel that this author does not draw a clear enough distinction between the statement of fact and the expression of a view. It is legitimate in a book of this sort to digress here and there and follow up a train of thought suggested by some hymn under review. In an extended passage on "Our God, our help in ages past" (p. 51f) Mr. Jefferson does this, and the burden of the digression is that theology is the enemy of good hymn-writing. "A hymn written deliberately with the intention of conveying a definite theological tenet is likely to be a poor hymn",

<sup>1</sup> We have italicised the words altered by Dearmer.

he writes. He goes on, "the objection to making hymns subordinate to dogmas is that in so doing they cease to express 'the unity of the Spirit in the bond of peace'." That is well enough if you agree that "dogma" is synonymous with "sectarian dispute". But if "dogma" is given its proper definition the statement will not stand up to much scrutiny. It is precisely dogma which binds together the scattered churches — we differ from each other not in creed but in discipline. Mr. Jefferson assumes that theology is not reasonable speech about God, but a fugitive hobby that has got out of hand. This is not a fact but an opinion, and we emphatically disagree with it.

Again, Mr. Jefferson has considerable argument to bring against "Lo, he comes with clouds descending" (p. 80f), which is based on the assumption that the Scriptural imagery of the Second Coming is misleading and that the teaching of the hymn on this subject is false. Is it indeed? May we not require of authors who commit themselves to this kind of theological excursion some awareness of the movement of theological thought in our own day?

By the same token, we believe that Mr. Jefferson misses fire in saying (p. 78) that "Hail, thou once despised Jesus" was excluded from some Anglican books because of its teaching about the Atonement. Its rough versification and crude imagery have stood against it in the estimation of those who have no special associations with its author and tradition, but we doubt whether it has any particular "doctrine of the atonement" which has weighed more heavily than its literary defects.

5. *A Matter of Honour.* We are warned in the advertisement to expect a "brief" treatment of music. We get it, and it is superficial as well as brief. Too much condensation leads Mr. Jefferson to the implication (which the dust-jacket of the book, depicting a cathedral choir, belies) that he does not regard Cathedral singing as a proper form of Christian worship (p. 259). By quoting C. S. Phillips on one side and Bernard Manning on the other he seeks to show that there is no real reason for saying that Vaughan Williams's tune *SINE NOMINE* is good or bad. (Oh most revered and beloved Bernard, why did you lend your authority to that lamentable judgement about Vaughan Williams's "jazz music"?). He assumes that his reader will agree with his commendation of Stainer's *COVENANT* and *The Crucifixion*, and he describes (p. 266) the *sine qua non* of music in Christian worship "passionate sincerity", which we do not understand at all, since we do not find it among the theological or spiritual virtues in Scripture.

#### 6. *Matters of lesser moment.*

(a) Why is *Dulcis Jesu Memoria* more interesting if it is known to be the work of a woman? (p. 166).



(b) Is it not true that *Worship Song* was more notable for its omissions from Congregational sources (Watts and Doddridge especially) than for its omissions from Catholic sources? (p. 193).

(c) Why is there no mention from beginning to end of Scottish psalmody and hymnody?

(d) Was "Art thou weary" a Greek hymn or not? (pp. 154 and 156).

(e) Why does the author assume the non-existence of the efforts made among the nonconformists to produce congregationally edited versions of the Psalter for public worship — a process imitated recently by the B.B.C.? (p. 44).

(f) There are misprints on p. 126 (*Diademta*) and 147 (*Nicholai*). For "eight" on page 158 in connection with the Byzantine Canons, read "nine". There are misindentations in the quotations on pages 53, 159 and 175.

(g) The excellent illustrations ought to be in some sort of chronological order.

(h) Infelicities and inaccuracies in English style are regrettably numerous.

All these things are defects to which the writer of a book of this sort is liable. Mr. Jefferson has chosen an extremely difficult subject and if readers have no book on this subject this one is well worth buying. For those well-read in the subject it cannot be so useful, except in its clear and specious treatment of American hymnody and the work of Garrett Horder in making it available in this country.

#### NOSTRA MAXIMA CULPA.

(a) Page 173 of last issue, line 4. *Lobet* wasn't a misprint; the misprint is "Herrn" for "Herren" in the title of Hymn 382.

(b) Page 170 last line. We withdraw this. It carries a reflection on the Publisher which we had no intention of conveying.

#### WANTED — TO PURCHASE.

Mr. Duncan Coomer, 12 Elgin Road, Bournemouth, wants *Bulletins* Vol. I, Nos. 18, 19, and 20. Can any member oblige?